

# PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

## A. PROJECT DATA AND KEY DATES

### I. BASIC INFORMATION

<b>Project Number</b>	<b>Project Name</b>	<b>Country(ies)</b>	
	Firewood Project – Phase II	REPUBLIC OF BENIN	
<b>ID Number of all Lending Instrument(s)</b>		<b>Department</b>	<b>Environmental Classification</b>
Loan		Forestry	Category II
<b>Original Commitment Amount</b>	<b>Amount Cancelled</b>	<b>Amount Disbursed</b>	<b>Percent Disbursed</b>
UA 10 million		UA 8.34 million	83.36%
<b>Borrower</b>			
Government of the Republic of Benin			
<b>Executing Agency(ies)</b> [List the main Ministries, Project Implementation Units, Agencies and civil society organizations responsible for implementing project activities.]			
Ministry of the Environment and Nature Protection /Project Management Unit (to be completed)			
<b>Co-financers and other External Partners</b> [List all other sources and amounts of financing, technical assistance or other resources used in this project]			
The project was financed jointly by the ADF and the Government of Benin in the amounts of UA 10 million and UA 1.75 million respectively. The project recruited a Technical Assistant for 24 months, whereas the expected duration indicated in the appraisal report was 60 months (or the total duration of the project). There were no other external partners.			

### II. KEY DATES

Project Concept Note Cleared by Ops. Com.	Appraisal Report Cleared	Board Approval	
NA	At the time when Ops. Com. did not clear the document	31 December 2001	
Restructuring(s)			
	Original Date MM/DD/YY	Actual Date MM/DD/YY	Difference in months
EFFECTIVENESS	June 2002	December 2002	7
MID-TERM REVIEW	June 2004	July 2008	48
CLOSING	30 June 2008	31 March 2011	33

### III. RATINGS SUMMARY

Insert notes from the relevant tables in the different sections of the PCR. For example, please insert the “Overall Output score” in Section D.I. in the “Achievement of Outputs” box below.

CRITERIA	SUB-CRITERIA	RATING
PROJECT OUTCOME	Achievement of Outputs	3
	Achievement of Outcomes	3
	Timeliness	0
	OVERALL PROJECT OUTCOME <i>1</i>	3
BANK PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	3
	Supervision	3
	OVERALL BANK PERFORMANCE	3
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness)	4
	Implementation	2
	OVERALL BORROWER PERFORMANCE	3

### IV. BANK STAFF RESPONSIBLE

POSITIONS	AT APPROVAL	AT COMPLETION
Regional Director		
Sector Director		Mr. Abdirahman BEILEH
Task Manager		Mr. Abdoulaye DAGAMAISSE, Forestry Expert, OSAN.4
PCR Team Leader		Mr. Léandre GBELI, Principal Agro - economist, OSAN.4,
PCR Team Members		Mr. Vaïdjoua GUINEO, Rural Development Expert, TDFO

## B. PROJECT CONTEXT

Summarize the rationale for Bank assistance. State:

- what development challenge the project addresses,
- the Borrower's overall strategy for addressing it,
- Bank activities in this country(ies) and sector over the past year and how they performed, and
- ongoing Bank and other externally financed activities that complement, overlap with or relate to this project.

Please cite relevant sources. Comment on the strength and coherence of the rationale.

**[300 words maximum.** Any additional narrative about the project's origins and history, if needed, must be placed in Annex 6: Project Narrative]

The diminishing forest cover resulting from anthropic pressure and farming systems is a serious threat to Benin's ecological balance. Indeed, in the absence of alternative domestic energy supply sources, 80% of Benin's population cooks with firewood and charcoal. Faced with the threat against natural formations and the ever-increasing fuel wood demand in Southern Benin towns, the Government requested the Bank to finance the Firewood Plantation project in Southern Benin aimed at covering the fuel-wood needs of 28,000 families. The Bank financed the Fire Wood Plantation project in Southern Benin (PLR) involving the opening of rural plantations which was concluded in 1998. By the end of the PBF, 10,175 ha of plantations were opened, of which 5,374 ha were State plantations and 4,801 ha were rural plantations belonging to individuals. Given the success of the PBF, the Government requested the second phase of the fire wood project. Currently, the Bank is financing the community forest management support project. It is also funding the forestry sector review being carried out by FAO.

## C. PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

### 1. State the Project Development Objective(s) (as set out in the appraisal report)

The project's sector goal is to reduce poverty through sustainable management of forest resources. The project's specific objective is to improve fuel-wood demand and supply balance and promote alternative energy sources.

### 2. Describe the major project components and indicate how each will contribute to achieving the Project Development Objective(s).

The project was implemented through four components: Component A: Development of sustainable production, with three sub-components. This component contributes to the attainment of the objectives through its activities: (i) organization of the wood energy sub-sector; and (ii) development of protected forests and promotion of village reforestation. Component B: Promotion of alternative energy and energy saving which involves: promotion of the use of gas and kerosene and dissemination of improved stoves based on credit facilities. Component C: Supporting measures: conduct of IEC and capacity building activities for the benefit of the sub-sector actors, support of forestry, silviculture and agro-forestry research. Component D: Project management: organization of the project activity planning and monitoring-evaluation process, and of project impact monitoring.

### 3. Provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) of the project objectives along the following 3 dimensions. Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.

PROJECT OBJECTIVES DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT	WORKING SCORE
RELEVANT	a) Relevant to the country's development priorities	Bank intervention is consistent with (i) the "Benin Alafia 2025 Vision"; (ii) the country's Strategic Development Orientations (OSD; 2006-2011); (iii) the Growth Strategy for Poverty Reduction (SCR3); (iv) the National Land Use Policy	3

		Statement (DEPONAT); (v) the forestry policy formulated in 1994 and relevant action in terms of Government's priorities as well as the Bank strategy, which in turn is in line with the National Policy Plan (1998-2002) National Orientation Plan (1998-2002) which emphasizes, among other aspects, the development of short-and medium-term forestry products. Finally, the PBFII is essentially the continuation of a previous ADB-funded project (PBFI), whose gains are intended to preserve and consolidate.	
<b>ACHIEVABLE</b>	b) Objectives could in principle be achieved with the project inputs and in the expected timeframe	The project objectives are considered achievable, but the Borrower did not recruit project staff in time for implementation. Concerning the inter-sector aspects, Bank conditions relative to the profile of the energy expert were difficult to difficult to meet.	3
<b>COHERENTS</b>	c) Consistent with the Bank's country or regional strategy	The project objectives are in line with Bank strategy for the country.	3
	d) Consistent with the Bank's corporate priorities	The project is consistent with the Bank's general priorities of development and poverty reduction.	4

**4. Summarize the log. frame. If a log. frame does not exist, complete the table below, indicating the overall project development objective, the major components of the project, the major activities of each component and their expected outputs, outcomes, and indicators for measuring the achievement of outcomes. Add additional rows for components, activities, outputs or outcomes if needed.**

COMPONENTS	ACTIVITIES	OUTCOMES	EXPECTED OUTPUTS	MEASURABLE INDICATORS
Component 1: DEVELOPMENT OF SUSTAINABLE PRODUCTION	Activity 1: Carry out the national forestry inventory.	Outcome 1: A national forestry inventory is carried out	Output 1: 90% of the forestry resources potential is known	. Inventory report, availability of forestry inventory results.
	Activity 2: Organize the fuel wood sub-sector	Outcome 2: the fuel wood sub-sector is organized	Output 2: 30 rural wood markets are set up and cater to one-third of the fuel wood needs of urban centres; 50 cooperatives of lumberjacks, charcoal makers, beekeepers and transporters are operational.	(i) Number of operational rural markets, (ii) number of operational vocational organizations.
	Activity 3: Provide participatory development plan for 5,174 ha of forests.	Outcome 3: 5,174 ha of forests are provided with a participatory management plan.	Output 3: 5 State plantations are provided with a management plan	Number of plantations with a participatory management plan.

	Activity 4: Provide private forests with a simplified management plan E	Outcome 4: Private forests are provided with a simplified management plan	Output 4: 1,000 ha of private forests are provided with a simplified management plan	Number of private plantations provided with a simplified management plan
	Activity 5: Develop Wood Supply Master Plans on basis of forestry inventory and consumer surveys.	Outcome 5: Wood Supply Master Plans are developed from a forestry inventory and consumer surveys	5 Output 5: 8 Wood Supply Master Plans developed from a forestry inventory and consumer surveys	Number of Master Plans developed, results of forestry inventory and consumer surveys are available.
	Activity 6: Development of protected forests	Outcome 6: Protected forests are developed	Output 6: 30,000 ha of protected forests are developed	Number of hectares of protected forests developed
	Activity 7: Promote village reforestation	Outcome 7: Village and private reforestation is promoted.	Output 7: 3,000 ha of village and private reforestation are planted.	Number of hectares of village and private reforestation planted.
	Activity 8 : Management of State forests	Outcome 8 : State forests are managed	Output 8: 5,000 ha of State forests are sustainably managed (revision and implementation of the Participatory Forest Management Plan, PAPP).	
Component 2: PROMOTION OF ALTERNATIVE ENERGY AND ENERGY SAVING	Activity 1: Promote alternative energy sources (gas, kerosene, solar - thermal and photovoltaic) through credit facilities and increased sensitization of the people and their organizations.	Outcome 1: Alternative energy sources (gas, kerosene, solar – thermal and photovoltaic) are popularized; people and their organizations are sensitized.	Output 1: 20 Promoters of alternative energy-related micro-projects have credit.	Number of alternative energy-related micro-projects.

	Activity 2: Support the production and distribution of improved stoves	Outcome 2: Promotion and distribution of improved stoves are supported.	Output 2: 30 micro-project promoters have credit to distribute 2,500 improved stoves.	(i) Number of promoters granted credit; (ii) number of stoves distributed.
	Activity 3: Finance, through credit, the production and distribution of improved stoves.	Outcome 3: The production and distribution of improved stoves are financed through credit.	Output 3: 2,500 improved stoves are produced and distributed.	Number of improved stoves produced and distributed.
Component 3: SUPPORTING MEASURES	Activity 1: Introduce fiscal and sub-sector control regulation reform.	Outcome 1: Fiscal and sub-sector control regulation reform is introduced.	Output 1: Two basic instruments are prepared and adopted.	
	Activity 2: Grant credit for production and marketing activities to farmers and their cooperatives (nurseries, private plantations, sale of alternative energy products).	Outcome 2: Credit is granted to farmers and their cooperatives for the marketing of their produce and financing of their activities (nurseries, sale of alternative energy products).	Output 2: Credit amounting to CFAF 589,657,490 is granted to farmers and their organizations.	(i) Amount of credit granted; (ii) Number of credit granted.
	Activity 3: Carry out information, education and communication (IEC) activities for the benefit of the sub-sector's actors in villages; produce and distribute brochures on various themes relating to the sustainable management of fuel wood, the environmental education, the MRB, the fight against HIV/AIDS, hygiene and sanitation, etc.	Outcome 3: information, education and communication activities are carried out for the benefit of the sub-sector's actors in villages; brochures are produced and disseminated.	Output 3: Three hundred (300) villages are reached annually by means information, education and communication activities.	Number of villages reached; Number of brochures produced.
	Activity 4: Ensure capacity building for all actors of the project.	Outcome 4: Capacity building is ensured for all actors of the project.	Output 4: 90% of the training programme is implemented.	Number of actors trained.

	Activity 5: Carry out forestry and agro-forestry and alternative energy research in specialized research centres and institutes.	Outcome 5: Forestry and agro-forestry and alternative energy research is carried out in research centres and institutes specialized in these areas.	Output 5: Four Institutes/NGOs signed research agreements on various topics (tree species, forestry and agro-forestry, energy saving and carbonization).	Number of agreements signed, research findings available.
	Activity 6: Build social infrastructure	Outcome 6 : Social infrastructure is built	Output 6: 8 modules of 3 classrooms, 2 village health units and 51 km of feeder roads are built.	Number of modules and classrooms; number of village health units and length of feeder roads built.
Component 4: PROJECT MANAGEMENT	Activity 1: Put project staff in place.	Outcome 1: The project staff is put in place.	Output 1: The project management staff is composed of: a project manager, a monitoring-evaluation officer, the administrative and financial director, the principal technical adviser, two sub-sector coordinators, and three heads of agencies.	The project staff is available.
	Activity 2: Build the headquarters, agencies, offices/ housing units	Outcome 2: The project headquarters, agencies, offices/and housing are built.	Output 2: A headquarters, three agencies, 10 offices/ housing units are built.	Nature and number of available infrastructure.
	Activity 3: Procure equipment and material necessary for the components.	Outcome 3: Equipment and material are procured.	Output 3: 2 vehicles, 3 motorcycles and equipment procured.	The vehicles and equipment are available.
	Recruit the Principal Technical Adviser (CPT)	Outcome 4: The CPT is recruited	Output 4: A CPT is recruited; he assumed duty in 2002	The CPT is available

**5. For each dimension of the log. frame, provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) of the extent to which the log. frame achieved the following. Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1. If no log. frame exists, score this section as a 1 (one).**

LOG. FRAME DIMENSIONS	ASSESSMENT	WORKING SSCORE
-----------------------	------------	----------------

<b>LOGICAL</b>	a) Presents a logical causal chain for achieving the project development objectives	The logical framework clearly provides for activities to achieve the objectives.	4
<b>MEASURABLE</b>	b) Expresses objectives and outcomes in a way that is measurable and quantifiable	The logical framework sets out objectives and quantifiable outcomes.	4
<b>THOROUGH</b>	c) States the risks and key assumptions	The logical framework does not clearly mention risks.	2

## D. OUTPUTS AND OUTCOMES

### I. ACHIEVEMENT OF OUTPUTS

In the table below, assess the achievement of actual vs. expected outputs for each major activity. Import the expected outputs from the log. frame in Section C. Score the extent to which the expected outputs were achieved. Weight the scores by the activities' approximate share of project costs. Weighted scores are auto-calculated by the computer. The overall output score must be calculated as the sum of the weighted scores. Override the calculated score, if desired, and provide justification.

MAJOR ACTIVITIES		Working Score	Share of Project Costs in percentage (as stated in Appraisal Report)	Weighted Score
Expected Outputs	Actual Outputs			
1.Component A: Sustainable Production Development: (i) The national forestry inventory compiled; (ii) the fuel-wood sub-sector is organized; (iii) 5,174 ha of forests are provided with participatory management plans; (iv) private forests are provided with simplified management plans; (v) wood supply master plans are developed from forestry inventory and consumer surveys; (vi) protected forests are developed; (vii) village and private reforestation is promoted; (viii) State forests are managed.	(i) The forestry inventory is compiled (100%); (ii) 86 rural wood markets are set up (217%) and 65 are operational; 43 cooperatives of woodcutters, charcoal makers, beekeepers and transporters are operational (86%); (iii) 4 State plantations have been provided with participatory management plans; (iv) 0 ha of private forests have been provided with a simplified management plan (0%); (v) eight fuel-wood supply master plans are developed for eight urban centres; (vi) 299,279 ha of natural forest reserves are developed (997.59%); (vii) 2,515.214 ha of village and private reforestation are promoted (83.84%); (viii) 2,231.65 ha of State plantations are planted (74.38%).	3	62	1.86
2. Component B: Promotion of alternative energy and energy saving: (i) Alternative energy sources (gas, kerosene, solar – thermal and photovoltaic) are	(i) 0 promoter of alternative energy-related micro-project has a credit; (ii) 0% of promoters received a micro-project credit; (iii) 2,877 improved stoves are distributed to households (115%).	2	24	0.48



popularized; the people and their organizations are sensitized; (ii) promotion and distribution of improved stoves are supported; (iii) production and distribution of improved stoves are financed by credit.	The rate of adoption of improved stoves ranges from 35% to 95% depending on the cities/towns.			
3. Component 3:: Supporting measures: (i) fiscal and sub-sector control regulation reform is introduced; (ii) credit is granted to farmers and their cooperatives for the marketing of their production and the marketing of their activities (nurseries, selling of alternative energy products); (iii) information, education and communication (IEC) activities are carried out for the benefit of actors of the sub-sector in villages, brochures are produced and disseminated; (iv) capacity building activities are organized for all stakeholders of the project; (v) forestry and agro-forestry and alternative energy research is carried out in research centres and institutes specialized in these areas.	(i) Four ministerial orders were issued in May 2008 and June 2009; (ii) the sum of CFAF 436,406,420 was granted to micro-project promoters; (iii) 450 villages are affected by IEC activities; (iv) 42 training themes for the benefit of 2,392 participants, including 357 women, 90%; (v) four exchange visits were organized for 18 members of co-management structures at the national level and 17 local elected officials at the national and regional levels (Niger, Burkina Faso); (vi) officials of forestry services, including the General Manager of Water and Forests, had exchange visits on National Forestry Inventory (IFN) themes, rural markets and alternative energy in Niger, Mali and Senegal (95% of the programme provided for this aspect).	3	25	0.75
4. COMPONENT 4: Project Management: (i) The project management staff is put in place; (ii) the project headquarters, agencies, offices/housing units are built; (iii) equipment and material are procured; (iv) the Principal Technical Adviser CTP) is recruited.	(i) Part of the staff was put in place in 2002; recruitment was done bit by bit over several years (2003, 2006, 2008 and 2009); (ii) there were long delays in putting the Technical Assistance in place (in 2008 instead of 2002) and the position finally lasted only 24 months out of the 60 provided for.	2	15	0.3
OVERALL OUTPUT SCORE [Score is calculated as the sum of weighted scores]				3
			Check here to override the calculated score	
Provide justification for over-riding the calculated score				
Insert the new score or re-enter the calculated score				3

## II. ACHIEVEMENT OF OUTCOMES

**1. Using available monitoring data, assess the achievement of expected outcomes. Import the expected outcomes from the log. frame in Section C. Score the extent to which the expected outcomes were achieved. The overall outcome score must be calculated as an average of the working scores. Override the calculated score, if desired, and provide justification.**

OUTCOMES		Working Score
Expected	Actual	
Component A :		
Outcome 1: 90% of the forestry resource potential is known	A national forestry inventory (IFN) and regional forestry inventories (IFR) are compiled. The data and results are stored in a database and a monitoring mechanism referred to as "permanent information and evaluation system (SIEP)" and an IFN unit are put in place.	4
Outcome 2: Thirty rural wood markets are set up and provide 1/3 of wood supplies to urban centres; 50 cooperatives of woodcutters, charcoal makers, beekeepers and transporters are operational.	- 86 rural fuel wood markets (MRB) were set up, of which 65 are functional, around 4 State plantations (Lama, Pahou, Ouédo, and Itchédé-Toffo) and 5 natural forest reserves (Zouzounkan, Fita - Agbado, Nonsinan-Son, Tfoundou and Dahandé). A total of CFAF 108,212,706 in taxes and charges collected on rural wood markets for the past 6 months and distributed according to the key defined by inter-ministerial Decree No. 036. The project supported the training and organization of 43 cooperatives of woodcutters, charcoal makers, beekeepers and transporters.	4
Outcome 3: 5 State plantations provided with a development plan.	- The project provided four reforestation areas, namely the Lama, Pahou, Ouédo and Itchédé-offo State plantations, with participatory management plans (supporting the preparation, validation and adoption of the said plans by the Council of Ministers);  - To ensure the sustainability of its achievements, the project set up three forestry development technical units (CTAF), respectively covering the Lama, Pahou and Ouédo, and Sèmè and Itchéd-Toffo reforestation areas.	4
Outcome 4: 1,000 ha of private forests are provided with a simplified management plan.	A total of 728 plantations identified and 60 plantations are yet to be exploited. A blueprint for preparing a simplified management plan (SMP) was developed.	3
Outcome 5: 8 wood supply master plans prepared from a forestry inventory and consumer surveys.	Eight fuel wood supply master plans prepared for the cities of Cotonou, Porto-Novo, Lokassa, Abomey Bohicon Djougou Malanville Natitingou and Parakou.	4
Outcome 6: 30,000 ha of protected forests are managed.	With the support of the project, five natural community forests (299,279 ha of natural forests reserves: Zouzounkan, Fita-Agbado, Tfoundou, Dahandé), were provided with simplified development and management plans (PAGS). The project also supported the implementation of the said PAGS	3

	(enrichment of 2,39.5 ha).	
Outcome 7: 3,000 ha of village and private reforestation are planted.	2,515.214 ha of private plantations were planted between 2006 and 2009, as part of village reforestation promotion. The said plantations have been geo-referenced and a database created and disseminated in forest administration services and universities.	3
Outcome 8: 5,000 ha of State forests managed.	2,004,056 Acacia auriculifamis, Eucalyptus and Casuarina equisetifolia seedlings were planted over an area of 1,792.65 ha. Also the natural regeneration of 217 ha and 222 ha respectively in Pahou and Ouédo, bringing the size of State plantations to 2,231.65 ha, as well as maintenance of 4,124 ha, monitoring and protection of plantations against illegal felling, and opening of firebreaks over an area of 418.58 ha.	3
Component B:		
Outcome 1: 20 promoters of alternative energy-related micro-projects provided with credit.	The project supported the setting up of 30 micro-projects for the sale of gas and kerosene and two micro-projects for the installation of a unit for the production of fuel bricks. The files are with the microfinance institutions (CFAD and UNACREP) for consideration and funding. Bank suspension of loan origination due to non-recovery of 90% of the loans due.	2
Outcome 2: 30 micro-project promoters have credit for the distribution of 2,500 improved stoves.	328 promoters of improved stoves were supported in terms of dossier preparation. Thus, 184 sets of documents relating to improved stoves were prepared and 31 promoters received funding amounting to CFAF 15,000,000.	4
Outcome 3: 2,500 improved stoves are produced and distributed	2,877 improved stoves were made available to households as evidenced by the purchase and sales records of promoters who received PBF II credit. An assessment of improved stove adoption rate was carried out in Cotonou, Porto-Novo and Lokossa. The rates for these cities stand respectively at 93%, 87.9% and 35%.	4
Component C:		
Outcome 1: Two basic instruments were prepared and adopted.	The project supported the preparation and adoption of four interministerial orders relating to rural wood markets (two in May 2008 and 2 June 2009)	-
Outcome 2: Credit amounting to CFAF 589,657,490 was granted farmers and their cooperatives.	Preparation of 683 files for micro-projects, 221 of which were funded. Sixty-four of micro-project promoters are women. Loans granted amount to FCFA 436,406,420, representing a rate of 74%.	
Outcome 3: 300 villages are affected annually by information, education and communication activities.	About 450 villages per year concerned by information, education and communication (IEC) activities relating to the sustainable management of wood fuels, environmental education, the MRB, STD and HIV/AIDS control, hygiene and sanitation, etc.;	
Outcome 4: 90% of the training programme is implemented.	70 charcoal makers, including 27 in Banamé, 30 in Zouto and 13 in Lama, were trained in the use of the Casamance kiln and its supply to local management structures (SLG).	
Outcome 5: Four institutes/NGOs signed research agreements on	Improved carbonization tests were achieved with the use of the casa GV model of the Casamance kiln; an experience	

various subjects (forest species, silviculture and agro-forestry, energy economy and carbonization)	exchange trip was organized to Mali in relation to the various forms of improved stoves that may be popularized.	
Outcome 6: 8 modules of three classrooms and the headmaster's office, two village health units (VHUs) and 51 km of feeder roads;	8 modules comprising three classrooms and the headmaster's offices, two village health units (VHUs) and 51 km of feeder roads are in progress.	
<b>Component D: Project Management</b>		
Outcome 1: The project management staff consists of: a Project Manager, a Monitoring-Evaluation officer, the Financial and Administrative Director, the Technical Adviser, two Sub-sector Coordinators and three Heads of Agencies	There were delays in putting the staff in place	2
Outcome 2: A headquarters, three agencies and 10 offices/housing units	The project headquarters, three agencies and 10 offices/housing units have been built.	2
Outcome 3: Two vehicles, three motorcycles and equipment		2
Outcome 4: A Principal Technical Adviser (CTP) was hired and has assumed duty	There were delays in putting the Technical Assistance (TA) in place and the duration of the TA was reduced from 60 to 24 months.	1
<b>OVERALL OUTCOME SCORE</b> [Score is calculated as an average of the working scores]		3
<input type="checkbox"/> <b>Check here to override the calculated score</b>		
<b>Provide justification for over-riding the calculated score</b>		
<b>Insert the new score or re-enter the calculated score</b>		3

<p><b>2. Additional outcomes.</b> Comment on the project's additional outcomes not captured in the log. frame, including cross-cutting issues (e.g., gender).</p> <p>Another outcome which relates to gender is the support for organizational development of five socio-vocational cooperatives of female transporters around protected forest areas. Several women also received funding for their activities.</p>
<p><b>3. Risks to sustained achievement of outcomes.</b> State the factors that affect, or could affect, the long-run or sustained achievement of project outcomes. Indicate if any new activity or institutional change is recommended to help sustain outcomes. The analysis should draw upon the sensitivity analysis in Annex 3, where appropriate.</p> <p>➤ Factors that affect or could affect the sustainability of the outcomes achieved: the lack of maturity of local management structures set up to run the rural wood markets. These structures which were set up towards the end of the project require close supervision involving: the sharing of responsibilities between these organizations and the administrative departments responsible for water and forestry resources; and implementation of instruments issued during project implementation to regulate the wood sub-sector and the functioning of rural wood markets.</p>

## E. PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION

<p><b>1. State the extent to which the Bank and the Borrower ensured the project was commensurate with the Borrower's capacity to implement by designing the project appropriately and by putting in place the necessary implementation arrangements. Consider all major design aspects, such as extent to which project design took into account lessons learned from previous PCRs in the sector or the country (please cite key PCRs); whether the project was informed by robust analytical work (please cite key documents); how well Bank and Borrower assessed the capacity of the implementing agencies and/or Project Implementation Unit; scope of consultations and partnerships; economic rationale of project; and provisions made for technical assistance.</b></p> <p><b>[250 words maximum.</b> Any additional narrative about implementation should be included at Annex 6: Project Narrative]</p> <p>The second phase of the firewood project stems from the first phase of the project which led to the opening of plantations in Southern Benin. The design of the second firewood project took into account the outcomes of the first phase of the firewood project in Southern Benin (project completion report) and the lessons learned from this project. The project was based on strategy documents including the "Benin Alafia 2025 Vision" which sets out the guidelines for development activities in Benin and summarizes the national long-term prospective studies carried out in 1999; the Strategic Development Orientations of Benin (OSD); and the 1993 forest policy.</p> <p>Finally, the PBFII is essentially the continuation of a previous project funded by the ADB (PBFI) aimed at preserving and consolidating the gains.</p>		
<p><b>2. For each dimension of project design and readiness for implementation, provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences). Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.</b></p>		
PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT
		WORKING SCORE
<b>REALISM</b>	a) Project complexity is matched with country capacity and political commitment.	The project design was not realistic in terms of the allotted time. The project included many activities some of which are rather time-consuming.
		3

RISK ASSESSMENT AND MITIGATION	b) Project design includes adequate risk analysis.	The project did not take into account such risks as loan access and refund capacity. The project included a microcredit component, but the repayment rate is very low. This raises the issue of management of credit funds after project closure.	2	
USE OF COUNTRY SYSTEMS	c) Project procurement, financial management, monitoring and/or other systems are based on those already in use by government and/or other partners.	The procurement procedures used were those of the Bank. financial management, monitoring and/or other systems are based on those already used by the Government and other partners.	3	
For the following dimensions, provide separate working scores for Bank performance and Borrower performance:			WORKING SCORE	
			Bank	Borrower
CLARITY	d) Responsibilities for project implementation were clearly defined.	Responsibilities for project implementation were clearly defined in the agreement signed between the Bank and the Borrower.	4	4
PROCUREMENT READINESS	e) Necessary implementation documents (e.g. specifications, design, procurement documents) were ready at appraisal.	The necessary implementation documents were not ready at appraisal. The Bank did not demand these documents.	3	3
MONITORING READINESS	f) Monitoring indicators and monitoring plan were agreed upon before project launch.	Monitoring indicators and the monitoring plan were agreed upon before project launch.	3	4
BASELINE DATA	h) Baseline data were available or are collected during project design.	Baseline data were not available before project launch.	2	2

## F. IMPLEMENTATION

<p><b>1. State the major characteristics of project implementation with reference to: adherence to schedules, quality of construction or other work, performance of consultants, effectiveness of Bank supervision, and effectiveness of Borrower oversight. Assess how well the Bank and the Borrower ensured compliance with safeguards.</b></p> <p><b>[300 words maximum. [Any additional narrative about implementation should be included at Annex 6: Project Narrative.]</b></p> <p>Main project characteristics: (i) Adherence to schedule: The project implementation did not adhere to the original schedule. The project is ending with a two-year time overrun; (ii) Consultants: Consultants' performance is deemed satisfactory, but the duration of the technical assistance was less than estimated at appraisal due to recruitment delays; (iii) Bank supervision of the project is deemed less satisfactory because the rate of 1.5 missions per year was not achieved for over 8 years, since there were only 8 supervision missions; the Borrower monitored the project, but the monitoring was inadequate. Environmental monitoring was followed up by the Benin Environmental Agency (ABE).</p>
<p><b>2. Comment on the <u>role of other partners</u> (e.g. donors, NGOs, contractors, etc.). Assess the effectiveness of co-financing arrangements and of donor coordination, if applicable.</b></p> <p>NGOs played key roles in the project implementation. They provided the various forms of training; their performance was satisfactory. Research institutions signed conventions with the project concerning the forestry and alternative energy research programme. They conducted carbonization improvement tests and tested the improved stoves. The contractors</p>

carried out infrastructure works (construction of feeder roads, building of schools, drilling of wells, and construction of offices/housing units).			
<b>3. Harmonization. State whether the Bank made explicit efforts to harmonize instruments, systems and/or approaches with other partners.</b>			
The Bank made no explicit efforts to harmonize instruments, systems and/or approaches with other partners. There were no other partners.			
<b>4. For each dimension of project implementation, assess the extent to which the project achieved the following. Provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) and insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.</b>			
PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT	WORKING SCORE
<b>TIMELINESS</b>	a) Extent of project adherence to the original closing date. If the number on the right is: below 12, "4" is scored between 12.1 to 24, "3" is scored between 24.1 to 36, "2" is scored beyond 36.1, "1" is scored	Difference in months between original closing date of June 2008 and actual closing date or date of 98% disb. Rate which is 31 March 2011.	2
<b>PERFORMANCE DE LA BANQUE</b>	b) Bank complied with:		
	Environmental Safeguards	The appraisal report highlighted the negative risks of the project implementation and recommended mitigation measures. At the outset, the PBFII had no environmental plan, but one was developed for inclusion in the development plans.	4
	Fiduciary Requirements	Bank performance in the area.	3
	Project Covenants	The Bank complied with the covenants signed with the Borrower.	4
	c) Bank provided quality supervision in the form of skills mix and practicality of solutions	During the project implementation, the Bank fielded eight supervision missions. Bank performance is unsatisfactory.	2
	d) Bank provided quality management oversight	Bank ensured that its rules and procedures are applied.	4
<b>PERFORMANCE DE L'EMPRUNTEUR</b>	e) Borrower complied with:		
	Environmental Safeguards	The Government monitored the environmental and social management plan through the Benin Environmental Agency (ABE).	4
	Fiduciary Requirements	As part of the project, the Government monitored the financial management. The financial management officer was put in place two years behind schedule. Audit reports are forwarded to the Bank on time.	2
	Project Covenants	The Government adhered to project covenants with considerable delays, which	2



		impacted the project implementation.	
	f) Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations	The Borrower was responsive to the Bank supervision findings and recommendations, but some recommendations were not implemented.	2
	g) Borrower collected and used monitoring information for decision making.	The project put in place a monitoring-evaluation system which collected the data used for decision-making	2

## G. COMPLETION

1. IS THE PCR DELIVERED ON A TIMELY BASIS, IN COMPLIANCE WITH BANK POLICY?			
Date project reached 98% disb. Rate (or closing date if applicable)	Date PCR was sent to pcr@afdb.org	Difference in months	WORKING SCORE if the difference is 6 months or less, a 4 is scored. If the difference is 6 months or more, a 1 is scored
		6	4

**2. Briefly describe the PCR Process. Describe the Borrower's and co-financers' involvement in producing the document. Highlight any major differences of opinion concerning the assessments made in this PCR. Describe the team composition and confirm whether a site visit was undertaken. Mention any major collaboration from other development partners. State the extent of field office involvement in producing the report. Indicate whether comments from Peer Reviewers were received on time (provide names and positions of Peer Reviewers).**  
**[150 words maximum]**

The project completion report was produced following a mission to Benin, from 3 to 22 July 2011, led by Mr. Léandre GBELI, Principal Agro-economist, OSAN.4, and including Mr. Vaïdjoua Guineo, a Rural Development Expert at the Bank's Chad Country Office. Before the mission's arrival, the Government had prepared a document entitled "Final Appraisal Preparation Report" providing a project implementation detailed update. The mission met with the administrative authorities of the line Ministry of the project for their assessment of the outcomes and problems encountered during implementation. The mission went to the field to visit the project's physical achievements and meet the beneficiaries for their views on the project outcomes.

## H. LESSONS LEARNED

<p><b>Summarize <u>key</u> lessons for the Bank and the Borrower suggested by the project's outcomes</b></p> <p><b>[300 words maximum]. Any additional narrative about lessons learned, if needed, must be placed in Annex 6: Project Narrative]</b></p> <p>Key lessons learned from project outcomes: (i) the three-year delay was detrimental to the proper implementation of the project. The mid-term review should revisit project activities; (ii) procurement procedures are very cumbersome and do not allow compliance with procurement-related provisions of the appraisal report; (iii) the project design was highly optimistic regarding project duration; (iv) the absence of a formal undertaking between the Government and staff assigned to the project resulted in relatively high staff turnover; (v) the high number of conditions also impacted project effectiveness. Recommendations: To the Government: The procurement process should be streamlined; (ii) efforts should be made to meet project effectiveness conditions; (iii) arrangements should be made at the Directorate General of Forestry for the continued supervision of local management structures (SLG) with a view to ensuring the sustainability of rural wood markets;(iv) for future projects, the Government should provide staff in a timely manner, and ensure that they sign a specific undertaking to avoid instability during project implementation. To the Bank: (i) the number of project effectiveness conditions should be reduced for future projects; (ii) the Bank should be realistic in estimating project duration.</p>
--



## I. PROJECT RATINGS SUMMARY

All working scores and ratings must be found in the relevant section in the PCR.

CRITERIA	SUB-CRITERIA	WORKING SCORE
PROJECT OUTCOME	Achievement of outputs	3
	Achievement of outcomes	3
	Timeliness	2
	<b>OVERALL PROJECT OUTCOME SCORE</b>	<b>3</b>
BANK PERFORMANCE	<b>Design and Readiness</b>	
	Project Objectives were relevant to country development priorities.	3
	Project Objectives could in principle be achieved with the project inputs and in the expected time frame.	3
	Project Objectives were consistent with the Bank's country or regional strategy	3
	Project Objectives were consistent with the Bank's corporate priorities	4
	The log frame presents a logical causal chain for achieving the project development objectives.	4
	The log frame expresses objectives and outcomes in a way that is measurable and quantifiable.	4
	The log frame states the risks and key assumptions.	2
	Project complexity was matched with country capacity and political commitment.	3
	Project design includes adequate risk analysis.	2
	Project procurement, financial management, monitoring and/or other systems were based on those already in use by government and/or other partners.	3
	Responsibilities for project implementation were clearly defined.	4
	Necessary implementation documents (e.g. specifications, design, procurement documents) were ready at appraisal.	3
	Monitoring indicators and monitoring plan were agreed upon during design.	4
	Baseline data was available or were collected during design.	2
	<b>PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS SUB-SCORE</b>	<b>3</b>
	<b>Supervision:</b>	
	Bank complied with:	
	Environmental Safeguards	4
	Fiduciary Requirements	3
	Project Covenants	4
	Bank provided quality supervision in the form of skills mix provided and practicality of solutions.	2
	Bank provided quality management oversight.	4
	PCR was delivered on a timely basis	4
	<b>SUPERVISION SUB-SCORE</b>	<b>3</b>
	<b>OVERALL BANK PERFORMANCE SCORE</b>	<b>3</b>
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	<b>Design and Readiness</b>	
	Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined.	4
	Necessary implementation documents (e.g. specifications, design, procurement documents) are ready at appraisal.	3
	Monitoring indicators and monitoring plan are agreed upon and baseline data are available or are being collected.	4
	<b>PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS SCORE</b>	<b>4</b>
	<b>Implementation</b>	

	Borrower complied with:	
	Environmental Safeguards	4
	Fiduciary Requirements	2
	Project Covenants	2
	Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations.	2
	Borrower collected and used of monitoring information for decision-making.	2
	<b>IMPLEMENTATION SUB-SCORE</b>	<b>2</b>
	<b>OVERALL BORROWER PERFORMANCE SCORE</b>	<b>3</b>

## J. PROCESSING

STEP	SIGNATURE AND COMMENTS	DATE
Sector Manager Clearance	KEN B. Johm	
Regional Director Clearance	J.K. LITSE, Director, ORWA	
Sector Director Approval	A. BELEIH, Director, OSAN	

--

## **APPENDIX 1**

### **Scale for Working Scores and Ratings**

<b>SCORE</b>	<b>EXPLANATION</b>
<b>4</b>	<b>Very Good</b> Fully achieved with no shortcomings
<b>3</b>	<b>Good</b> Mostly achieved despite a few shortcomings
<b>2</b>	<b>Fair</b> Partially achieved. Shortcomings and achievements are roughly balanced
<b>1</b>	<b>Poor</b> Very limited achievement with extensive shortcomings
<b>NA</b>	Non Applicable

**Note: The formulas round up or down for decimal points. Only whole numbers are computed.**

# LIST OF ANNEXES

## Mandatory Information

### 1. Project Costs and Financing

#### a. Project costs by component

Components	CFAF million			UA million			% For. Exch
	Foreign Exchange	Local Currency	Total	Foreign Exchange	Local Currency	Total	
A. Sustainable production development	3,483.45	2,120.90	5,604.35	3.72	2.27	5.99	62
B. Promotion of alternative sources of energy and energy saving	142.30	440.20	582.50	0.15	0.47	0.62	24
C. Accommodating measures	463.40	1,455.95	1,919.35	0.50	1.56	2.05	25
D. Project management	308.30	1,400.16	1,708.46	0.33	1.50	1.83	18
Baseline cost	4397.45	5,365.73	9,763.18	4.70	5.74	10.44	45
Physical contingencies	70.37	28.82	99.18	0.08	0.03	0.11	71
Price escalation	455.02	672.54	1,127.56	0.49	0.72	1.21	41
Total	4,922.84	6,067.08	1,989.92	5.26	6.49	11.75	45

Source: Appraisal Report, OCDW, July 2001

#### b. Financing by sources of funds

Table 1: Project costs by sources of financing (in CFAF and UA million)

Sources	CFAF million			UA million			% Total
	Local Currency	Foreign Exchange	Total	Local Currency	Foreign Exchange	Total	
ADF	4,591.88	4,763.10	9,354.98	4.91	5.09	10.00	85
Government	964.40	159.43	1,123.83	1.03	0.17	1.20	10
Beneficiary	510.81	0	510.81	0.55	0	0.55	5
Total	6,067.09	4,922.53	10,989.62	6.49	5.26	11.75	100

Source: Appraisal Report, OCDW, July 2001

Table 3: Cumulative expenditure by sources of financing in UA compared with the estimates and appraisals (UA million)

Description	Amount allotted (UA)	Amount disbursed	Difference	Rate%
ADF	10	8.339	1.661	83.40
Government	1.75	1.749	0.001	99.95
Total	11.75	10.088	1.662	85.86

Source: Financial Report and the Ledger, July 2011

## 2. Bank Inputs.

List the key team members, and their specialties, during preparation and supervision. Provide a consolidated list of Preparation, supervision and completion missions in chronological order. Provide the date and ratings of the last supervision report.

Date	Mission	No. of persons	Composition	Pers/day
25 April to 09 May 2001	Assessment	3	Agronomist-Environmental + Environmentalist + Consulting Agro-economist	
19-23 January 2005	ADB Technical Supervision	01	Agronomist-Environmental	
14-23 October 2005	ADB Technical Supervision	01	Conservation and Natural Resources Development	
17-28 April 2006	ADB Technical Supervision	01	Agronomist-Environmental	
09-20 September 2007	ADB Technical Supervision	01	Environmental Resources Management Expert – ADB Project Officer	
3-14 March 2008	ADB Technical Supervision		Environmental Resources Management Expert–ADB Project Officer	
27 July-06 August 2008	Mid-term review	02	Project Officer; Consulting Agro-economist	
24 January to 10 February 2009	ADB Technical Supervision	04	Division Manager OSAN.2 + Senior Agronomist + Agronomist + Financial Analyst	
22 September -02 October 2009	ADB Technical Supervision	02	Natural Resources Management Expert + Agro-economist	
16-30 October 2009	ADB Portfolio Review	07	Country Economist for Benin + Operations and Portfolio Officer + Agronomist + 2 Transport Engineers + Transport Economist + Public Finance Expert + Health Analyst	
14-27 March 2010	ADB Technical Supervision	02	Principal Forestry Expert at the Natural Resources and Environmental Management Division + Agro-economist	
18-29 October 2010	ADB Technical Supervision	02	Principal Forestry Expert + Rural Development Expert	
03 au 21 July 2011	Completion	02	Principal Agro-economist + Rural Development Expert	
Total	13			

Scores awarded by the last Supervision Report

### 3. Economic Analysis (ERR).

The delay in the start of the project and the poor performance that characterized its management during the first three years of implementation deeply affected the economic viability of the project. Indeed, the delays led to the downward revision of a number of outcomes at the end of the mid-term review carried out in July 2008. The scale-down in services delivered to beneficiaries reduces the expected benefits. Similarly, the price escalation led to higher costs compared with the original project estimates. All these factors move the project away from the attainment of the 14% rate of return calculated at appraisal.

The financial and economic return of the project cannot be proven in an objective and reliable manner at project completion. At the time of appraisal, economic benefits were supposed to accrue from the additional forestry production generated by the development of private forests, protected forests enriched under the project and the exploitation of State forests. But some of these activities were not carried out at all or were carried out belatedly. Thus, the management of private plantations on the basis of a simple management plan could not be achieved. The enrichment of natural forest reserves began only in 2010 on the basis of a contract with umbrella organizations set up as part of the joint management mechanism. Therefore, only State firewood plantations resulting from the PBF were exploited from the project start.

4.4.2 Although certain beneficiaries testify that these income-generating activities (IGAs) have improved their living conditions, the financial benefits generated fall short of the levels expected at this stage. Thus, in the case of acacia plant production by private nursery operators, the production cost of the plant by a private nursery operator non-beneficiary of credit from microfinance institutions (MFIs), the project-approved intermediaries, stands at CFAF 24. This price entails a gross margin of CFAF 6 per plant, compared with the purchase price paid by the project. The income-cost ratio (I/C) is 1.25 and shows that, in light of the price paid by the project, outsourcing plant production is not profitable for private individuals. If credit of CFAF 1,000,000 to CFAF 1,500,000 is granted at an overall interest rate of 12% per annum, the production cost of an *Acacia auriculiformis* plant by private individuals ranges between CFAF 26 and CFAF 28 CFAF, thus putting the seedling operator's gross margin at between CFAF 2 and 4 /plant. This greatly affects profitability which stands at between 1.09 and 1.14.

The situation is different for beekeeping. The promotion strategy applied here consists in providing free equipment and materials to beekeeping cooperatives. This system of fully subsidized beekeeping cooperatives seems financially profitable, with an internal rate of return (IRR) of 16% after five years of operation and much more, or 24% over the 10-year lifespan of the cement hives promoted. Even so, the sustainability and expansion of the beekeeping operations promoted by the project depend on the quality of the technical and financial management of the farms by cooperatives.

Nevertheless, the project has considerably benefited the population. For example, despite the low profitability of private production of acacia seedlings within the project's contractual framework, the activity is beneficial for producers. Indeed, the gross daily income of the credit-recipient nursery operator ranges from CFAF 1,653 to CFAF 2,453. The daily income of the non-credit recipient nursery operator stands at CFAF 4,053, a difference of 65% to 145%, compared with credit-recipient producer earnings. These incomes in various rural areas covered by PBF II operations, compared with agricultural earnings that range from CFAF 1,500 to CFAF 2,500/MD, account for the interest of private producers depending on their environment. Seedling production by private individuals is also a source of supplementary non-farm employment for many rural inhabitants, especially women. An important advantage is that delivery, supervision and supplementary technical services provided by private nursery operators to private planters are paid for by both the project and owners-planters, respectively at the rate of CFAF 25 and 20/plant, or CFAF 45/plant. Moreover, through the execution by SLGs/MRBs of contracts relating to plant production, enrichment of community forests, exploitation works and supervision in fuel wood reforestation areas and protected forests reserves, an average of nearly CFAF 190.11 million was injected annually into beneficiary localities of PBF II operations, in addition to the incomes generated for those employed in various socio-community infrastructure worksites.

4. List of contracts awarded as of 31 March 2011

BIDDING DOCUMENTS (BDs)	SOURCE OR FUNDING	CONTRACT NUMBER	REMARKS
Works			
Bidding documents (BDs) for the construction of the project headquarters	GVT+ Own Resources	2	The works were 80% completed, but abandoned for non-payment of Benin's counterpart contribution.
BDs for the construction of 10 offices/housing units, nine classroom modules and drilling of 22 boreholes	ADF	5	Contract execution in process
BDs for the procurement of 21 hand pumps for 22 boreholes	ADF	0	ADB's no-objection obtained regarding the results of the bid opening and proposals analysis. The advice of National Directorate of Public Procurement (DNMP) is awaited, but the contract is currently in the administrative system for signature.
BDs for the construction of feeder roads	ADF	1	Contract executed
BDs for the construction of village health units (VHUs)	ADF	1	Contract execution in process
BDs for the construction of agency offices and rehabilitation of the OUEDO office/housing unit	ADF	1	Contract execution in process
Goods			
BDs for vehicles	GVT	1	Contract executed
BD for safes	GVT	1	Contract executed
BDs for the supply of IT, photocopying and remote sensing equipment	ADF	2	Contracts executed, but the inconclusive lot 3 has been restarted. This lot 3 will no longer be executed since the project is scheduled to close on 31 March 2011.
BDs for the supply of HIV testing KIT and treated mosquito nets	ADF	1	Mosquito net contract signed and executed. The inconclusive lot 2 has been restarted and the results of bid opening and proposal analysis forwarded to the ADB; ADB's no objection is awaited. Lot 2 will no longer be executed since the project is scheduled to close on 31 March 2011.
BDs for the supply of various equipment (air conditioners and various furniture)	ADF	1	Contract signed and delivery is in process
BDs for the supply of photocopiers	ADF	1	Contract signed and executed
BDs for the supply of 60 motorcycles, flatbed truck and tractor trailers	ADF	1	Contract for 60 motorcycles signed and executed. DNMP approved the BDs for the flatbed truck and tractors trailers.

BIDDING DOCUMENTS (BDs)	SOURCE OR FUNDING	CONTRACT NUMBER	REMARKS
			This contract can longer be executed because the project is scheduled to close on 31 March 2011.
Services			
BDs for a supply master plan	ADF	1	Contract signed and executed
BDs for the recruitment of technical assistance	ADF	1	Contract signed and executed
BDs for the recruitment of a Consulting Engineer	ADF	1	Contract signed and execution is in process
BDs for the forestry inventory	ADF	1	Contract signed and executed
BDs for the preparation of a Procedure Manual	ADF	1	Contract signed and executed
BDs for the 2005-2006 audit	ADF	1	Contract signed and executed
BDs for the 2007-2008 audit	ADF	1	Contract signed and executed
BDs for the 2009-2010 audit	ADF	1	Contract signed and 2009 audit carried out.
Addendum to the technical assistance	ADF	1	Contract signed and executed
BDs for the recruitment of various NGOs for sensitization and training activities	ADF		The results of the bid opening and proposal analysis are available, but in view of the limited time left, the PBFII wishes to finance the activity with own resources.

Source: Project Implementation Unit

## 5. List of Supporting Documents.

PBFII Final Evaluation Preparation Report  
Mid-term Evaluation Report  
Aide memoires - ADB supervision missions  
Annual Progress Reports (2004-2011)  
Socioeconomic Impact Study Report  
Financial Statement Audit Reports

### Optional

**6. Project Narrative.** Key factors not covered in the main template and that affected the design and implementation of the project. Such factors, both positive and negative, could include: climate and weather, political changes, contractual or personnel matters, technical issues, procurement processes, and interactions with other partners. If any of these factors is significant enough to affect the evaluation ratings, it should be noted in the template with a reference to this annex.