

# PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT FOR PUBLIC SECTOR OPERATIONS (PCR)



AFRICAN  
DEVELOPMENT  
BANK GROUP

## I BASIC DATA

### A Report data

<b>Report date</b>	Date of report:	JANUARY 2020	
	Mission date (if field mission)	From: N/A	To: N/A

### B Responsible Bank staff

Positions	At approval	At completion
<b>Regional Director</b>	Tonia KANDIERO	Josephine NGURE
<b>Country Manager</b>	Mary MONYAU	Damoni KITABIRE
<b>Sector Director</b>	Abdoulaye COULIBALY	Abdoulaye COULIBALY
<b>Sector Manager</b>	Bernadette KAMGNIA	Mots'elisi LEBESA
<b>Task Manager</b>	Nkoanyane SEBUTSOE	Nkoanyane SEBUTSOE
<b>Alternate Task Manager</b>		
<b>PCR Team Leader</b>		Nkoanyane SEBUTSOE
<b>PCR Team Members</b>		

### C Project data

<b>Project name: SUPPORT TO THE AFRICAN CAPACITY BUILDING FOUNDATION FOR STRATEGIC MEDIUM-TERM PLAN (SMTP) III Phase II</b>		
<b>Project code: P-Z1-KF0-049</b>	<b>Instrument number(s): ADF Grant 2100155033567</b>	
<b>Project type: INSTITUTIONAL SUPPORT</b>	<b>Sector: GOVERNANCE</b>	
<b>Country: MULTINATIONAL</b>	<b>Environmental categorization (1-3): 3</b>	
<b>Processing milestones – Bank approved financing only (add/delete rows depending on the number of financing sources)</b>	<b>Key Events (Bank approved financing only)</b>	<b>Disbursement and closing dates (Bank approved financing only)</b>
<b>Financing source/ instrument1: ADF Grant 2100155033567</b>	<b>Financing source/ instrument1: ADF Grant 2100155033567</b>	<b>Financing source/ instrument1: ADF Grant 2100155033567</b>
<b>Date approved: 25 October 2016</b>	<b>Cancelled amounts: NONE</b>	<b>Original disbursement deadline: 30 June 2018</b>
<b>Date signed: 20 January 2017</b>	<b>Supplementary financing: NONE</b>	<b>Original closing date: 31 December 2018</b>
<b>Date of entry into force: 20 January 2017</b>	<b>Restructuring (specify date &amp; amount involved): NONE</b>	<b>Revised (if applicable) disbursement deadline: 30 June 2019</b>

Date effective for 1st disbursement: <b>10 April 2017</b>	Extensions ( <i>specify dates</i> ): <b>From 31 December 2018 to 30 June 2019</b>		Revised ( <i>if applicable</i> ) closing date:	
Date of actual 1st disbursement: <b>21 April 2017</b>				
Financing source/instrument (add/delete rows depending on the number of financing sources):	Disbursed amount (amount, UA):	Percentage disbursed (%):	Undisbursed amount (UA):	Percentage undisbursed (%):
Financing source/ instrument1: <b>ADF Grant 2100155033567</b>	<b>UA 7,000,000</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
Other (e.g. co-financiers). <i>Add rows as needed</i>				
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>UA 7,000,000</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
Financing source/instrument (add/delete rows depending on the number of financing sources):	Committed amount (UA):	Percentage committed (%):	Uncommitted amount (UA):	Percentage uncommitted (%):
Financing source/ instrument1: <b>ADF Grant 2100155033567</b>	<b>UA 7,000,000</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
Other (e.g. co-financiers). <i>Add rows as needed</i> . ACBF				
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>UA 7,000,000</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
Co-financiers and other external partners:				
Executing and implementing agency (ies): <b>AFRICAN CAPACITY BUILDING FOUNDATION (ACBF)</b>				

## D Management review and comments

Report reviewed by	Name	Date reviewed	Comments
Country Manager	Damoni KITABIRE		
Sector Manager	Mots'elisi LEBESA		
Regional Director (as chair of Country Team)	Josephine NGURE		
Sector Director	Abdoulaye COULIBALY		

## II Project performance assessment

### A Relevance

#### 1. Relevance of project development objective

Rating*	Narrative assessment ( <i>max 250 words</i> )
4	Supporting capacity development for inclusive growth and sustainable development in Africa remains a key focus of the Bank's strategy frameworks including the Ten Year Strategy (TYS) 2013-2020, the Knowledge Management Strategy (KMS) 2015-2020 and the Capacity Development Strategy (CDS) 2010-2014 as well as aligned to the African Capacity Building Foundation (ACBF)'s Third Strategic Medium Term (SMTP III) with the overall goal to support activities that lead to effective governance for real poverty reduction. ACBF's SMTP III aimed for: (i) Promoting political and social stability and transformational change; (ii) Regulating the productive sector; and (iii) Tracking policy impact. The project was therefore contributing specifically to the first and second objectives of the ACBF's SMTP III. The project under completion was a response to capacity challenges that RMCs are facing and aimed at enhancing capacity of African countries and regional institutions on effective economic and financial governance for Africa's transformation. Therefore, through building capacities in relevant areas including: debt management, balance of payments methods, system of national

accounts monitoring, increased ability for legislative oversight, regional trade policy frameworks and cross-border infrastructure development, the project is deemed to have contributed to the successful implementation of priorities identified in the country and regional policies, strategies, operational plans of the beneficiary Regional Member Countries (RMCs). In addition, the project also managed to achieve the goal of strengthening some key regional organizations that are responsible for capacity development. By so doing the project addressed one of the key challenges of African research institutions and think tanks being lack of adequate funding although more still needs to be done.

\* For all ratings in the PCR use the following scale: 4 (Highly satisfactory), 3 (Satisfactory), 2 (Unsatisfactory), 1 (Highly unsatisfactory)

## 2. Relevance of project design

Rating*	Narrative assessment (max 250 words)
3	Most African countries are unable to sustain rapid economic growth and consolidate democratic gains and social stability due to lack of good economic governance among others. Some of the African countries face fragility risks and thus expectations for sustaining inclusive development and green growth as well as prospects of advancing regional integration in these countries remain bleak due. The project focused on building capacity in economic and financial governance and intra-Africa trade as the critical areas to advance the Africa's transformational agenda. Emphasis was placed on evidence-based policymaking. The project development was also informed by the outcomes of the ACBF's SMTP III and the lessons learnt from the previous Bank funded projects. It was also driven by the Bank's experience and international best practices in financing capacity building and enhancing knowledge. A participatory approach was used through the entire project process from the identification to the final assessment through the design and implementation. The Bank's team conducted rigorous project appraisal in collaboration with ACBF to assess the relevance and feasibility of the proposed interventions as well as the Foundation's organizational systems and processes to ensure effective management and accountability. This project also allowed the Bank to move from retail to wholesale capacity building allowing for economies of scale as ACBF further provided financial and technical support to other national and regional institutions (Macroeconomic and Financial Management Institute for Eastern and Southern Africa (MEFMI), West African Institute for Financial and Economic Management (WAIFEM) and Nigeria Institute for Legislative and Democratic Studies (NILDS).

## 3. Lessons learned related to relevance

Key issues (max 5, add rows as needed)	Lessons learned	Target audience
1. Capacity building in Debt Management, Debt Sustainability Analysis	The programs on debt management and debt sustainability conducted by Macroeconomic and Financial Management Institute of Eastern and Southern Africa (MEFMI) and West African Institute for Financial and Economic Management (WAIFEM) were opportune as debt issues have been and continue to be a concern in most of RMCs. Capacity development activities around debt management attracted tremendous interest from Member countries as they remain very relevant with debt levels continuing to rise albeit below levels prior to HIPC. In West Africa, WAIFEM training program on debt covered the five main Anglophone countries of Liberia, Ghana, Nigeria, Sierra Leone and The Gambia. MEFMI member states who benefitted from the debt program were Angola, Botswana, Kenya, Burundi, Lesotho, Malawi, Namibia, Mozambique, Swaziland, Rwanda, Tanzania, Zimbabwe, Uganda and Zambia. This was explained as being a result of the increasing concern among policy makers in RMCs about the issue of debt management, considering fears that African countries are fast accumulating debt. Based on feedback from participants, it would be useful for AfDB and ACBF to work out a possible continuation of the program. Considering the number of countries and the depth of capacity needs in the area of debt management, participants in the training programs expressed the need for deepened capacity building activities to cover additional scope and increased participation.	AfDB, ACBF and other Partners.

2. Bridging the gap between research and policymaking by engaging in dialogues and ensuring buy-in at highest level in government	Dialogue Sessions involving Parliamentarians, Ministers and other top government officials which formed part of the program design were also very informative during the project implementation. A dialogue session organized by NILDS on Agriculture Production and Value Chain attracted very top-level government officials. In addition to Parliamentarians from ECOWAS countries who participated in the Session on Agriculture production and Value Chain, there were other top government officials from the various countries including two Ministers from Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire who were in attendance to perform the formal opening and closing of the Session. The legislators who participated in these programs called for more involvement of Parliaments in the policy making processes. A similar program on security and small weapons proliferation which was also organized as a Dialogue session by NILDS demonstrated that the program was useful as it created opportunities for parliament-executive dialogue on pertinent national issues.	AfDB, ACBF, and other co-implementing agencies
3. Capacity building is still a priority in RMCs	Even the Bank's Ten-Year Strategy identified the huge capacity development needs in Africa which often are an impediment to achieving sustainable development. The limited scope of the program did not allow for all interested trainees to be offered the opportunity to participate in the training programs. Thus, there was unmet demands as the co-implementing partners had space for only a few nominations. This calls for increased follow up program to be developed to expand opportunities for more participants.	AfDB, ACBF and other co-implementing agencies.

**B Effectiveness**

**1. Progress towards the project's development objective (project purpose)**

Comments
<p><i>Provide a brief description of the Project (components) and the context in which it was designed and implemented. State the project development objective (usually the project purpose as set out in the RLF) and assess progress. Unanticipated outcomes should also be accounted for, as well as specific reference of gender equality in the project. The consistency of the assumptions that link the different levels of the results chain in the RLF should also be considered. Indicative max length: 400 words.</i></p>
<p>The project is a follow up to previous ones financed through the African Development Fund (ADF) Regional Public Goods (RPG) for the benefit of ADF-eligible countries and Regional Institutions. The purpose of the project was to strengthen capacity of African countries and regional institutions on effective economic and financial governance for Africa's transformation. The project intended specifically to provide capacity building solutions to RMCs to enable them to improve the quality of the design and delivery of their economic policies towards the achievement of their transformational agenda. The project had two main components as follows: Component 1: Improving formulation and implementation of economic and financial policies for Africa's transformation; and Component 2: Improving intra-regional trade and Africa's share in global trade.</p>
<p>Owing to the realisation by the AfDB that given the immense capacity development challenges in Africa not any one institution can achieve them all, the project was implemented mainly through a partnership approach with ACBF as the main implementing partner and involving three other institutions (MEFMI, NILDS and WAIFEM) with rich experiences in the focus areas of the project and also having past long-term positive engagement with ACBF. The Foundation implemented directly some interventions of the project including capacity needs assessment, technical assistance and knowledge events whilst the selected partners had played the role of implementation agencies of other project's activities. These entities served as the main sub-grantees under this project. Moreover, ACBF had also used its network of Think-Tanks or Policy Institutes to deliver some research related activities and other studies thus contributing to their support and better policymaking in RMCs.</p>
<p>Significant efforts were made towards the achievement of the project development objectives as evidenced by the progress of the outcome-level indicators of the project where five (5) out of the six (6) indicators have fully achieved or exceeded their targets. This presents about 83% of fully achieved outcomes. In addition, 100% of the project outputs were effectively delivered to the beneficiaries as detailed in below outcomes and output reporting tables. The project has built capacity in target countries in ECOWAS and SADC in the areas of debt management, balance of payments methods, system of national accounts monitoring, legislative oversight, regional trade policy frameworks and cross-border infrastructure development. The gender disaggregation differs by activities. In the output</p>

section some activities report as high as 74% women participation compared to a low of 33%. The project always attempted to ensure women representation in all the activities.

## 2. Outcome reporting

Outcome indicators (as per RLF; add more rows as needed)	Baseline value (2014)	Most recent value (A)	End target (B) (expected value at project completion)	Progress towards target (% realized) (A/B)	Narrative assessment (indicative max length: 50 words per outcome)	Core Sector Indicator (Yes/No)
<b>Outcome 1: Effective economic and financial governance in regional member countries</b>						
1.1: Percentage of countries that have been trained to adopt the minimum requirements for effective debt management	65%	100%	80%	125%	<b>Achieved</b> - Skills and knowledge for conducting debt sustainability analysis using the IMF/World Bank Debt Sustainability Framework for low income and market access countries were enhanced in 19 RMCs (5 in WAIFEM and 14 MEFMI. Courses provided by WAIFEM and MEFMI had covered the following topics: Debt, Budgeting, Planning and Performance. More than 100 participants attended the various training programs.	
1.2: Percentage of countries that have been trained on migration from Balance of Payments Methods 5 (BPM5) to BPM6	42%	95%	100%	95%	<b>Not achieved</b> – Of a total of 19 RMCs, skills in balance of payment method migration were provided in <b>18 countries</b> who have been able to migrate to BPM6 starting with their historical data update. - In collaboration with the IMF, WAIFEM organized a regional course on Balance of Payment Statistics for all the 5 Anglophone countries. - Out of the 14 MEFMI member countries (Angola, Botswana, Eswatini, Kenya, Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, Rwanda, Tanzania, Uganda, Zambia, and Zimbabwe), only Botswana has not yet published their BOP in the BPM6 format. To note is that they hope to release their 2019 data according to BPM6 as most of the background work has already been done.	
1.3: Percentage of countries that have adopted minimum standards of data compilation System of National Accounts (SNA) 2008	24%	50%	50%	100%	<b>Achieved</b> – With the support provided by WAIFEM, two countries (Ghana and Nigeria) have adopted SNA 2008 in WAMZ. In the MEFMI region, 8 regional member countries have migrated to SNA 2008.	
<b>Outcome 2: Increased intra-Africa trade and Africa's share in global trade</b>						
2.1: No. of RECs supported to develop innovative methods of financing infrastructure	0	2	2	100%	<b>Achieved</b> - Supported RECs are ECOWAS and SADC. - <b>In ECOWAS region</b> , the support was directed to countries within the region in the form of research studies on two themes - Islamic Finance as Alternative PPP option for Infrastructure Project Finance in ECOWAS and Alternative PPP	

					options for Infrastructure Project Finance in ECOWAS. The two studies involved case studies in selected ECOWAS countries including Ghana, Gambia, Senegal, and Cote d'Ivoire. - <b>In SADC zone</b> , study on Innovative Options for Financing Infrastructure Development, focusing on Domestic Debt Markets, Private-Public Partnerships, International Sovereign Bonds, and Islamic Financing. All the four chapters on these financing mechanisms were completed and validated during a meeting held in Harare.
2.2: No. of countries that are implementing cross-border payment system	3	12	7	171%	<b>Achieved</b> - Real Time Gross Settlement (RTGS) System was installed in <b>5 WAMZ countries</b> (Ghana, Nigeria, Liberia, Sierra Leone, Gambia). East African Payment System (EAPS) and SADC Integrated Regional Electronic Settlement System (SIRESS) were introduced in <b>7 RMCs in MEFMI zone</b> . The key outcome was a road map of how policymakers, regulators and industry actors can join their forces to boost cross border payments in the regions.
2.3: No. of RECs with most of the transition states supported in enhancing their Regional Integration efforts	0	2	1	200%	<b>Achieved</b> – Support was provided to ECOWAS and EAC - <b>ECOWAS:</b> WAIFEM had conducted a study on <i>Regional trade Policy Development for the Promotion of intra-ECOWAS Trade</i> , which had enabled to identify key barriers to the promotion of intra-ECOWAS trade; analysis of the level of trade facilitation in the region and how it increases trade and promote regional integration; identification of the challenges inhibiting the achievement of effective trade policy in the region; and proposing suggestions for the prospects of effective trade policy development to impact regional integration in ECOWAS - <b>EAC:</b> MEFMI had supported EAC for the development of a Regional Ports Development Strategy that will foster regional integration and benefit all member states including Burundi, a transition state in EAC region. The EAC Regional Ports Development Strategy has become a reference planning document for guiding regional policies and investments in the Ports sector and complimentary infrastructure.
Rating* (see IPR methodology)	<b>Narrative assessment</b>				
3	5 out of 6 outcome indicators have been achieved representing a success rate of 83%. It should be noted that Outcome 1.2 indicator (which is not achieved) mentions training and in this regard all the target countries were duly trained on the migration to BPM6. However, as an outcome indicator consideration was also be given to the number of countries that have actually managed to have even migrated from BPM5 to BPM 6 hence the non-attainment of the target as Botswana remains the only country yet to migrate leading to 95% achievement in this Outcome indicator.				

### 3. Output reporting

Output indicators (as specified in the RLF; add more rows as needed)	Most recent value (A)	End target (B) (expected value at project completion)	Progress towards target (% realized) (A/B)	Narrative assessment (indicative max length: 50 words per output)	Core Sector Indicator (Yes/No)
<b>Output 1:</b>					
1.1: No. of public sector officials trained on macroeconomic, financial and debt policy analysis and management	413	120 (40% female)	344%	<p><b>Achieved - WAIFEM</b> conducted a set of training targeting a total of <b>113 participants</b> with a ratio of 1 female to 3 males. Topics covered by the training included: Marco-prudential (34), regional integration (27), debts management (29) and gender budgeting (23). For <b>MEFMI</b>, several trainings were provided to <b>300 participants</b>. These included: training on macroeconomic modelling (23 male and 8 female); Debt sustainability Analysis (53 male and 24 female); Risk-Based Supervision (10 male and 12 female); Strategic Assets Allocation (23 male and 16 female); debt data validation (2 male and 6 female); Enterprise wide risk management (40 male and 51 female); cross-border payment systems (12 male, 5 female) and senior age (9 male and 6 female).</p> <p>The target was exceeded because – (i) ACBF encouraged the sub-grantees who organized these activities to expand the target beneficiaries beyond the traditional finance ministries to include officials from parliament and trade and planning ministries; (ii) savings made on budget for the planned activities were used to organize additional training sessions.</p>	
1.2: No. of economic and financial policy research products developed and disseminated	10	6	167%	<p><b>Achieved</b> - The completed research studies are the following:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1- Challenges of Fiscal Decentralization in Nigeria</li> <li>2-The Structure and Composition of the Labour Market in the West African Monetary Zone</li> <li>3-Islamic Finance as a PPP Option for Infrastructure Development in West Africa</li> <li>4-Regional Trade Policy Development for the Promotion of Intra - ECOWAS Trade: Challenges and Prospects</li> <li>5-Emerging Challenges of Managing Exchange Rate Policies in ECOWAS</li> <li>6-Regional trade policy guidelines for complex cross-border infrastructure development</li> <li>7-Enterprise wide Risk-based supervision, seigniorage,;</li> <li>8- Developing Mortality Tables for mortality and morbidity in Uganda</li> <li>9-Mapping the EAC Regional Ports with Complimentary Infrastructure to Facilitate Trade in the region.</li> </ol>	

				<p>10-Innovative Methods of Financing Sub-Regional Infrastructure projects</p> <p>These research products have gone through stakeholder validation. They were shared within their respective regions with institutions and agencies at national level.</p>
1.3: No. of RMCs that have benefitted from financial and debt management technical support	25	30	83%	<p><b>Not Achieved - <u>WAIFEM</u> provided 5 RMCs</b> (Liberia, Nigeria, Ghana, the Gambia and Sierra Leone) with development in PPP proposal checklist, Macroeconomic and Public Financial Management (Debt, Budgeting, Planning and Performance).</p> <p><b><u>MEFMI</u></b> has developed a workbook for Debt Sustainability Analysis which was disseminated to <b>14 RMCs</b> (Angola, Botswana, Kenya, Burundi, Lesotho, Malawi, Namibia, Mozambique, Swaziland, Rwanda, Tanzania, Zimbabwe, Uganda and Zambia) covered by the Institute. Representatives from these countries were also trained in Cross-border Payment Systems. In addition, the Institute also conducted in-country missions and training workshops targeting eSwatini, Zambia and Tanzania.</p> <p>ACBF Direct Support to States faced with Fragile Situations:</p> <p><b><u>ACBF</u></b> provided a range of technical support to total of six countries with fragility, including: <b><i>Central African Republic (RCA), Chad, The Gambia, Guinea, Comoros and Zimbabwe.</i></b> Capacity Needs Assessment (CNA) was undertaken for RCA, The Gambia, Chad, and Guinea. In the case of The Gambia, ACBF had engaged with the new Ministry of Finance to define a road map for the implementation of the CNA recommendations within the context of the National Development Plan, which has resulted in a preparation of a joint resource mobilization proposal to submitted to the Kuwaiti Fund. In Comoros, ACBF has supported the establishment of a new Policy Think Tank to support the Government in evidence-based policy analysis and development management. In addition, the country is yet to create a National Public Administration School based on the feasibility study conducted by ACBF. In addition to CNA, technical support was provided to Ministry in charge of Planning for implementing the National Development Strategy in Chad and Guinea. In Zimbabwe, the macroeconomic modelling team made of officers from the Central Bank, Ministry of finance and planning and the National Office of Statistics has</p>

				improved their expertise thanks to the advisory services provided by ZEPARU, a think tank partner of ACBF.
1.4: No. of RMC officials trained in implementation of gender-sensitive policy and strategies	198	180	110%	<p><b>Achieved</b> – The following training workshops were conducted:</p> <p><b>WAIFEM</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <i>Strategic Workshop on Public Finance Management and Gender Budgeting</i> organized in November 2017 and involved a total of <b>22 participants</b> of which 17 males and 5 Females</li> <li>- <i>Regional Workshop on Gender, National Accounts and the Economy for Ministries of Finance, Central Banks, National Development Planning authorities</i> held in June 2017 and targeted a total of <b>30 participants</b> of which 22 males and 8 females</li> <li>- <i>National Accounts and the Economy II for officials from Parliament, Ministries of Trade and Regional Integration, Controller and Accountant Generals Department</i> held in July 2017 and gathered a total of <b>42 participants</b> including 30 males and 12 females</li> </ul> <p><b>MEFMI</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <i>Regional Workshop on Gender-Responsive Economic Policy Management</i> held, in April 2017 and involved <b>76 participants</b> with the numbers standing at 74% (56) and 26% (20), females and males, respectively . The trained officials from 13 countries are serving as Gender Focal Persons in their respective institutions and countries for knowledge transfer and facilitators of gender policy-making initiatives</li> <li>- <i>Regional Workshop on Public Finance and Gender-Responsive Economic Policy Management</i> held in June 2018 and was attended by 28 participants from 9 MEFMI Member States. In terms of gender representation, there were 20 female and 8 male participants. The workshop helped improving the competency of participants in identifying and addressing gender biases in economic policy.</li> </ul>
1.5: No. of parliamentarians trained on effective financial governance oversight	150	120	125%	<p><b>Achieved</b> – There were two trainings involving <b>90 participants</b> in the first training and <b>60 participants</b> in the second training. Both trainings were organized by Nigerian Institute for Legislative and Democratic Studies (NILDS) and out which 20% of the participants are women. The workshop enabled ECOWAS and National parliamentarians to critically review the impact of the enhanced powers of the regional Parliament on the overall community.</p>

				The actual target is derived from the cumulative target of 870 against the baseline of 750 as indicated in the results-based logical framework of the PAR.
1.6: No. of workshop organized to discuss common financial governance principles in ECOWAS region	2	2	100%	<b>Achieved</b> – The two workshops organized by NILDS were as follows: - <i>Regional workshop on Principles of Financial Governance</i> in March 2018 involving 56 technical staff of ECOWAS Parliament and National Parliaments, staff of MDAs in ECOWAS. The technical staff training intended to support the capacity building of Parliamentarians. - <i>Regional dialogue session on ECOWAS Single Currency Programme</i> targeting 96 MPs of ECOWAS Parliament and 23 MPs of National Parliaments attended.
1.7a: No. of transitional countries supported in policy formulation and implementation	11	6	183%	<b>Achieved</b> – The eleven countries supported were the following: <b>South Sudan, Chad, CAR, Sierra Leone, Togo, Liberia, Guinea, Gambia, Cote d'Ivoire, Comoros and Zimbabwe</b> – The number of countries has increased from 6 to 11 as a result of new requests for support received from 5 additional countries in transition. ACBF had responded favourably and was able to reach out to more beneficiaries with the same funding envelope
1.7b: No. of public sector officials trained in transitional countries	984	600	164%	<b>Achieved</b> – Various training workshops have been organized in transitional countries building skills of public sector officials. Topics covered by the training included public finance management; data management, development planning and monitoring in the context of fragility. A total of <b>984 participants</b> in the training sessions are distributed per country as follows: South Sudan (168), Chad (58), CAR (55), Sierra Leone (5), Togo (178), Liberia (80), Guinea (40), Gambia (270), Cote d'Ivoire (68), Comoros (2), Zimbabwe (60).
<b>Output 2: Increased intra-Africa trade and Africa's share in global trade</b>				
2.1: No. of RECs capacity building action plans developed including for RECS with most transition states	2	2	100%	<b>Achieved</b> - Capacity building action plans were developed for ECCAS and Arab Maghreb Union (UMA.) This work was informed by an ACBF conducted survey on the capacity needs of Africa's RECs for improving their capabilities to contribute to the dynamics of regional and continental integration. As part of the implementation of survey recommendations, ACBF undertook visits to three selected RECs (ECCAS, UMA and SADC) for supporting them in the design of capacity development action plans.
2.2: No. of AGOA Country Case Studies published	11	11	100%	<b>Achieved</b> – The targeted countries are as follows: <b>Tanzania, Ethiopia, Togo, Kenya, Liberia Madagascar, Lesotho, Mauritius,</b>

				<i>Rwanda, Zambia, Cote d'Ivoire</i> . The studies provide insights on the implementation of AGOA at country level and how countries can optimize on the benefits of this preferential trade arrangement. The reports of all the 11 target countries are completed. An AGOA Strategy report had been developed for Nigeria.
2.3: No. of Africa Capacity Reports (ACR) published	2	1	200%	<b>Achieved – ACR-2017 and ACR-2019</b> are published along with 4 Policy Briefs. - ACR-2017 theme: <b>“Building Capacity in Science, Technology and Innovation for Africa’s Transformation”</b> - ACR-2019 theme: <b>“Fostering Transformative Leadership for Africa’s Development”</b> In addition, a special thematic index was included in the ACRs to show how African countries are implementing Agenda 2063 and the SDGs and the institutional mechanisms put in place for achieving the two agendas The actual target is derived from the cumulative target of 6 against the baseline of 5 as indicated in the results-based logical framework of the PAR.
2.4: No. of Agenda 2063 National Capacity Needs Assessment developed	10	10	100%	<b>Achieved</b> - Assessment completed for <b>10 countries</b> , namely: <i>Algeria, Cameroon, Comoros; Eswatini, Kenya; Liberia; Malawi; Nigeria; Togo; and Zimbabwe</i> . The study aimed at determining the nature and types of capacity needed to realize the achievement of the goals set out in Africa’s Agenda 2063 in the targeted countries. The assessments highlighted capacity requirements for the countries covered to articulate a framework that will guide the path towards what the continent aspires to accomplish by the year 2063.
2.5: No. of RECs supported to develop Trade Policy guidelines for cross-border infrastructure	2	2	100%	<b>Achieved</b> - The support provided to RECs under this indicator was mainly in form of research studies conducted for the RECs to inform the development of regional trade policy guidelines for cross-border infrastructure. The two RECs supported are ECOWAS and EAC.  <b>In ECOWAS:</b> WAIFEM conducted a Study on <b>Regional Trade Policy Development and Intra-ECOWAS Trade: Challenges and Prospects</b> . The study focused on three dimensions - Examine the determinants of trade in ECOWAS; Evaluate the degree of protectionism; Examine the role of trade policy in intra-ECOWAS

				<b>In EAC:</b> A study on <i>Mapping the EAC Regional Ports and Complementary Infrastructure to Facilitate Trade</i> was conducted.
2.6: No. of parliamentary dialogues / consultations on regional trade, security and agricultural policies organized	6	2	300%	<b>Achieved</b> – Dialogues/consultations conducted were as follows: 1- Dialogues on security challenges in ECOWAS (90 ECOWAS MPs and 20 National MPs); 2- Regional Dialogue on Agricultural and trade policies (47 MPs and 25 officials from MDAs). 3- Dialogue on trade-related issues and on illicit financial flows for Pan-African parliamentarians. 4- Dialogue on the Issue of the Political and Socio-Economic Integration of the African Continent: The Role of the Pan-African Parliament; 5- The Pan African Parliament’s Committee on Rural Economy, Agriculture, Natural Resources and Environment; 6- Agricultural Transformation in Africa and the role of Parliamentarians during the 4 <sup>th</sup> Annual ReNAPRI Stakeholder Conference.
2.7: No. of research products on innovative methods for financing regional infrastructure developed	4	4	100%	<b>Achieved</b> – The following four research studies were completed: 1- Innovative methods for financing regional infrastructure: Lessons for Africa from other developing regions; 2- Innovative methods for financing regional infrastructure: Success stories and lessons learnt from the Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) initiatives in Africa; 3- Innovative methods for financing regional infrastructure: Transport; 4- Innovative methods for financing regional infrastructure: Energy.  The studies aimed at (i) taking stock of initiatives on the topic and their financing mechanisms, analysing how they were designed, what worked, what did not work and why, what were the challenges, critical success/failure factors, and implications for policy and capacity development and (ii) identifying sound, accessible and realistic innovative methods on the related topic.
<b>Rating*</b> (see IPR methodology)	<b>Narrative assessment</b>			
3	The project has achieved 14 out of 15 sets of expected outputs translating into 93% achievement. Output 1.3 aimed at reaching 30 countries but was not achieved. The project managed to reach 25 countries translating into 83% achievement through financial and debt management technical support which was administered through regional workshops, national workshops and technical assistance. Regional workshops usually provide some economies of scale whereby recipients from many countries can benefit but the challenging experience has always been the lack of participation of some countries and also some of the technical support has to be demand driven and those that requested were responded to.			

#### 4. Development Objective (DO) rating

DO rating (derived from updated IPR) *	Narrative assessment (indicative max length: 250 words)
3	Five out of six end target outcome-level indicators were achieved satisfactorily. The giving a rating of satisfactory. Again, one of the output targets could not be met as reported in the above output reporting table, thus performance of the program in terms of outputs completion is therefore rated satisfactory. In sum, the overall rating of the Project's Development Objective is satisfactory.

#### 5. Beneficiaries (add rows as needed)

Actual (A)	Planned (B)	Progress towards target (% realized) (A/B)	% of women	Category (e.g. farmers, students)
611	300	204%	40%	Central Bank Officials, Officials from Ministries of finance/planning and other ministries
150	120	125%	35%	Parliamentarians
984	600	164%	30%	Public Sector officials from relevant ministries and central bank in States faced with fragile situations

#### 6. Unanticipated or additional outcomes (add rows as needed)

Description	Type (e.g. gender, climate change, social, other)	Positive or negative	Impact on project (High, Medium, Low)
Increase in number of countries facing fragile situations benefiting from NILDS training. The initial plan was to benefit Sierra Leone alone, but this was turned into a regional program that benefitted countries even outside of the catchment area, such as Mozambique, Zimbabwe, DRC and CAR. Due to judicious use of resources, NILDS made savings on planned activities budget. This was discussed with the Bank and approval sought to apply the savings made to organize additional activities which targeted technical staff of Parliaments. The rationale was that whereas the main project design focused on Parliamentarians, it was noted that the technical staff who are permanent needed to be supported in order to ensure sustainability of capacity building. Thus, the program benefitted parliamentary staff as well.	Improved development planning in countries faced with fragile situations	Positive	Expanded coverage

#### 7. Lessons learned related to effectiveness (add rows as needed)

Key issues (max 5, add rows as needed)	Lessons learned	Target audience
1. Sustainability of Capacity Development (CD) interventions	In Liberia, the establishment of a macroeconomic laboratory for training public sector staff on macroeconomic analysis has ensured sustainability of capacity interventions. The laboratory, which was equipped with computers and relevant software has become the go-to place for macroeconomic training in the country, even after the project ended. As such macroeconomic CD interventions trickled down to other beneficiaries	Ministries, Departments and Agencies

<b>Augmenting research support through local content to meet increasing demand.</b>	Generally, policy unit support focuses on hiring of top-notch external researchers to conduct research for policy formulation and analysis. However, experience proved that it is useful to engage local lower-tier research assistants to support the senior researchers. This enhances efficiency of the time spent on research. This lesson was manifested during the project implementation when the <i>Cellule d'analyse de Politiques Economiques du Cires (CAPEC)</i> had to face delays in completing planned research work. This is also an opportunity to build capacity of young researchers	ACBF AfDB  National Capacity Building Institutions  Think-tanks  African young researchers
<b>Need for clarity on process requirements including procurement arrangements.</b>	The project implementation could benefit from a clearer understanding of the process requirements mainly in the area of procurement. The activity on aligning country capacity development strategies with the Agenda 2063 was delayed because the process started by ACBF was later found not to be fully in line with the Bank's requirements. This resulted in delays in execution of this task. It is important for subsequent programs to embed annual training on Bank procurement policies and rules for all the implementing Entities to avoid delays relating to procurement processes.	ACBF AfDB
<b>Program management in countries facing fragile situations requires close support and specific attention</b>	Countries facing specific fragile situations require customized assistance and sustainable patient support for the interventions to be effective.  For example, in Comoros, ACBF used the handholding approach to help the government launch and make the think tank functional. Thanks to the support, the think tank was able to make functional the office space, acquire minimum office and ICT equipment, develop a website, produce 3 research papers and develop a strategic plan for 3 years. This has increased its visibility in the policy space in the Union of Comoros.	RMCs, Think-tanks

## C Efficiency

### 1. Timeliness

Planned project duration – years (A) (as per PAR)	Actual implementation time – years (B) (from effectiveness for 1st disb.)	Ratio of planned and actual implementation time (A/B)	Rating*
2	2.5	0.80	3
<b>Narrative assessment</b> (indicative max length: 250 words)			
There was a delay in disbursements at the beginning of project and also of the second tranche which affected implementation of activities which was as a result of delays in conducting the Mid Term Review. The second tranche delay was necessitated by the political situation that ensued following the disputed presidential elections. Given that the project uses Borrowers Procurement guidelines, there will be need to undertake a procurement audit which is yet to be conducted following a No-Objection clearance from the bank. However, with strong cooperation between the Bank and ACBF, lessons have been learned to improve future performance in these areas.			

## 2. Resource use efficiency

Median % physical implementation of RLF outputs financed by all financiers (A) (see II.B.3)	Commitment rate (%) (B) (See table 1.C – Total commitment rate of all financiers)	Ratio of the median percentage physical implementation and commitment rate (A/B)	Rating*
N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
<b>Narrative assessment</b> (indicative max length: 250 words)			
Savings made on some activities were used for an effective implementation of other relevant activities in consultation with the Bank; thus more activities were implemented, and results realized using the same level of grant resources. This also resulted in the increase of number of beneficiaries as can be observed from the output table and section 5 under section B. The project implementation was efficient in delivering on the expected project results: the core team managing the project activities was actively supported by other staff members whose associated costs were not actually charged to the project management costs of this grant.			

## 3. Cost benefit analysis

Economic Rate of Return (at appraisal)	Updated Economic Rate of Return (at completion)	Rating*
N/A	N/A	N/A
<b>Narrative assessment</b> (indicative max length: 250 words)		

## 4. Implementation Progress (IP)

IP Rating (derived from updated IPR) *	Narrative comments (commenting specifically on those IP items that were rated Unsatisfactory or Highly Unsatisfactory, as per last IPR). (indicative max length: 500 words)
3	None of the project activities or actions were rated unsatisfactory or highly unsatisfactory. Where the implementing agency was in doubt or unclear they always sought guidance from the Bank.

## 5. Lessons learned related to efficiency

Key issues (max 5, add rows as needed)	Lessons learned	Target audience
Good management of projects' resources during project implementation contributes to increased project effectiveness. The Implementing Agency was able to make savings on some activities. These savings arose from lower cost in procurement of services. The savings made were used to implement additional activities after consultations with the Bank. This contributed to having a positive impact on overall project performance.	Good use of resources enabled increasing the coverage to even more beneficiaries.	RMC officials in relevant Ministries, parliamentarians and Central Banks ACBF AfDB
Project Completion: The delay in disbursement at the start of the project coupled with the disputed presidential election results that delayed the undertaking of the mid-term review which was condition for the disbursement of the second tranche.	It is important to ensure all the project covenants are well satisfied as well as the submission of budgets to accompany work programmes	ACBF AfDB
Avoiding exchange rate losses	Project budget ought to be drawn in UA amounts to avoid the exchange rate losses that ACBF incurred by budgeting using USD. When the actual disbursements were made, the actual dollar equivalent values were less than what was budgeted at project approval. The USD equivalent amounts	ACBF AfDB

	should be understood to be indicative and not commitments.	
--	--	--

## D Sustainability

### 1. Financial sustainability

Rating*	Narrative assessment (indicative max length: 250 words)
3	The financial sustainability on some of the activities of the project hinges on the country ownership and support. Clear examples are the Think tank in Comoros, the project helped with its setting following a request by the Ministry of Finance. Without adequate support both technical and financial from the government, it may not achieve the objectives for which it was setup. As such given the project has become an enabler for improved policymaking in Comoros with government buy-in indicative of continuous support being provided beyond the project. Moreover, expected resources to sustain the project results are yet to be materialized and in order to sustain gains made, it is imperative that the Bank continues to partner not only with ACBF but other reputable anchor institutions in Africa to deliver on more programs to RMCs. There has been increased demand for ACBF capacity building services following the designation of ACBF as the African Union's Specialized Agency for Capacity building. In this role ACBF will also now receive subvention/funding from the African Union to be able to implement some of its capacity building interventions. This AU support is expected to enable ACBF to be in a position to leverage on other funding partners to for continued capacity development in Africa.

### 2. Institutional sustainability and strengthening of capacities

Rating*	Narrative assessment (indicative max length: 250 words)
3	African countries continue to take leadership in capacity building efforts. This is reflected in their continued support for ACBF institutional cost activities (Staff, systems and processes) in order to free donor funds for programmatic and technical advisory interventions at country level. ACBF remains a sustainable institution. However, the increased demand for the Foundation's services will require significant and sustained inflow of resources. In order to diversify its services beyond grants making, the Foundation has introduced a set of services lines including technical advisory services, knowledge services. The project used the ACBF Procurement Guidelines which were developed to conform to best practices and aligned with those of the Bank. In this way, the project contributed to strengthening the procurement capacity of the institution.

### 3. Ownership and sustainability of partnerships

Rating*	Narrative assessment (indicative max length: 250 words)
3	Ownership of the capacity building interventions is a critical factor for success. ACBF systematically conducted appraisal which involved intensive consultations with governments and all relevant stakeholders in the target countries and regions. Also, in the delivery of the specific activities by ACBF's implementing partners (MEFMI, WAIFEM and NILDS) resulted in consultations with key beneficiaries who have always expressed satisfaction and appreciation. This ensured that the stakeholders owned the various programs that were implemented. To that extent, there was intense interest in the various training and technical assistance support. Some of the interventions that ACBF undertook were demand driven and provided valuable technical assistance that enhances ownership and sustainability.

### 4. Environmental and social sustainability

Rating*	Narrative assessment (indicative max length: 250 words)
N/A	The project didn't warrant any environmental and social mitigation measures and was classified as category 3. There was no need for preparation of the Environment and Social Management Plan (ESMP).

### 5. Lessons learned related to sustainability

Key issues (max 5, add rows as needed)	Lessons learned	Target audience

Increased demand for more capacity building programs	There is a requirement for long-term support to with the ever-increasing capacity development challenges and new models and approaches come up from time to time in macroeconomic management, debt management, etc. Moreover, countries continue to express the need for more opportunities for capacity building.	AfDB ACBF RMCs
Strengthening Africa-led capacity building institutions (for instance, support for nascent national think tanks)	A one-size-fits-all approach does not suit all countries particularly those faced with fragile situations which require more attention. For instance, the duration of the grant to the Union of Comoros' think tank was too short given the capacity challenge faced by such an entity in the early stages. For a nascent think tank, a minimum of 24 months would have improved the sustainability of the organisation.	Regional Member Countries ACBF AfDB
ACBF designation as the AU's specialised agency for capacity development	This shows a vote of confidence in the work that ACBF does as the premier capacity development institution on the continent. This could further enhance the institutional and financial sustainability of ACBF.	ACBF

### III Performance of stakeholders

#### 1. Bank performance

Rating*	Narrative assessment by the Borrower on the Bank's performance, as well as any other aspects of the project (both quantitative and qualitative). See guidance note on issues to cover. (indicative max length: 250 words)	
3	At the project design and appraisal stages, the Bank used a participatory approach by heavily involving ACBF with the view to strengthening the ownership and accountability for results by ACBF. During project implementation, the Bank has been responsive and timely feedback was given to queries raised by ACBF in response to implementation challenges facing ACBF's partners. The Bank conducted supervision missions and adequate guidance was given, and lessons were learned to improve project implementation. Moreover, in some of the supervision missions, the Bank consulted with the sub-grantees to get more information to inform its operations going forward. This provided valuable inputs regarding the impact of disbursement delays on the implementation of the project activities at the helm of the sub-grantees. In general, the performance of the Bank is satisfactory.	
<b>Comments to be inserted by the Bank on its own performance (both quantitative and qualitative). See guidance note on issues to cover. (indicative max length: 250 words)</b>		
The Bank was very responsive to ACBF's requests during the project implementation phase even though the project start was marred by delays in disbursement. An example is of responding favourably to budget reallocation to be able to cover the exchange rate losses that ACBF incurred during the project implementation. Nonetheless, some of the delays in disbursement were due to circumstances beyond the Bank's control like the political situation that ensued following the Presidential elections in July 2018. This delayed the Mid-Term Review which had a negative impact on the second disbursement, however, the Bank adjusted the implementation period to accommodate the successful completion of the project.		
<b>Key issues</b> (related to Bank performance, max 5, add rows as needed)		<b>Lessons learned</b>
Understanding of AfDB rules and procedures		It is important at design stage to clarify issues that could affect implementation and make sure to have a shared understanding of procedures. ACBF had submitted procurement plan which was approved, and use was being made of their procurement procedures. For one of the line items they wanted to change the procurement method from international competitive bidding to sole source and for that they needed the Bank's no-objection. As

	such they were not aware that they would need the Bank's no-objection to do that.
--	---

## 2. Borrower performance

Rating*	Narrative assessment on the Borrower performance to be inserted by the Bank (both quantitative and qualitative, depending on available information). See guidance note. (indicative max length: 250 words)	
4	ACBF was very responsive and supportive of the Bank's project preparation and very cooperative. During project implementation, ACBF did not hesitate to consult with the Bank whenever they had issues that they believed would affect the implementation. This was evident through the budget reallocation request that they submitted to the Bank to be able to cover among others, the exchange rate losses that they incurred. Whenever they were in doubt, they would contact the Bank for guidance, and this proved valuable for project implementation. ACBF also complied with the project covenants and timely submitted the progress reports and responding to supervision recommendations. With consultation with some of the project beneficiaries (sub-grantees) they expressed satisfaction with the ACBF's project support.	
Key issues (related to Borrower performance, max 5, add rows as needed)		Lessons learned
1. Understanding Bank's procurement procedures		Although a presentation on Bank's procurement procedures and guidelines was presented during project appraisal and launching, it is advisable that the Bank continuously provide procurement advisory even though in this case use was being made of ACBF's procurement guidelines. This

## 3. Performance of other stakeholders

Rating*	Narrative assessment on the performance of other stakeholders, including co-financiers, contractors and service providers. See guidance note on issues to cover. (indicative max length: 250 words)		
N/A	N/A		
Key issues (related to performance of other stakeholders, max 5, add rows as needed)	Lessons learned (max 5)		Target audience (for lessons learned)
N/A	N/A		N/A

# IV Summary of key lessons learned and recommendations

## 1. Key lessons learned

Key issues (max 5, add rows as needed)	Key lessons learned	Target audience
1. Work program design including co-implementing partners	Adopting multi-level stakeholders' participatory approach and clarifying the legal instrument to be used for earmarked interventions are key for implementation effectiveness and project success.	AfDB ACBF Co-implementing partners
2. Inadequate resources and time allocated to conflict affected states related interventions.	Capacity building intervention is a long-term process and mostly in the context of fragility to expect greater results and impact. For subsequent interventions, it would be helpful to have a full program with a funding envelop of not less than USD20 million, with a project duration of at least 5 years in order to provide sustained capacity building support for training participants.	AfDB ACBF
3. Delay in project implementation by implementing partners or other stakeholders	Ability to solve problems and proactiveness are critical in project supervision /monitoring especially when dealing with interventions involving partners,	ACBF co-implementing partners

	governments and regional bodies. There is a need to have problem solving capacity to quickly propose to partners alternative or replacement solutions without departing from the project objectives.	
4. Avoiding exchange rate losses on disbursements	It is important and prudent that Executing Agencies prepare their budget implementation plans based on UA amounts. This will eliminate the exchange rate risk like it happened in this project where budgets were prepared on USD which ought to have been indicative and not as commitment.	AfDB Project funds' recipients

## 2. Key recommendations (with particular emphasis on ensuring sustainability of project benefits)

Key issue (max 10, add rows as needed)	Key recommendation	Responsible	Deadline
1. Limited duration and financing of the project particularly for states faced with fragile situations	The technical capacity in most of these countries has been found wanting and could be detrimental to any development prospects. Therefore, the Bank ought to consider ramping up support for such countries. The duration and financing of a project of this nature should be of a longer time span in order to consolidate and build on gains acquired in a short term.	AfDB	January 2020
2. Long term investment in capacity development is required to ensure sustainability of results	Capacity development is transversal in nature and therefore It is recommended that relevant African capacity development anchor institutions like the ACBF be adequately resourced enabling to continue supporting interventions that have started yielding good and tangible results or projects that have high potential for scaling up and sustaining results. Funding to be provided beyond catalytic or initial support especially for countries in transition.	AfDB Other Funding partners	January 2020

## V Overall PCR rating

Dimensions and criteria	Rating*
<b>DIMENSION A: RELEVANCE</b>	<b>3.5</b>
Relevance of project development objective (II.A.1)	4
Relevance of project design (II.A.2)	3
<b>DIMENSION B: EFFECTIVENESS</b>	<b>3</b>
Development Objective (DO) (II.B.4)	3
<b>DIMENSION C: EFFICIENCY</b>	<b>3</b>
Timeliness (II.C.1)	3
Resource use efficiency (II.C.2)	N/A
Cost-benefit analysis (II.C.3)	N/A
Implementation Progress (IP) (II.C.4)	3
<b>DIMENSION D: SUSTAINABILITY</b>	<b>3</b>
Financial sustainability (II.D.1)	3
Institutional sustainability and strengthening of capacities (II.D.2)	3
Ownership and sustainability of partnerships (II.D.3)	3
Environmental and social sustainability (II.D.4)	N/A
<b>AVERAGE OF THE DIMENSION RATINGS</b>	<b>3.13</b>
<b>OVERALL PROJECT COMPLETION RATING</b>	<b>Satisfactory</b>

## VI Acronyms and abbreviations

Acronym (add rows as needed)	Full name
ACBF	African Capacity Building Foundation
ACR	Africa Capacity Report
ADF	African Development Fund
AfCOP	African Community of Practice on Managing for Development Results
AfDB	African Development Bank
AGOA	African Growth and Opportunity Act
AGO	African Governance Outlook
AU	African Union
CDS	Capacity Development Strategy
EADI	African Development Institute
ECOWAS	Economic Community of Western African States
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
IMF	International Monetary Fund
KMS	Knowledge Management Strategy
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MEFMI	Macroeconomic and Financial Management Institute of Eastern and Southern Africa
NILDS	Nigerian Institute for Legislative and Democratic Studies
PAR	Project Appraisal Report
PCR	Project Completion Report
RECs	Regional Economic Communities
RMCs	Regional Member Countries
RMF	Results Measurement Framework
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SSA	Sub-Saharan Africa
UA	Unit of Account
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USD	United States Dollar
SMTPs	Strategic Medium Term Plans
SMTPI	First Strategic Medium Term Plan
SMTPII	Second Strategic Medium Term Plan
SMTPIII	Third Strategic Medium Term Plan iii
WAIFEM	West African Institute for Financial and Economic Management
WB	World Bank

**Required attachment:** Updated Implementation Progress and Results Report (IPR)– the date should be the same as the PCR mission.