

Probable Date of Board Presentation
Not Applicable

FOR INFORMATION

MEMORANDUM

TO : THE BOARDS OF DIRECTORS

FROM : Vincent O. NMEHIELLE
Secretary General

SUBJECT : TOGO: TOILETS FOR ALL IN SOKODÉ THROUGH FAECAL SLUDGE
VALORISATION AND MICROCREDIT

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT*

Please find attached the above mentioned document.

Attach:

cc: The President

***Questions on this document should be referred to:**

Mrs. M. AKIN-OLUGBADE	Director General	RDGW	Extension 4018
Mr. J. M. OSSETE	Ag. Coordinator	AWTF.1	Extension 2771
Mr. O. GUENE	Task Manager	AHWS.2	Extension 1621
Mr. F. HOLLHUBER	Co-Task Manager	AWTF.1	Extension 3510

AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK GROUP



TOGO

**TOILETS FOR ALL IN SOKODÉ THROUGH FAECAL SLUDGE
VALORISATION AND MICROCREDIT**

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT

(PCR)

RDGW/AWTF/AHWS

February 2019

Translated document

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR) FOR PUBLIC SECTOR OPERATIONS



AFRICAN
DEVELOPMENT
BANK GROUP

I Basic data

A Report data

Report date		Date of report:	03/08/2018	
		Mission date (if field mission)	From: 23/07/2018	To: 27/07/2018

B Responsible Bank staff

Positions	At appraisal	At completion
Regional Director	JANVIER K. LITSE	MARIE-LAURE AKIN-OLUGBADE
Sector Director	SERING JALLOW	GLADYS WAMBUI GICHURI
Sector Manager	AKISSA BAHRI	JEAN MICHEL OSSETTE
Task Manager	OUSSEYNOU GUENE	OUSSEYNOU GUENE
Alternate Task Manager		
PCR Team Leader		
PCR Team Members		THEOPHILE GNAGNE

C Project data

Project name: Toilets for all in Sokodé through Faecal Sludge Valorisation and Microcredit		
Project code: P-TG-EBZ-001	Instrument number: GRANT 5600155003301	
Project type: Investment	Sector: Water and Sanitation	
Country: TOGO	Environmental categorization (1-3): 2	
Processing milestones (grant)	Key events (loan)	Disbursement and closing dates (loan)
Date approved: 19.04.2013	Cancelled amounts: 0	Original disbursement deadline: 31.10.2013
Date signed: 29.05.2013	Supplementary financing:	Original closing date: 30.06.2016
Date of entry into force: 29.05.2013	Restructuring (specify date & amount involved):	Revised (if applicable) disbursement deadline:
Date effective for first disbursement: 29.05.2013	Extensions (specify dates):	Revised (if applicable) closing deadline: 30/09/2018
Date of actual first disbursement: 03.12.2013		

Financing source (UA):	Disbursed amount (amount, UA) :	Percentage disbursed (%):	Undisbursed amount (UA) :	Percentage undisbursed (%):
Loan:				
Grant: GRANT No. : 5600155003301	1 033 320	87.20%	151 680	12.80%
Government /SOKODE municipality:	39 913	71.02%	16 287	28.98%
PLAN-TOGO	209 874	99.94%	126	0.06%
Population	27 692	21.55%	100 808	78.45%
TOTAL	1 405 617	88.98%	174 083	17.02%
Financing source (UA) :	Committed amount (UA) :	Percentage committed (%):	Uncommitted amount (UA) :	Percentage uncommitted (%):
Loan:				
Grant: GRANT No. : 5600155003301	1 176 113	99.25%	8 859	0.75%
Government /SOKODE municipality:	39 913	71.02%	16 289	28.98%
Plan TOGO	209 874	99.94%	125	0.06%
Population	27 692	21.55%	100 812	78.45%
TOTAL	1 453 640	92.02%	126 085	7.98%
Cofinanciers and other external partners:				
Executing and implementing agency (ies):				

D Management review and comments

Report reviewed by	Name	Date reviewed	Comments
Division Manager	Jean Michel OSSETE		
Sector Director	GLADYS WAMBUI GICHURI		
Resident Representative	KHADIDIA DIABI		
Regional Director	MARIE-LAURE AKIN-OLUGBADE		

II Project performance assessment

A Relevance

1. Relevance of project development objective

Rating*	Narrative assessment (maximum 250 words)
3	<p>The TAS project objective is to improve the living conditions of the population of Sokode through sustainable and affordable faecal sludge management.</p> <p>In relation to national decentralisation policy and strategies, the DO is fully aligned with the sector priorities: (i) National Integrated Water Resources Management (IWRM) policy and strategies, (ii) Act no. 2007-011 of 13 March 2007, on decentralization and local freedoms, (iii) the Full Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (F-PRSP, 2009), (iv) National Hygiene and Sanitation Policy for Togo, 2009. The DO is also consistent with Strategic Priority 3 of the 2013-2017 Accelerated Growth and Employment Promotion Strategy Paper (SCAPE) on developing human capital, social protection and employment.</p> <p>As regards the Bank, the DO remains aligned with the 2016-2020 CSP, in particular with Outcome 4 of Pillar 2 on the strengthening of decentralization and women's participation in the decision-making process</p>

* For all ratings in the PCR use the following scale: 4 (Highly satisfactory), 3 (Satisfactory), 2 (Unsatisfactory), 1 (Highly unsatisfactory)

2. Relevance of project design

Rating*	Narrative assessment <i>(maximum 250 words)</i>
3	<p>The project design was based on the construction of infrastructure, supply of equipment, the development and implementation of an approach and mechanism to provide risk-free excreta management along the sanitation value chain in Sokode through: (i) the facilitation of access for all to private toilets, (ii) the restoration of a sustainable sludge collection and transportation system; and (iii) sludge treatment and re-use.</p> <p>To that end, it was relevant to first target the old neighbourhoods of Sokode where private toilet access rates are among the lowest. It was also relevant to establish Neighbourhood Sanitation Committees (CAQ), set up by the neighbourhood, to play the role of social and technical manager for the procurement of toilets. It was also relevant to establish an endogenous microcredit mechanism as a revolving fund to guarantee the continuing sustainable supply of toilets.</p> <p>As an extension of risk-free excreta management it was relevant to sustainably restore the faecal sludge collection and transportation service that previously existed through the procurement of a faecal sludge transport truck and a motor tricycle equipped with a sludge pump for areas that are not easily accessible. It would be advisable to have them managed by a social enterprise subject to an obligation of result in order to desludge cesspits throughout Sokodé and neighbouring municipalities.</p> <p>Then, in order to close the sanitation value chain loop, it was relevant to provide the municipality with a collected faecal sludge treatment plant accompanied by measures to ensure sustainability, namely the valorisation of treated sludge for agricultural purposes and delegation of the operating service to a private firm.</p> <p>It was also relevant to use delegated contracting as a credible alternative to the municipality's weak capacity. This was also necessary for the establishment of bodies at different levels (neighbourhoods, municipality, steering committee...) to help address the issue of households' risk-free access to sanitation which is a local problem. In addition, the guarantee of project ownership lies in the regular sharing of information with stakeholders.</p> <p>Throughout project implementation, the design was not changed in terms of approach, selection of targets, readjustments or reorientation. There was, however, a technological change since the originally planned EcoSan toilets were replaced by flushing toilets with waterproof septic tanks in order to take the perception of the populations of the targeted neighbourhoods more closely into account.</p>

3. Lessons learned related to relevance

Key issues <i>(max 5, add rows as needed)</i>	Lessons Learned	Target audience
1. Implementation period	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A project largely based on social mobilisation for the procurement of toilets requires a longer period than the 16 quarters planned. 2. The weak capacity of local enterprises also lengthens the implementation period 	Bank Government Mayor's office Plan Togo

1. Progress towards the project's development objective (project purpose)
Comments

Provide a brief description of the Project (components) and the context in which it was designed and implemented. State the project development objective (usually the project purpose as set out in the RLF) and assess progress. Unanticipated outcomes should also be accounted for, as well as specific reference of gender equality in the project. The consistency of the assumptions that link the different levels of the results chain in the RLF should also be considered. Indicative max length: 400 words.

The TAS project's objective is to improve the living conditions of Sokode's population through sustainable and affordable faecal sludge management. The faecal sludge and excreta produced in the town are disposed of in the countryside by open defecation (34 % of households) or by manual desludging by informal latrine emptyers or periodic mechanical emptying by a contractor from Lome (350 km). However, some farmers recycle the untreated sludge in their field.

In order to improve this situation, the project activities were organized around four components:

- (i) Improved access to private toilets. The establishment of CAQs was the cornerstone of the construction mechanism. They facilitated the supply of 688 private toilets, 600 of which were constructed by private firms and 88 directly by themselves, representing progress (17%) towards the achievement of the objective of toilet coverage. Concomitantly, a microcredit mechanism was also established to support the construction mechanism. 44 of the 88 toilets constructed by the CAQ were thus completed and the credit granted to them under the micro-credit mechanism was repaid. In this way, the CAQ, now organized into a federation (FéCAQS), and headed by a woman will continue to construct toilets until they are able to reasonably achieve 100 % coverage in the neighbourhoods concerned by 2020.
- (ii) Restoration of a sustainable sludge collection and transportation services. Because of the project, the Mayor's office has a 10 m³ desludging truck. To ensure its sustainability the Mayor's office has delegated the provision of this service to FéCAQS which effectively ensures it. A private operator has also set up in Sokodé to provide the same service. Now all desludging requests from the municipality and neighbouring municipalities are covered.
- (iii) Sludge treatment and reuse. Under the project, Sokode municipality now has a faecal sludge treatment plant with a treatment capacity of 10 m³/day, which is not yet operational. The sanitation value chain loop is being closed. For reasons of sustainability, the Mayor wanted to award the operation of the FSTP to FéCQSO, a social enterprise, by delegated public service contract.

Stakeholders' capacities were built in the area of risk-free excreta management. Information on the project's implementation was also shared with them.

2. Outcome reporting

Outcome indicators (as per RLF; add more rows as needed)	Baseline value (year)	Most recent value (A)	End target(B) (expected value at project completion)	Progress towards target (% realized) (A/B)	Narrative assessment (indicative maximum length : 50 words per outcome)	Core sector indicator (Yes/No)
Outcome 1. Households in Sokode's old neighbourhoods have access to affordable and durable private toilets	36 % (2012)	42 % (2018)	70 % (2020)	60 %	In the targeted neighbourhoods, the coverage rate has significantly increased. Progress towards the target will be supported by the facilitation strategy (local actor and micro-credit) established.	Yes
Outcome 2. The faecal sludge collection and transportation service has been sustainably restored in the municipality	0 % (2012)	100 %	90 % (2020)	111 %	Two providers are operational in the town and meet all the desludging demand of the municipality and neighbouring municipalities.	Yes
Outcome 3. The faecal sludge collected is treated and reused sustainably	0 % (2012)	0	100 % (2020)	0%	The provisional acceptance of the sludge treatment plant took place on 14 July 2018. Consequently, at the time of the mission from 23 to 27 July the plant was not yet operational. However, a	Yes

Outcome indicators (as per RLF; add more rows as needed)	Baseline value (year)	Most recent value (A)	End target(B) (expected value at project completion)	Progress towards target (% realized) (A/B)	Narrative assessment (indicative maximum length : 50 words per outcome)	Core sector indicator (Yes/No)
					procedure was initiated at the Bank to extend the project to 25 September 2018	
	0 % (2012)	0	80 % (2020)	0%	After the plant's start-up	Yes

3. Output reporting

Output Indicators (as per RLF; add more rows as needed)	Most recent value (A)	End target (B) (expected value at project completion)	Progress towards target (% realized) (A/B)	Narrative assessment (indicative maximum length : 50 words per outcome)	Core sector indicator (Yes/No)
Output 1 : Improved access to private toilets					Yes
1.1.1. Number of municipality training sessions on chain management (Municipal C., Technical service)	2	2 (2017)	100%	Training sessions were organized on 11 April 2015 and 19 December 2016	Yes
1.1.2. Number of training sessions by the Municipal Sanitation Committee (CCA) on access to toilets	3	1 (2018)	300%	The first training session was organized on 19 February 2014. It was necessary to organize two other repeat sessions on 16 April 2014 and 25 March 2015.	Yes
1.1.3.1 Number of community organizations (CAQ) trained in household access to toilets	7	7 (2018)	100%	The planned training for each CAQ was carried out on schedule.	Yes
1.1.3.2 Number of women-headed CAQs	1	4 (2018)	25%	Only one CAQ is headed by a woman. However, she is the one who heads the federation because of her dynamism recognized by all.	Yes
1.1.3.3 Number of CAQ with women treasurers	7	7 (2018)	100%	Each CAQ has a woman treasurer	Yes
1.2.1. 1 Number of artisanal workers trained in toilet construction	17	10 (2018)	170%	Apart from firms, CAQs also recruited artisanal workers who were trained for the construction of the 88 additional toilets	Yes
1.2.1.2 Total number of jobs created (CAQ and private firms)	115	80 (2018)	140%	7 CAQ were established instead of the 5 planned in the PAR. This resulted in the creation of more jobs	Yes
1.2.1.3 Number of women employed (CAQ)	17	17	100%	Measures were taken by the PMU to comply with gender criteria	Yes
1.2.1.4 Number of women employed by private firms	22	(2018) 10	220%	The PMU ensured that gender criteria were complied with by private firms so that the planned number of women was exceeded.	Yes
1.2.3.1 Number of toilets constructed by firms	600	600 (2018)	100%	In relation to the original target, adjustments were made during supervision missions because of changes in technology (waterproof septic tanks) which were more expensive and led to a reduction in the targeted number of toilets	Yes

Output Indicators (as per RLF; add more rows as needed)	Most recent value (A)	End target (B) (expected value at project completion)	Progress towards target (% realized) (A/B)	Narrative assessment (indicative maximum length : 50 words per outcome)	Core sector indicator (Yes/No)
1.2.3.2 Number of toilets constructed by the CAQ	88	50 (2018)	176%	The effectiveness of the construction mechanisms established enabled the CAQ to build more toilets than had been planned.	Yes
1.3. Number of participatory monitoring and evaluation meetings held on toilet management	14	40 (2018)	35%	14 meetings were held on the following dates: 21 December 2015, 5 February 2016, 17 February 2016, 18 March 2016, 22 March 2016, 8 June 2016, 13 June 2016, 15 June 2016, 22 August 2016, 10 October 2016, 30 January 2017, 17 December 2017, 23 February 2018, 30 May 2018. This is an example of a really participatory approach aimed at regularly reporting on the progress of the activity	Yes
Output 2 :	Restoration of a sustainable collection and transportation service				
2.1.1. Number of training sessions organized by the municipality in sludge collection and transportation management	4	3(2018)	133%	The 4 training sessions were held on the following meeting dates: 19 February 2014, 16 April 2014, 25 March 2015, 30 March 2017.	Yes
2.2.1. Number of vehicles adapted for the hygienic collection of faecal sludge	2	2 (2018)	100%	1 mechanical de-sludging truck for accessible concessions. 1 motor tricycle equipped with a de-sludging pump for concessions that cannot be accessed by trucks	Yes
2.2.2. Number of community enterprises trained in faecal sludge collection and transportation	2	5 (2018)	40%	Initially 5 CAQs were planned. During implementation, the number rose to 7 based on the number of neighbourhoods covered. The 7 CAQs thus received training. The FéCAQSo, comprising 7 CAQ was trained as the delegated social enterprise for the machine operating service.	Yes
2.2.3. Quantity of sludge collected annually	750	2500 m ³ (2018)	30%	The desludging service was interrupted because of breakdowns of the truck's pumping system and socio-political unrest in 2017	Yes
2.3.1. Number of meetings of the Municipal Sanitation Committee on the collection and transportation service	1	10 (2018)	10%	CAC meetings on the implementation of the activities of each step. The de-sludging service was interrupted because of breakdowns of the truck's pumping system and socio-political unrest. The CAC was only organized once on 2 November 2016.	Yes
Output 3	Treatment of faecal sludge and reuse of treated products				
3.1. Number of training sessions organized by the Mayor's office and its relay structures (technical service, municipal council, Municipal Sanitation Committee)	0	3	0%	Plant not yet commissioned at the time of the mission	Yes
3.2.1. Number of faecal sludge treatment and valorisation plants constructed	1	1 (2018)	100%	The plant was commissioned on 14 July 2018	Yes
3.2.1.2 Number of jobs created on-site	64	25 (2018)	256%	The FSTP was constructed using a labour-intensive approach	Yes

Output Indicators (as per RLF; add more rows as needed)	Most recent value (A)	End target (B) (expected value at project completion)	Progress towards target (% realized) (A/B)	Narrative assessment (indicative maximum length : 50 words per outcome)	Core sector indicator (Yes/No)
3.2.1.3 Number of women employed by the works contractor	22	10 (2018)	220%	The PMU ensured compliance with gender criteria by the successful bidder for the FSTP works contract.	Yes
3.2.2.1 Number of training sessions for the community enterprise responsible for the plant's operation.	1	1 (2018)	100%	FéCAQSo, the delegated community enterprise was trained to operate the FSTP	Yes
3.2.2.2 Number of women employed by the plant operator	3	3 (2018)	100%	The PMU ensured compliance with gender criteria by FéCAQSo, the community enterprise delegated to operate the FSTP	Yes
3.2.3 Quantity of sludge treated in the plant	0	2000 m ³ /an (2018)	0%	Although the plant was commissioned on 14 July 2018, it was not yet operational at the time of the mission. Meanwhile, the sludge collected is deposited in a place indicated by the Mayor's office located 700 metres from the current treatment plant.	Yes
3.3.1 Duration of trials to improve product quality	0	3 months (2017)	0%	The faecal sludge treatment plant not yet operational.	Yes
3.3.2 Number of community organizations trained in Sludge treatment	0	1 (2017)	0%	The faecal sludge treatment plant not yet operational	Yes
3.3.3 Number of marketing broadcasts for treated products	0	100 (2017)	0%	The faecal sludge treatment plant not yet operational	Yes
3.4.1 Number of participatory evaluation meetings on the treatment/reuse link	0	4 (2017)	0%	The faecal sludge treatment plant not yet operational	Yes
Output 4	Sharing, Capitalisation and Project Preparation				
4.1.1 Number of project capitalisation reports	5	1 (2018)	500%	The 5 reports concern: communication, civil works, microfinance, sociology and health-related aspects	Yes
4.1.2 Number of trainees enrolled	5	2 (2018)	250%	The TAS project aroused great interest in terms of capitalisation in the following 5 areas covered by the trainees: communication, civil works, microfinance, sociology and health-related aspects	Yes
4.1.3 Number of women trainees enrolled	1	1(2018)	100%	The PMU ensured compliance with the gender criteria in the recruitment of trainees	Yes
4.2.1.1 Number of steering committee meetings	13	6 (2017)	216 %	The dates of the 13 steering committee meetings are as follows: 28 November 2013, 28 March 2014, 25 July 2014, 23 December 2014, 2 April 2015, 8 May 2015, 10 June 2015, 23 October 2015, 29 October 2015, 4 November 2015, 14 December 2015, 15 December 2015, 22 and 23 December 2015, 1 February 2016, 24 February 2016, 2 March 2016, 21 December 2016, 30 March 2017, 12 March 2018. This is an example of a really participatory approach aimed at ensuring beneficiary ownership of the project	Yes

Output Indicators (as per RLF; add more rows as needed)	Most recent value (A)	End target (B) (expected value at project completion)	Progress towards target (% realized) (A/B)	Narrative assessment (indicative maximum length : 50 words per outcome)	Core sector indicator (Yes/No)
4.2.1.2 Number of participants per SC meeting	17	17 (2018)	100%	The participatory approach promised by the PMU aroused real interest on the part of all the TAS stakeholders. This explains why they diligently attended the different SC sessions	Yes
4.2.1.3 Number of participants per ST meeting	1	5 (2018)	20%	Women's participation in decision-making meetings was not encouraged for cultural reasons in the Sokode area	Yes
4.2.2.1 Number of national sharing and policy dialogue workshops	2	2 (2017)	100%	First national sharing workshop: 8 November 2016 Commissioning of the plant and toilets: 25 June 2018	Yes
4.2.2.2 Number of participants in sharing workshops	25	50 (2018)	50%	These workshops concerned all of Togo. Not many participants came from outside Sokode	Yes
4.2.2.3 Total number of participants in sharing workshops	136	200	68%	Idem	Yes
4.3.1 Number of towns with bankable project documents	0	2 (2017)	0%	The EU-financed Water and Sanitation Project covers several towns including Tsévié, Atakpamé, Kara, Dapaong which were to be the subject of bankable project preparation studies.	Yes
Output 5	Project Management				
5.1.1 Number of people recruited	4	4 (2017)	100%	1 Coordinator 1 Civil engineer responsible for contracts 1 Accountant 1 Driver	Yes
5.2.1 Number of activity reports produced	20	16 (2017)	131%	These are the Quarterly Status Reports (QSR) for the 20 quarters from launching to the time of the mission.	No
5.3.1 Number of internal audit reports produced	0	3 (2017)	0%	The Executing Agency did not perform any internal audits contrary to its initial commitment at project appraisal	No

4. Development Objective (DO) rating

DO rating (derived from updated IPR)*	Narrative Assessment (indicative maximum length: 250 words)
3	<p>In order to ensure risk-free management of excreta in Sokode municipality, the project took measures and established mechanisms for the construction of 688 toilets. The establishment of CAQ in conjunction with the microcredit mechanism is a sustainable approach for the supply of toilets that will be sustained even after project completion.</p> <p>For the septic tank emptying step, the project acquired a 10 m³ truck and a motor tricycle equipped with a desludging pump for hard to reach areas. This equipment was leased to the FéCAQSo, a social enterprise comprising 7 CAQ.</p> <p>For the treatment step, a Faecal Sludge Treatment Plant (FSTP) with a capacity of 10 m³/day was constructed. The treated sludge will be used as a soil conditioner in agriculture with a view to generating financial resources that will supplement desludging revenue. Operation of the FSTP has been delegated to the social enterprise FéCAQSo based on a lease contract.</p> <p>Thus, the access rate to risk-free excreta management service for households in the old neighbourhood of Sokodé has risen from 30 % to 45 %.</p>

Finally, the capacities of implementation actors and public service delegates have been built up in their specific areas competence under the project. The Technical Services, for example, have acquired the capacity to prepare, award and monitor implementation of the works contract on the one hand and to supply, control and monitor the delegated sanitation services operator on the other.

5. Beneficiaries (add rows as needed)

Actual (A)	Planned (B)	Progress towards target (% realized A/B)	% women	Category (for example, farmers, students)
114,200 - Population of Sokodé	100 500	113 %	51%	Population 105 000 in 2012 114,200 in 2015 with a population growth rate of 2.16 %
4 Neighbouring communities	4	100 %		Local administration
7 CAQ	5	140 %		Initially 5 CAQ Finally 7 CAQ
1 FéCAQSO	1 Nkotchoyem	100 %	1	Social enterprise
1 Mayor's office	1 Mayor's office	100 %		Local administration
17 SC members	17 members	100%		Opinion leaders, civil leaders and traditional chiefs
4 Mayor's offices in Togo's municipalities which could draw on the example of Sokode to improve sanitation in their area	4	100% (Dapaon, Atakpamé, Tsévié, Kara under the PEAT)		EU-financed Togolese Water and Sanitation Project (PEAT)
5 trainees	1	500%	1	Student/University

6. Unanticipated or additional outcomes (add rows as needed)

Description	Type (e.g. gender, climate change, social aspect, other)	Positive or negative	Impact on project (high, medium, low)
1 – Establishment of FeCAQSo	Institutional aspect	Positive	Medium
2 – Establishment of a new private collection enterprise which financed its own desludging truck	Institutional aspect	Positive	Medium
3 – Immediate leverage effect with the financing of the European Union Project to replicate the model in Togo's 4 main regional towns (Tsévié, Atakpamé, Kara, Dapaong) and consolidation of assets in Sokodé	Financial aspect	Positive	High

7. Lessons learned related to effectiveness (add rows as needed)

Key issues (max 5, add rows if needed)	Lessons learned	Target Audience
1. Executing Agency's capacities	1.1. Confirm the technical, financial management and administrative capacities of the executing agency 1.2. Maintain project coordination by unit headed by a coordinator who is competent in the technical and managerial areas	Mayor's office Government AfDB
2. Management on force account or by service delegation along the sanitation value chain	2. The provision of risk-free excreta management services must be delegated to a private operator.	Mayor's office Government

3.Social supervision in the construction of private toilets	3. In the case of some outputs such as the supply of toilets to households, it would be efficient to delegate management to community organizations emanating from the neighbourhoods	Mayor's office Government AfDB
4.Private toilet financing mechanism	4. Sustainable and inclusive access to toilets must be backed by the establishment of a microcredit mechanism in conjunction with Lesson 3.	Mayor's office Government AfDB
5.Communication concerning project implementation	5.All forms of communication guarantees the involvement in, and ownership of the project outputs by the actors and populations	Mayor's office Government AfDB

C Efficiency

1. Timeliness

Planned project duration – years (A) (as per PAR)	Actual implementation time – years (B) (from effectiveness of 12st disbursement)	Ratio of planned and actual implementation time (A/B)	Rating*
3	5	0.6 (3/5)	2

Narrative assessment (indicative maximum length: 250 words)

Slippage on project implementation is mainly due to three factors:

1. Procedural conflict. Indeed, while the grant agreement clearly stipulates that the applicable procedures are those of the Bank, the Executing Agency wanted to apply its own for certain procurements. This resulted in a four month delay in the fulfilment of conditions precedent to first disbursement and nine months for the recruitment process for the consultant who was to be responsible for studies, training and project implementation;
2. Repeated misunderstandings between the study supervisor and executing agency and the unavailability of the mission leader for long periods on medical grounds;
3. The failure to rigorously apply procurement procedures for works contracts, in particular successive extensions instead of penalties for delay.

2. Resource use efficiency

Median percentage physical implementation of RLF outputs financed by all financiers (A) (see II.B.3)	Commitment rate (%) (B) (see Table 1.C – Total commitment rate of all financiers)	Ratio of the median percentage physical implementation and commitment rate (A/B)	Rating*
117%	92.09%	127 %	4

Narrative assessment (indicative max. length: 250 words)

The slippage on implementation of the original schedule impacted negatively on the disbursement rate. However, the project was almost entirely implemented with the planned resources.

3. Cost-benefit analysis

Economic rate of return (at appraisal)	Updated economic rate of return (at completion)	Rating*
NA	NA	

Narrative assessment (indicative max. length: 250 words)

Implementation of the sanitation value chain steps generates benefit flows that have a positive impact on the economy of Sokode municipality. Indeed, on the one hand, the construction of toilets backed by the microcredit mechanism generates financial flows that will allow the self-construction of new toilets until full coverage is achieved provided the mechanism is maintained.

On the other hand, restoration of the sustainable collection and transportation service through the purchase of a new desludging truck and delegation of the desludging service to a social enterprise also creates benefit flows. Now the desludging service is provided immediately upon the client's request at CFAF 18,000 compared to desludging after at least a one month wait when the truck came from Lomé (350km).

Furthermore, operationalisation of the faecal sludge treatment plant will result in the treatment of all the sludge from Sokodé and the annual production of about 5,000 tonnes of compost annually, which will benefit the green economy.

Finally, as a result of the project, 7 community enterprises, service providers for the supply of family toilets employing 35 people including 17 women and 1 municipal firm being formalized to provide the faecal sludge collection and treatment service have been created. These 8 enterprises initiated by the project have achieved a turnover of CFAF 56.81 million in one year of operations.

4. Implementation progress (IP)

IP rating (derived from updated IPR) *	Narrative comments (commenting specifically on those IP items that were rated unsatisfactory or highly unsatisfactory, as per last IPR). (indicative max. length : 500 mots)
3	The project's implementation progress is satisfactory despite some delays

5. Lessons learned related to efficiency

Key issues (max 5, add rows as needed)	Lessons learned	Target audience
1. Regarding the delay in execution of works contracts	<p>1.1. Training sessions in procurement at project launch must be designed and dispensed taking into account the experience of the executing agency. Their duration must be reviewed accordingly.</p> <p>1.2. Supervision missions during the first year of implementation must be provided by full teams (project leader, procurement, financial management and disbursement experts)</p>	Mayor's office Government AfDB
2. Regarding the cost-benefit ratio of such a project	2.1. Conduct economic studies to determine the ERR of risk-free excreta management of the on-site sanitation sub-sector, especially as this project generates a significant flow of benefits	Mayor's office Government AfDB

1. Financial sustainability

Rating*	Narrative assessment (indicative max. length: 250 words)
3	<p>The financial sustainability of the risk-free excreta management sub-sector of Sokode municipality is first analysed from the standpoint of each step’s financial sustainability.</p> <p>Thus, for the toilet step, the financing mechanism established and tested resulted in the construction of 680 toilets with each household contributing ¼ of the CFAF 400,000 of the toilet’s cost. In other words, the repayment by three households makes it possible to finance another household. Thus, the repayment of the 600 toilets financed by the project will in time finance the construction of an additional 798 toilets out of a potential 4000 toilets. This constitutes a limitation of the mechanism in the absence of fresh contributions of financial resources. This situation would be exacerbated if PEAT in SOKODE maintained the household contribution at CFAF 30,000 instead of CFAF 100,000. In order to avoid this, the municipality proposes to advocate in favour of an alignment of the project with the TAS mechanism. In the field, the CAQ proposes to carry out advocacy actions for households.</p> <p>For the collection component, the Mayor’s office has delegated this service on a leasing contract to FéCAQSo which carried out desludging at a unit price of CFAF 18,000 which should generate estimated potential revenue of CFAF 4,500,000 per year. This should help to cover at least the operating costs of FéCAQSo, which is a social enterprise.</p> <p>For the treatment step, the Mayor wants a charge to be made for disposal at the treatment plant. The cost will be fixed by municipal order following a pricing study to minimize the upward impacts on the cost of the desludging. The marketing of treated sludge as organic fertilizer will also contribute to the generation of additional financial resources that will help to fix an affordable disposal cost and cover the FSTP’s operating costs.</p> <p>Finally, the financial sustainability of each step will be strengthened by possible equalization among them since the Mayor’s office has delegated all the sanitation services to FéCAQ whose members are also responsible for the toilet construction step. Thus, the contribution of additional resources as required under the toilet construction step could come from the other steps in the form of easily repayable loans because of the proven efficiency of that step’s micro-credit mechanism.</p>

2. Institutional sustainability and strengthening of capacities

Rating*	Narrative assessment (indicative max. length, 250 words)
3	<p>As the project owner, the Mayor’s office’s capacities have been strengthened in terms of equipment and infrastructure for risk-free excreta management in the municipality. The project has also built the capacity of the municipality’s Technical Department (STM) and provided it with manuals and tools to monitor and control delegated services.</p> <p>For the toilet construction step, the CAQ, which is an emanation of the neighbourhood, is recognized by the community because of the key role it was called upon to play in the supply of toilets, which represented real social demand. This exercise also allowed the CAQ to become both a real manager and a social enterprise for the delivery of toilets to households. This social guarantee was supplemented by the microcredit mechanism, which contributed to the facilitation of household participation in the financing of its own toilet. These factors have made a strong contribution to the sustainability of the CAQs which is further strengthened by their consolidation into an FéCAQSo.</p> <p>Indeed, the FéCAQSo is a real social enterprise to which faecal sludge collection, transportation and treatment services have been delegated. Since desludging has also been extended to neighbouring municipalities, FéCAQSo’s volume of activity will be high. Under these conditions, its institutional sustainability will depend solely on its capacity to provide the service professionally. FéCAQSo has acquired this capacity by building the project PMU’s capacity.</p>

3. Ownership and sustainability of partnerships

Rating*	Narrative assessment (indicative max. length: 250 words)
3	<p>The SC met 14 times during the four years of project implementation and on each occasion a quorum was constituted without any financial inducement to its members. The SC was the appropriate space for project orientation and adjustment. Adaptation of the toilets to the socio-cultural and religious customs of the population was one example of this. On the other hand, the space was less appropriate for decisions on technical documents. The alternative to this shortcoming was the establishment of a Technical Committee comprising the technical structures of central government. Its sustainability should be strengthened following its official establishment by prefectural order.</p> <p>The Municipal Sanitation Committee (CAC) met 14 times on the issue of access to toilets, once on the issue of collection and never on the issue of treatment. Indeed, the CAC meetings are linked to implementation of the project activities. This explains the irregularity of the meetings correlated with the interruption of the faecal sludge collection and desludging service on the one hand and the commissioning of the treatment plant on project completion, on the other. The CAC was the preferred space for resolving technical and operational problems including adoption of the different microcredit management tools. In this case too, strengthening of its sustainability will require its official establishment by prefectural order.</p> <p>The CAQ was the very local and appropriate structure to facilitate the procurement of toilets for households. The sustainability of CAQ's relationships with households is guaranteed by its ability to meet this real social demand. It is strengthened by the involvement of the traditional chiefdom in the process as a social guarantee of repayments, compliance with decisions, etc. However, this partnership could be weakened by the occurrence of conflictual relations between the CAQ and the Neighbourhood Development Committee (CDQ). However, this risk could be mitigated by the existence of a mechanism for the endogenous settlement of conflicts by the traditional chiefdom.</p> <p>Pursuant to the principle of the separation of roles, it was appropriate for the municipality to delegate to the CAQ then to FéCAQSo, under a lease contract the risk-free excreta management services. In that area, the conditions for sustainability are, traditionally, compliance with mutual obligations, which require greater competency and professionalism on the part of the private operator. The project has endeavoured to achieve this. The municipality's main objective in this case is to mobilize more financial resources for investment in order to achieve and maintain a 100% access rate for households to risk-free excreta management services. As a result, the volume of activity will grow and increase profitability, which is a reason for forging closer ties between the municipality and delegatee.</p> <p>In short, apart from the official public private partnership between the municipality and FéCAQSo, the other partnerships were established on the basis of voluntary work of members who were actively involved for four years. As a result, these partnerships will continue to exist after the project's completion if the municipality maintains them by fully playing its role as project owner for which it was strengthened by the project.</p>

4. Environmental and social sustainability

Rating*	Narrative assessment (indicative max. length : 250 words)
3	<p>In accordance with the Bank's 2001 environmental and social procedures, the TAS project was classified in Category 2, 2, and is, therefore, likely to generate negative environmental and social affects that could be minimized by the application of mitigation measures.</p> <p>An Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) along with an Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP) was carried out.</p> <p><u>On the environmental component</u></p> <p>Development of the 2 by 4 ha. site required clearing of the grass cover and removal of a few tree roots. In accordance with the ESMP at least two mitigation measures were taken: (i) compensatory afforestation with 1000 seedlings comprising an arboretum with natural and decorative species on the plant site; (ii) the development of a market garden plot inside the site which is not only intended to maintain a minimum of plant cover but also to provide additional revenue for the plant's operation (contribution to the green economy) and reduce the costs of services provided to the households.</p> <p>There was also a plan to promote organic enrichment of farmland with the treated products as a strategy to improve the productivity of smallholders as a climate change adaptation strategy in view of the weak productivity of Togolese agriculture due, in particular, to low soil fertility. This will also help to further promote the green economy in the municipality's surrounding areas.</p>

<p>It is also worth mentioning the gradual coverage of households with toilets which, in time, will eradicate the faecal peril. Similarly, the proper management of faecal sludge by collecting it with appropriate means and its treatment and valorisation will have a beneficial environmental impact.</p> <p><u>On the social component</u></p> <p>It is necessary to mention the construction of a standpipe, which will help to end the drudgery for girls of fetching drinking water in the dry season in villages close to the FSTP.</p> <p>It is also worth recalling the 8 social enterprises that were established, 7 CAQ and 1 FéCAQSo. These 8 enterprises provide 52 jobs including 17 for women for the toilet construction step (35 members of 7 CAQ and 17 artisanal workers recruited), for the desludging step, 3 jobs created by FeCAQSO, for the treatment and valorisation step and 3 jobs created by FeCAQSO.</p>
--

5. Lessons learned related to sustainability

Key issues (max. 5, add rows as needed)	Lessons learned	Target audience
1. Regarding the total or partial recovery of costs in the non-collective sanitation value chains	<p>1.1. The use of microcredit facilitates the financial participation of all households in the acquisition and payment of desludging services.</p> <p>1.2. Delegation to private operators will, in time, ensure the collection and treatment of all sludge.</p> <p>1.3: Valorisation of all the treated sludge for market gardening will help to generate additional resources that will contribute to the partial or total coverage of the operation of the on-site sanitation sub-sector.</p>	Sokodé Mayor's office Ministry Bank
2.Regarding the capacity of the social enterprise to sustainably provide sanitation services	2.1. Capacity building in conjunction with the creation of an enabling business environment will strengthen the institutional sustainability of a social enterprise to provide on-site sanitation services.	Sokodé Mayor's office Ministry Bank
3. Regarding the environmental impact of on-site sanitation	<p>3.1. The valorisation of treated sludge for agriculture is a climate change adaptation strategy for smallholders</p> <p>3.2. The end of open-air defecation and disposal of faecal sludge will help to improve water and soil quality</p> <p>3.3 The preservation of water and soil quality will help to mitigate the impact on health of the faecal peril</p>	Sokodé Mayor's office Ministry Bank
4. Regarding the structures established under the project	<p>4. The establishment of appropriate structures and mechanisms to strengthen partnerships and generate mutual benefits will help to maintain the partnership as long as its purpose remains unchanged.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Example of the CAQ-Households partnership. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Appropriate structure: social enterprise, CAQ ✓ Partnership strengthening mechanism: micro-credit, involvement of the customary chiefdom ✓ Mutual benefit: toilets for the households and social recognition for the CAQ 	Sokodé Mayor's office Ministry Bank

A Relevance

1. Bank performance

Rating*	Narrative assessment by the Borrower on the Bank’s performance (both quantitative and qualitative, based on available information). See guidance note on issues to cover. (indicative max. length : 250 words)	
3	<p>The project owner considers the quantity and quality of project implementation supervision and monitoring by the Bank highly satisfactory. The same applies to responsiveness in the handling of disbursements as well as rapidity and efficiency in providing capacity building.</p> <p>However, the project owner considers that the influence of all the AWF procedures on the project is mixed. The reason given is the delay in the payment of invoices, which was often made three weeks after their presentation. This is only an impression since the contractual payment period is 60 days.</p> <p>Moreover, despite the organisation of two fiduciary clinics to build administrative and financial capacities, the executing agency finds the Bank’s procedure cumbersome.</p>	
Comments to be inserted by the Bank on its own performance (both qualitative and quantitative, based on available information). See guidance note on issues to cover. (indicative max. length: 250 words)		
<p>The Bank fielded 9 supervision missions. Two of them were used to organize fiduciary clinics. There were regular e-mail and telephone exchanges.</p> <p>This permanent contact contributed to the necessary and timely refocusing of the project’s technical and financial activities. These visits also fostered the commitment of the direct project actors to assume ownership of it.</p> <p>In all, the recipient submitted 42 approval requests (NOO) throughout the entire project cycle. All these requests were processed in a timely manner to the recipient’s satisfaction.</p>		
Key issues (related to Bank performance, max. 5, add rows as needed)	Lessons learned	
1. Regarding the regularity of project monitoring by the Bank (field mission, communications)	1. As a result of the permanent contact between the Bank and the Executing Agency/Project Coordination Unit difficulties that might occur during project implementation will be more effectively resolved.	

2. Borrower performance

Rating*	Narrative assessment on the Borrower performance (both quantitative and qualitative, depending on the available information). See guidance note on issues to cover. (indicative max. length : 250 words)	
	<p>Despite the shortcomings and difficulties that were sources of delay, the project's physical implementation rate reached 100%. The shortcomings include the failure to devolve the responsibilities of the Executing Agency (Plan-Togo) at the level of Sokodé in spite of the existence of a local office which was, however, a strong argument in its selection as Executing Agency. This was a reason for delay in project implementation. It did, however, meet its commitment to ensure the timely provision of its financial counterparty.</p> <p>The Sokodé Mayor's office also ensured the timely positioning of its financial counterpart and took measures for the sustainability of the project outcomes by delegating the sludge collection and faecal sludge treatment plant operation services to a social enterprise. The Mayor's office also strengthened its technical department to provide monitoring and control of delegated services, among others.</p> <p>For their part, the PCU and SCs correctly implemented the project monitoring and evaluation system. More generally, compliance with, and responsiveness to the recommendations made following the Bank's supervision missions enabled the PCU to successfully implement the project despite the delay observed.</p> <p>At the central level, the Ministry of Water and Village Hydraulics (MEHV) facilitated, among others, referral to the Bank regarding the implementation of procedures to request an extension to the project completion period. However, the lack of harmonisation in Sokode between PEAT and TTS, reflected in a household contribution of CFAF 30,000 instead of CFAF 100,000, could compromise the sustainability of the TAS mechanism.</p>	
Key issues (related to Borrower performance, max 5; add extra rows as needed)		Lessons learned
1. Regarding the selection of the Executing Agency		1. Improved assessment and verification of the technical and administrative and financial management performances of the structure selected to play the role of executing agency.
2. Regarding the harmonisation of TFP operations in accordance with the Paris Declaration		2. Lack of consistency between donor interventions in the same area weaken project sustainability measures

3. Performance of other stakeholders

Rating*	Narrative assessment on the performance of other stakeholders, including cofinanciers, contractors and service providers. See guidance note on issues to be covered. (indicative max. length: 250 words)	
3	<p>The communication and sharing of information fostered ownership of the project by civil society organizations and opinion leaders who played a catalytic role in project implementation.</p> <p>On the other hand, the contractors (toilet and FSTP works) were deficient since they accumulated considerable delay in works implementation. However, the arrangements made between stakeholders ensured the completion of all works and delivery of all goods and services.</p> <p>The CAQ were the cornerstone for implementation of the project's access to toilets component. They efficiently played their role of intermediary (Sensitization on involvement, Monitoring of toilet construction, monitoring of toilet use, Repayment, recovery in 3/7 days, Sensitisation on general neighbourhood hygiene) between households and the project. Because of this success, the municipality delegated to their federation (FéCAQSo) desludging and sludge treatment services.</p> <p>On the other hand, there was a misunderstanding between the Ecopsis-Hydrobat Group and the PCU regarding the operationalization of the participatory process in the project's implementation. The controlled operationalization which is timesaving and preferred by the consulting firm was compared with the empowerment and initiative-taking approach of the community organization proposed by the PCU. Furthermore, the Mission Leader of the Consulting Firm was often unavailable on medical grounds.</p> <p>It was against this difficult backdrop that the contract expired without being extended in time by the Executing Agency. Continuation required the signing of another contract with the Bank's approval but the service provider preferred not to continue in view of the difficulties experienced by the partnership.</p>	

Key issues (related to performance of other stakeholders, 5 max.; add other rows as needed)	Lessons learned (max 5)	Target audience (for lessons learned)
1. Regarding project ownership by the SC and chiefdom and in general by the beneficiaries	1. Information sharing on the project by adequate communication improves the performance of civil service actors in their participation in the project's implementation	Bank Mayor's Office
2. Contractor performance	1. In the NOO context, the splitting of each works and study contract into several lots facilitates their execution by contractors and consulting firms. 2. Strict application of the procurement rules ensures the recruitment of the best contractors and obliges them to meet their commitments	Bank Mayor's Office

IV Summary of key lessons learned and recommendations

1. Key lessons learned

Key issues (max 5; add extra rows as needed)	Key lessons learned	Target audience
1. Regarding total or partial recovery of costs in the on-site sanitation value chain	1.1. The use of microcredit facilitates the financial participation of all households in the procurement and payment of desludging services 1.2. Delegation to private operators will in time improve the collection and treatment of all sludge. 1.3: Valorisation of all the treated sludge for market gardening will help to generate additional resources that will contribute to the partial or total coverage of the operation of the on-site sanitation sub-sector.	Sokode Mayor's Office Ministry Bank
2. Regarding the capacity of a social enterprise to sustainably provide sanitation services	2.1. Capacity building in conjunction with the creation of an enabling business environment will strengthen the institutional sustainability of a social enterprise to provide on-site sanitation services.	Sokode Mayor's Office Ministry Bank
3. Regarding the project's environmental impact	3.1. Valorisation of treated sludge for agriculture is a climate change adaptation strategy for smallholders 3.2. The end of open-air defecation and disposal of faecal sludge will help to improve water and soil quality 3.3 The preservation of water and soil quality will help to mitigate the impact on health of the faecal peril	Sokode Mayor's Office Ministry Bank

4.Regarding the sustainability of structures established under the project	<p>4. The establishment of appropriate structures and mechanisms to strengthen partnerships and generate mutual benefits will help to maintain the partnership as long as its purpose remains unchanged.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Example of the CAQ-Households partnership. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Appropriate structure: social enterprise, CAQ ✓ Partnership strengthening mechanism: micro-credit, involvement of the customary chiefdom ✓ Mutual benefit: toilets for the households and social recognition for the CAQ 	Sokodé Mayor's Office Ministry Bank
5. Regularity of project monitoring by the Bank (field mission, communications)	5. As a result of the permanent contact between the Bank and the Executing Agency/Project Coordination Unit difficulties that might occur during project implementation will be more efficiently resolved.	Bank

2. Key recommendations (with particular emphasis on ensuring the sustainability of project benefits)

Key issues (max. 10, add rows as needed)	Key recommendation	Responsible	Deadline
1.Delegatee's (FéCAQSo) mastery of the plant's operation	Recruit an individual consultant with excellent knowledge of the project to consolidate the project benefits in particular sludge treatment and valorisation	Mayor's Office	From 25 September 2018
3. Sharing of project results	The TAS project integrating all the stages of risk-free excreta management is the first of its kind in West Africa. Results may be capitalized on in different appropriate forms	Bank	2019
3. Achieve 100% risk-free excreta management coverage in Sokodé	3.1. Continue to establish Neighbourhood Sanitation Commitments in areas not covered by the project	Mayor's Office	2019
	3.2. Support FéCAQSo to ensure it becomes increasingly efficient in the provision of sanitation services to SOKODE	Mayor's Office	2019
	3.3. Take measures (municipal order) regulating sanitation in the town of Sokode (type of toilets, procurement mechanism, desludging operating system, sludge treatment and valorisation, levy, etc.)	Mayor's Office	2019
4. Replicability in the other municipalities	4. Adopt the TAS approach in on-site sanitation policies in Togo. The salient features of the TAS approach are capacity building, empowerment and initiative taking of community organizations in the implementation of the participatory process	Ministry responsible for sanitation	2019

V Overall PCR rating

Dimensions and criteria	Rating*
DIMENSION A: RELEVANCE	3
Relevance of development objective (II.A.1)	3
Relevance of project design (II.A.2)	3
DIMENSION B: EFFECTIVENESS	3
Development Objective (DO) (II.B.4)	3
DIMENSION C : EFFICIENCY	3
Timeliness (II.C.1)	2
Resource use efficiency (II.C.2)	4
Cost-benefit analysis (II.C.3)	
Implementation progress (IP) (II.C.4)	3
DIMENSION D: SUSTAINABILITY	3
Financial sustainability (II.D.1)	3
Institutional sustainability and strengthening of capacities (II.D.2)	3
Ownership and sustainability of partnerships (II.D.3)	3
Environmental and social sustainability (II.D.4)	3
OVERALL PROJECT COMPLETION RATING	3

VI Acronyms and abbreviations

Acronym <i>(add rows as needed)</i>	Full name
CAC	<i>Municipality Sanitation Committee</i>
CAQ	<i>Neighbourhood Sanitation Committee</i>
FéCAQSo	<i>Federation of Sokode Neighbourhood Sanitation Committees</i>
FSTP	<i>Faecal Sludge Treatment Plant</i>
PAR	<i>Project Appraisal Report</i>
PCR	<i>Project Completion Report</i>
PCU	<i>Project Coordination Unit</i>
SC	<i>Steering Committee</i>
STM	<i>Municipal Technical Department</i>
TAS	<i>Toilets for All in Sokode</i>