

**AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT FUND**



KINGDOM OF MOROCCO

EDUCATION PROJECT V

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT

This report is made available only to those members of staff to whose work it relates. Any further release must be authorized by the Vice-President for Operations (OSVP).

HUMAN DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

OSHD

November 2007

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
<u>CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS, WEIGHTS AND MEASURES, ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS, LIST OF ANNEXES, EXECUTIVE SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS, BASIC DATA AND PROJECT MATRIX</u>	i to xix
1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>	1
2. <u>PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND FORMULATION</u>	1
2.1 Project Objectives	1
2.2 Project Formulation	1
2.3 Project Description	2
3. <u>PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION</u>	3
3.1 Effectiveness and Start-up	3
3.2 Modifications	5
3.3 Executing Agency	5
3.4 Implementation Schedule	6
3.5 Reporting and Audits	6
3.6 Procurement of Goods and Services	7
3.7 Costs, Financing Sources and Disbursement	7
4. <u>PROJECT PERFORMANCE</u>	8
4.1 Operational Performance	8
4.2 Institutional Performance	9
4.3 Performance of Consultants, Contractors and Suppliers	10
5. <u>SOCIAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT</u>	10
5.1 Social Impact	10
5.2 Environmental Impact	10
6. <u>SUSTAINABILITY</u>	11
6.1 Infrastructure and Equipment	11
6.2 Financial Sustainability	11
6.3 Institutional Capacity Building	11
7. <u>PERFORMANCE OF THE BANK AND THE BORROWER</u>	12
7.1 Performance of the Bank	12
7.2 Performance of the Borrower	12
8. <u>OVERALL PERFORMANCE AND RATING</u>	12
9. <u>CONCLUSIONS, LESSONS LEARNT AND RECOMMENDATIONS</u>	13
9.1 Conclusions	13
9.2 Lessons Learnt	13
9.3 Recommendations	15

ANNEXES

The report was prepared by a team comprising Mr. Boukary Savadogo, Education Expert, OSHD (Mission Leader) and Mrs. Leila Kilani Jaafar, Social Development Specialist, following their mission to Morocco from 13 to 27 November 2006. For further information, please contact the authors or Mr. Tom Hurley, Director OSHD (Ext. 2046) or Mr. Alexis de Roquefeuil (Ext. 2184).

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

<u>At Project Appraisal</u> (August 1993)		<u>On Completion</u> (PCR November 2006)	
UA 1	=	MAD 13.1137	UA 1 = MAD 12.8883
UA 1	=	US\$ 1.4036	UA 1 = US\$ 1.48004

WEIGHTS AND MEASURES

Metric System

FISCAL YEAR

January - December

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ICB	:	International Competitive Bidding
NCB	:	National Competitive Bidding
ADB	:	African Development Bank
DAGBP	:	Directorate of General Affairs, Budget and Assets
INRDP	:	National Institute for Research and Educational Documentation
MAD	:	Moroccan Dirham
MAFO	:	Morocco Country Office
MEN	:	Ministry of National Education
MENJ	:	Ministry of National Education and Youth
MENESFCRS	:	Ministry of National Education, Higher Education, Executive Training and Scientific Research
REW	:	Roads and External Works

LIST OF ANNEXES

	<u>Number of Pages</u>
1. Actual Expenditure By Expenditure Category and Financing Source	1
2. Estimated and Actual Annual Loan Disbursement Schedule	1
3. Project Implementation Performance and Performance of the Bank	1
4. Project's Impact on Development	1
5. Matrix of Recommendations	2
6. Sources of Information	1

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. The Education Project V in Morocco was approved by the Bank on 24/11/1993. The Bank awarded an ADB loan of UA 30.00 million and an ADF loan of UA 10.13 million for its financing. Both ADB and ADF loan agreements were signed on 13/03/1995 and became effective on 22/10/1996. Subsequent to the previous four Bank Group-financed operations in Morocco's education sector, this project was in keeping with the continuation of efforts to reform the Moroccan educational system and intended to improve its quality, build secondary education intake capacity and reduce the illiteracy rate. The project's objectives were to improve the quality of primary and secondary education, adapt higher education to the country's needs and make secondary education accessible to all. The project also aimed to reduce the illiteracy rate of rural women and sensitize them to maternal and child health, family planning, nutrition, the benefits of schooling girls, environmental protection and AIDS control. It also aimed to promote environmental education and extend population education to secondary education.

2. The project became effective on 22 October 1996, 19 months after the loans were signed on 13 March 1995. According to the initial schedule, project implementation was to span 5 years starting January 1994. Implementation fell far behind schedule and lasted 12 years because of several constraints, in particular regarding the fulfilment of the conditions precedent to loan effectiveness, limited knowledge of procurement procedures, the executing agency's lack of management autonomy, cumbersome contract award procedures, major modifications to the project components and cost, and inadequate monitoring by the Bank. Out of the seven components planned at appraisal, four were actually implemented and three were withdrawn for implementation with other financing. Because of successive cancellations of the ADB and ADF loans, the latter stood at UA 4,515,524.95 and UA 3,692,035.17 at project completion.

3. However, these modifications did not jeopardize the initial sub-sector goals, and the proposed component activities registered a near 90% implementation rate for the entire project. The project made possible: (i) the construction and equipment of 21 out of the 26 high schools planned; (ii) the purchase of furniture, education equipment and textbooks; (iii) the purchase of computer equipment for the schools and the implementation unit; (iv) the conduct of a study on school environment; (v) the preparation of a textbook for pupils and a guide for teachers on environmental education, the production of teaching materials and the organization of a pilot training workshop for environmental education; and (vi) literacy education for 72,893 women in rural areas, comprising 27,172 through the Community Literacy Programme and 45,721 in partnership with 32 NGOs, as well as the training of 508 literacy education workers attached to these NGOs.

4. The project was adversely affected by the numerous institutional changes made both to the structures and implementation staff. Such changes made it difficult to capitalize fully on the experience acquired from previous operations. Other factors that played a negative role on project performance include implementation delays; the civil service voluntary separation scheme which led to the departure of many competent and experienced MEN staff; and the lack of an adequate structure to efficiently manage the education reform. The Bank's performance was judged unsatisfactory. The operation was relevant but the project turned out to be too ambitious covering all levels of the education system as well as all the cross-cutting issues. This resulted in an overestimation of costs and long implementation periods, frequent postponements of the completion deadline and cancellations of loan balances. Three important components were not implemented. The Government felt that the red tape and changes of project officers hampered project implementation.

5. The preparation of this report has made it possible to learn several lessons from the project's implementation. The lessons primarily concern: the project's formulation and implementation, the fulfilment of the loan conditions; the performance of stakeholders and the outcomes, as well as the sustainability of project achievements. On the basis of the lessons learnt, the following recommendations are made to the Government and the Bank for future operations:

Project Formulation

- (i) When designing future projects, the Bank shall pay more attention to potential risks; it shall conduct preliminary sector studies for a fuller vision of challenges and constraints.

Project Implementation

- (i) The Government shall ensure the stability of the project implementation arrangements
- (ii) The Bank and Government shall ensure that a structure for steering and coordinating the structure has been put in place.
- (iii) As far as possible, the Bank shall use national procurement procedures.
- (iv) The Bank shall require that a specific financial management and accounting system be established and that the project finance officers are trained to use it

Fulfilment of Conditions

- (i) The Government shall endeavour to ensure the timely fulfilment of the project loan agreement conditions.
- (ii) The Bank shall make sure at project start-up, that members of the project team are trained in project rules and procedures.

Performance and Results

- (i) Responsibilities for project implementation as described in the appraisal report must be complied with, or in the event of justified change, they must be the subject of consensual decisions between the Borrower and the Bank.
- (ii) The Government shall safeguard the project implementation arrangements from frequent institutional changes.

Sustainability

- (i) When designing the project, the Bank shall systematically identify factors that can contribute to, and strengthen the sustainability of achievements.
- (ii) Both parties shall invite the local authorities, parent/teacher associations, NGOs, and the private sector to take part in the various phases of project preparation and implementation, so as to promote ownership of the outputs and thus enhance sustainability.

BASIC PROJECT DATA

1.	Project Name	:	Education Project V
2.	ADB Loan Number	:	ADB LOAN n° B/MRC/EDU-V/95/52
3.	ADF Loan Number	:	ADF LOAN n° F/MRC/EDU-V/95/6
4.	Borrower	:	Government of Morocco
5.	Executing Agency	:	Directorate of General Affairs, Budget and Assets within the MEN

A. LOANS Estimate at AppraisalADB

1.	Amount (UA million)	:	30.00 million
2.	Interest Rate	:	Variable
3.	Commitment Charge	:	1% a year on the undisbursed loan amount starting 60 days after signing of the loan agreement
4.	Repayment Period	:	20 years in 28 equal half-year payments starting from the 7 th year after signing of the loan agreement
5.	Grace Period	:	6 years
6.	Date Negotiated	:	2-3 November 1993
7.	Date Approved	:	24 November 1993
8.	Date Signed	:	13 March 1995
9.	Date Effective	:	22 October 1996

ADF Loan

1.	Amount (UA million)	:	10.13 million
2.	Service Charge	:	0.75% annually on the disbursed amount outstanding
3.	Repayment Period	:	50 years – 1% of the principal from the 11 th year through to the 20 th year and 3% a year subsequently
4.	Grace Period	:	10 years
6.	Date Negotiated	:	2-3 November 1993
7.	Date Approved	:	24 November 1993
8.	Date Signed	:	13 March 1995
9.	Date Effective	:	22 October 1996

B. PROJECT DATA

1.		<u>Project Cost at Appraisal (in UA million)</u>	
	Foreign Exchange	:	36.15
	Local Currency	:	12.24
	Total Cost	:	48,49
2.		<u>Financing Plan at Appraisal (in UA million)</u>	
	ADB	:	30.00
	ADF	:	10.13
	Government	:	8.36

3. Actual Financing Plan (in UA million)

ADB	:	4.51
ADF	:	3.69
Govt.	:	2.45
4. Actual Date of First Disbursement	:	4 December 1998
5. Actual Date of Last Disbursement	:	5 September 2005
6. Start-up of Project Implementation Activities	:	1996
7. Completion of Project Activities	:	December 2005

C. PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

1. Undrawn Balance % (ADB loan)	:	UA 25,484,475.05
Undrawn Balance % (ADF loan)	:	UA 6,437,974.83
2. Time overrun	:	
* slippage on effectiveness	:	19 months
* slippage on completion date	:	7 years
* slippage on last disbursement	:	7 years
* number of extensions of the deadline for last disbursement	:	5 (1 for 3 years; 4 for 1 year each)
3. Implementation status	:	
4. List of Verifiable Indicators	:	Implementation Rate

Designs and supervision	:	100%
Construction	:	90%
Furniture	:	100%
Equipment	:	100%
Technical Assistance	:	100%
Training	:	100%
Operation	:	100%

N.B: These percentages concern the components selected

5. Institutional Performance:		
Bank	:	Unsatisfactory
Government	:	Unsatisfactory
6. Performance of Contractors	:	Satisfactory
7. Performance of Suppliers	:	Satisfactory
8. Performance of Consultant	:	Satisfactory

D. MISSIONS

Mission	Number of Persons	Composition	Date
Appraisal	2	Education Expert/Architect	24 July - 7 August 1993
Launching	1	Education Expert	13-30 April 1996
Supervision	2	Education Expert /Architect	22 April – 5 May 1998
Supervision	2	Education Expert /Architect	July 1998
Supervision	2	Education Expert /Architect	24 April - 8 May 1999
Supervision	2	Education Expert/Architect	9 - 23 October 1999
Supervision	2	Education Expert /Architect	16 - 22 June 2001
Supervision	2	Education Expert /Architect	13 - 30 October 2001
Supervision	2	Education Expert /Architect	27 - 08 May 2002
Supervision	2	Education Expert /Architect	14 - 24 December 2002
Supervision	2	Education Expert /Architect	12 - 30 November 2003
Supervision	2	Education Expert /Architect	28 June - 11 July 2004
Supervision	2	Education Expert /Architect	13 - 31 March 2005
Supervision	2	Education Expert /Architect	24 Oct. - 08 Nov. 2005
Completion	2	Education Expert /Social Development Specialist	13 - 27 November 2006

E. DISBURSEMENT (in UA)**ADB LOAN**

Total disbursed	:	UA 4,515,524.95
Unutilized balance	:	UA 25,484,475.05
Amount cancelled	:	UA 25,484,475.05

ADF LOAN

Total disbursed	:	UA 3,692,035.17
Unutilized balance	:	UA 6,437,974.83
Amount cancelled	:	UA 6,437,974.83

F. CONTRACTORS/SUPPLIERS**CONSTRUCTIONS (21 WORKS CONTRACTS)****1. Construction of Lycée Hommane Fetouaki, Mekens – Ismaila**

Contract No.	:	201/98-99
Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
Contract amount	:	MAD 6,088,264.60
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	TAFILALET / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	02/11/99 / 15 months

2. Construction of Lycée Al Aroui in Nador

Contract No.	:	192/98-99
Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
Contract amount	:	MAD 4,515,036.77
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	ERCB / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	02/11/99 / 12 months

3. Construction of Lycée Malaab Charafi in Oujda

Contract No.	:	198/98-99
Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
Contract amount	:	MAD 5,681,713.40
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	ENTRE-SER / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	02/11/99 / 15 months

4. Construction of the Lycée Laayoune El Jadida in Taourirt

Contract No.	:	190/98-99
Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
Contract amount	:	MAD 5,342,817.70
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	ENTRE-SER / Moroccan
Nationality	:	Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	02/11/99 / 15 months

5. Construction of Lycée Allal Loudiyyi in Zouagha Moulay Yacoub

Contract No.	:	25/97-98
Contract approval date	:	25/09/98
Contract amount	:	MAD 7,315,388.30
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	MOUSSADDAK BOUCHTA / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	30/10/98 / 12 months

6. Construction of Lycée Khawarizmi in Fahs Bni Makada

Contract No.	:	27/97-98
Contract approval date	:	25/09/98
Contract amount	:	MAD 9,230,931.60
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	ELGHOUATI AHMED / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	30/10/98 / 15 months

7. Construction of Lycée Al Quods in Sidi Bernoussi

Contract No.	:	188/98-99
Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
Contract amount	:	MAD 6,824,456.10
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	AYOTRA / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	21/10/99 / 15 months

8. Construction of Lycée Ahmed Chawki in Salé

Contract No.	:	29/97-98
Contract approval date	:	25/09/98
Contract amount	:	MAD 10,823,931.56
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	ENCEC CHERARDA / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	30/10/98 / 15 months

9. Construction of Lycée Doukkala in El Jadida

Contract No.	:	31/97-98
Contract approval date	:	25/09/98
Contract amount	:	MAD 10,618,845.60
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	CHAOUIA / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	30/10/98 / 15 months

10. Construction of Lycée Tamanar in Essaouira

Contract No.	:	203/98-99
Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
Contract amount	:	MAD 6,563,672.94
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	OUTAHIYOU / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	22/10/99 (slippage on works implementation)

11. Construction of Lycée Mansour Eddahbi in Tata

Contract No.	:	33/97-98
Contract approval date	:	25/09/98
Contract amount	:	MAD 7,083,787.70
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	PROJESUD / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	30/10/98 / 15 months

12. Construction of Lycée Abou Bakr Essaddik in Ouarzazate

Contract No.	:	1/2003
Contract approval date	:	23/12/2004
Contract amount	:	MAD 8,257,236.30
Bank's share	:	ADB: / ADF: 40%
Firm / Nationality	:	DIHI LAHCEN & ABDELOUALI/ Morocco
Procurement method	:	Planned: LCB / Used: LCB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	28/12/2004 / 15 months

13. Construction of Lycée Edderfoufi in Agadir Ida Ou Tanane

Contract No.	:	35/97-98
Contract approval date	:	25/09/98
Contract amount	:	MAD 8,838,749.70
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	BOUARGA / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	30/10/98 / 15 months

14. Construction of Lycée Salah Eddine El Ayoubi in Ouazazate

Contract No.	:	37/97-98
Contract approval date	:	25/09/98
Contract amount	:	MAD 6,506,978.50
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / : ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	EL BOUABIDI / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	30/10/98 / 15 months

15. Construction of Lycée Imam Al Boukhari in Safi

Contract No.	:	184/98-99
Contract approval date	:	07/10/99
Contract amount	:	MAD 8,248,317.92
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	IMA-BAT / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	02/11/99 / 15 months (slippage on works implementation)

16. Construction of Lycée Amr Ibn Al Aass in Ain chock

Contract No.	:	2/2003
Contract approval date	:	23/12/2004
Contract amount	:	MAD 6,610,625.42
Bank's share	:	ADB: / ADF: 40%
Firm / Nationality	:	ENTRE-SER / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: LCB / Used: LCB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	28/12/2004 / 15 months

17. Construction of the Lycée Moulay Abdellah in Rabat

Contract No.	:	39/97-98
Contract approval date	:	NA
Contract amount	:	MAD 9,450,622.05
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	15/12/98 / 12 months

18. Construction of Lycée Al Massira in Fes Al Madina

Contract No.	:	3/2003
Contract approval date	:	23/12/2004
Contract amount	:	MAD 8,399,893.39
Bank's share	:	ADB: / ADF: 40%
Firm / Nationality	:	SONACOTRAP / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: LCB / Used: LCB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	02/11/99 / 15 months

19. Construction of Lycée Otthmane Ibn Affane in Nador

Contract No.	:	194/98-99
Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
Contract amount	:	MAD 5,813,771.00
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	RAZKI / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	02/11/99 / 15 months

20. Construction of Lycée Moulay Ismail in Nador

Contract No	:	186/98-99
Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
Contract amount	:	MAD 6,302,339.13
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	STPRD SARL / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	02/11/99 / 12 months

21. Construction of Lycée Eddarih in Errachidia

Contract No.	:	41/97-98
Bid opening date	:	30/05/95
Contract approval date	:	25/09/98
Contract amount	:	MAD 9,061,399.58
Bank's share	:	ADB: 73% / ADF: 18%
Firm / Nationality	:	MOCI SARL / Moroccan
Procurement method	:	Planned: ICB / Used: ICB
Works start-up/Implementation period	:	30/10/98 / 12 months

FURNITURE (4 CONTRACTS FOR THE PROVISION OF FURNITURE)

1.	Contract No.	:	155/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 3,657,818.00
	Bank's share	:	ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	ECOGEMA / Moroccan
	Procurement method	:	Planned: LCB / Used: LCB
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 4 months
2.	Contract No.	:	156/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 1,786, 509.00
	Bank's share	:	ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	MANUM / Moroccan
	Procurement method	:	Planned: LCB / Used: LCB
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	04/10/99 / 4 months
3.	Contract No.	:	157/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 345,800.00
	Bank's share	:	ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	M.B.S / Moroccan
	Procurement method	:	Planned: LCB / Used: LCB
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 4 months
4.	Contract No.	:	158/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 271,54.00
	Bank's share	:	ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	NOUVELLE BUROG / Moroccan
	Procurement method	:	Planned: LCB / Used: LCB
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 4 months

EQUIPMENT (31 CONTRACTS FOR THE PROVISION OF TEACHING MATERIALS)

Procurement Method Planned and Used is ICB

- | | | | |
|----|--|---|--------------------------|
| 1. | Contract No. | : | 263/98-99 |
| | Contract approval date | : | 21/09/99 |
| | Contract amount | : | MAD 728,954.00 |
| | Bank's share | : | ADB: 75% DF |
| | Supplier / Nationality | : | DELTA COMOCEN / Moroccan |
| | Contract start-up date / Delivery date | : | 05/10/99 / 8 months |
| 2. | Contract No. | : | 264/98-99 |
| | Contract approval date | : | 21/09/99 |
| | Contract amount | : | MAD 30,248.00 |
| | Bank's share | : | ADB: 75% DF |
| | Supplier / Nationality | : | PACHERAM / Moroccan |
| | Contract start-up date / Delivery date | : | 06/10/99 / 8 months |
| 3. | Contract No. | : | 265/98-99 |
| | Contract approval date | : | 21/09/99 |
| | Contract amount | : | MAD 2,190,320.00 |
| | Bank's share | : | ADB: 75% DF |
| | Supplier / Nationality | : | S.M.D.L / Moroccan |
| | Contract start-up date / Delivery date | : | 05/10/99 / 8 months |
| 4. | Contract No. | : | 266/98-99 |
| | Contract approval date | : | 21/09/99 |
| | Contract amount | : | MAD 857,527.00 |
| | Bank's share | : | ADB: 75% DF |
| | Supplier / Nationality | : | DELTA COMOCEN / Moroccan |
| | Contract start-up date / Delivery date | : | 05/10/99 / 8 months |
| 5. | Contract No. | : | 267/98-99 |
| | Contract approval date | : | 21/09/99 |
| | Contract amount | : | MAD 268,102.34 |
| | Bank's share | : | ADB: 75% DF |
| | Supplier / Nationality | : | ALLARD SPORT |
| | Contract start-up date / Delivery date | : | 06/10/99 / 8 months |
| 6. | Contract No. | : | 268/98-99 |
| | Contract approval date | : | 21/09/99 |
| | Contract amount | : | MAD 102,052.80 |
| | Bank's share | : | ADB: 100% DF |
| | Supplier / Nationality | : | DIDASPO / Moroccan |
| | Contract start-up date / Delivery date | : | 06/10/99 / 8 months |
| 7. | Contract No. | : | 269/98-99 |
| | Contract approval date | : | 21/09/99 |
| | Contract amount | : | MAD 11,400.00 |
| | Bank's share | : | ADB 75% DF |
| | Supplier / Nationality | : | SOMADASE / Moroccan |
| | Contract start-up date / Delivery date | : | 05/10/99 / 8 months |

8.	Contract No.	:	291/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 3,249,954.07
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	JEULIN / France
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	05/10/99
	Delivery period	:	8 months
9.	Contract No.	:	292/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 922,092.80
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	INTRACOM /Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 8 months
10.	Contract No.	:	293/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 508,003.00
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	CONTINENTAL / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	05/10/99 / 8 months
11.	Contract No.	:	294/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 345,068.88
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	DIDASPO / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 8 months
12.	Contract No.	:	295/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 321,138.00
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	DELTA COMOCEN / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	13/12/99 / 8 months
13.	Contract No.	:	297/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 154,839.05
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	PHYWA SYSTEME / German
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	09/05/99 / 8 months
14.	Contract No.	:	298/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 48,108.00
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	BOYER / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 /8 months
15.	Contract No.	:	299/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 26,733.00
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	CHIMILABO / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 8 months

16.	Contract No.	:	300/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 11,172.00
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	ION MOROCCO / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 8 months
17.	Contract No.	:	41/99-2000
	Contract approval date	:	20/12/2000
	Contract amount	:	MAD 4,578.00
	Bank's share	:	ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	SOMADASE / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	12/06/2001 / 6 months
18.	Contract No.	:	42/99-2000
	Contract approval date	:	20/12/2000
	Contract amount	:	MAD 1,282,753.96
	Bank's share	:	ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	DELTA COMOCEN / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	09/01/2001 / 6 months
19.	Contract No.	:	43/99-2000
	Contract approval date	:	20/12/2000
	Contract amount	:	MAD 341,451.60
	Bank's share	:	ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	DIDASPO / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	09/01/2001 / 6 months
20.	Contract No.	:	44/99-2000
	Contract approval date	:	20/12/2000
	Contract amount	:	MAD 2,940,027.00
	Bank's share	:	ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	S.M.D.L / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	23/04/2001 / 6 months
21.	Contract No.	:	46/99-2000
	Contract approval date	:	30/01/2001
	Contract amount	:	MAD 1,343,432.92
	Bank's share	:	ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	JEULIN / France
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	13/02/2001 / 6 months
22.	Contract No.	:	47/99-2000
	Contract approval date	:	20/12/2000
	Contract amount	:	MAD 352,968.00
	Bank's share	:	ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	TAOURA / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	08/02/2001 / 6 months
23.	Contract No.	:	282/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 385,308.00
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	PIERON / France
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 8 months

24.	Contract No.	:	283/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 218,093.40
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	CHIMILABO / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 8 months
25.	Contract No.	:	284/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 143,830.00
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	INTRACOM / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 8 months
26.	Contract No.	:	285/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 123,500.00
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	SOTCO / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 8 months
27.	Contract No.	:	290/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 4,130,478.40
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	S.M.D.L / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 8 months
28.	Contract No.	:	254/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 236.835,00
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	CHIMILABO / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 6 months
29.	Contract No.	:	279/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 834,290.00
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	PACHERAM / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 8 months
30.	Contract No.	:	280/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 472,245.00
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	DIDASPO / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	06/10/99 / 8 months
31.	Contract No.	:	281/98-99
	Contract approval date	:	21/09/99
	Contract amount	:	MAD 403,294.80
	Bank's share	:	ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	:	JEULIN / French
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	:	05/10/99 / 8 months

EQUIPEMENT (3 CONTRACTS FOR THE PROVISION OF TEXTBOOKS)

	Procurement Method	Planned and Used is ICB
1.	Contract No.	: 340/98-99
	Contract approval date	: 21/09/99
	Contract amount	: MAD 131,016.60
	Bank's share	: ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	: LIBRAIRIE DES ECOLES / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	: 02/12/99 / 6 months
2.	Contract No.	: 341/98-99
	Contract approval date	: 21/09/99
	Contract amount	: MAD 45,323.20
	Bank's share	: ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	: DAR EL AMANE/ Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	: 02/12/99/ 6 months
3.	Contract No.	: 342/98-99
	Contract approval date	: 21/09/99
	Contract amount	: MAD 41,600.00
	Bank's share	: ADB: 75% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	: DAR ERRACHAD EL HADITA/ Morocco
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	: 02/12/99/ 6 months

EQUIPEMENT (3 CONTRACTS FOR THE PROVISION OF COMPUTER EQUIPMENT)

Procurement Method Planned and Used is ICB

1.	Contract No.	: 183/98-99
	Contract approval date	: 01/09/99
	Contract amount	: MAD 199,340.00
	Bank's share	: ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	: SIEMENS / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	: 07/09/99 / 2 months
2.	Contract No.	: 357/98-99
	Contract approval date	: 21/09/99
	Contract amount	: MAD 64,140.00
	Bank's share	: ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	: COD-21 / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	: 06/10/99 / 1 month
3.	Contract No.	: 325/98-99
	Contract approval date	: 01/09/99
	Contract amount	: MAD 408,910.00
	Bank's share	: ADF: 100% DF
	Supplier / Nationality	: SIEMENS / Moroccan
	Contract start-up date / Delivery date	: 07/09/99 / 2 months

G. CONSULTANTS/TRAINING**TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE (1 CONTRACT FOR STUDY)**

1.	Contract No.	:	N°1/PEV/DCFC/96
	Purpose of contract	:	Study of school environment status
	Contract approval date	:	30 October 1996
	Contract amount	:	MAD 866,125.00
	Bank's share	:	100%
	Consulting firm / Nationality	:	ISIAM – CIDE / Morocco -Canada
	Procurement method	:	Short list
	Contract start-up date / Implementation period:	:	May1997 / October 1999

**KINGDOM OF MOROCCO: EDUCATION PROJECT V
RETROSPECTIVE LOGICAL FRAMEWORK**

Hierarchy of Objectives	Estimates at Appraisal	Outputs Upon Project Completion	Means of Verification	Major Assumptions
<p><u>SECTOR GOAL</u></p> <p>1. Improve the quality and relevance of the education system.</p>	<p>1.1 Increase in the advancement rates at primary and secondary education levels.</p> <p>1.2 Improved job market access for higher education leavers.</p> <p>1.3 Reduction in the female illiteracy rate in the rural areas.</p> <p>1.4 Increase in the secondary school enrolment rate.</p>	<p>1.1 Activity withdrawn from project.</p> <p>1.2 Activity withdrawn from project.</p> <p>1.3 Fewer illiterate women in the rural areas.</p> <p>1.4 Higher secondary school enrolment rate.</p>	<p>1.1.1 MEN Statistics.</p> <p>1.2.1 Statistics of the Ministry of Employment, Social Affairs and Crafts.</p> <p>1.3.1 Statistics of the Ministry of Employment, Social Affairs and Crafts.</p> <p>1.4.1 MEN Statistics.</p>	<p>1.1.1.1 Training of trainers efficient and pupils provided with teaching methods.</p> <p>1.2.1.1 Training provided adapted to the country's economic needs.</p> <p>1.3.1.1 1 Trainers trained and teaching methods designed.</p> <p>1.4.1.1 The 26 Secondary schools built.</p>
<p><u>PROJECT OBJECTIVES</u></p> <p>1. Improve the quality of primary and secondary education.</p> <p>2. Develop secondary education.</p> <p>3. Increase the efficiency of higher education</p> <p>4. Promote education on the environment</p> <p>5. Promote education on population issues.</p> <p>6. Teach women in rural areas to read and write and sensitize them to topics on maternal and child health, family planning, environmental protection, the benefits of educating girls and AIDS control.</p>	<p>1.1 Assessment of education resources for consistency of objectives, curricula, textbooks and teaching methods.</p> <p>1.2 Reduction in the repeater and drop-out rates.</p> <p>2.1 Enrolment of 23,400 more secondary school pupils.</p> <p>2.2 Fewer regional disparities in the education of girls.</p> <p>3.1 Training of about 800 students for vocational degrees.</p> <p>4.1 Training of 21.500 teachers and about 4 million pupils.</p> <p>5.1 Introduction to population issues in secondary schools.</p> <p>6. 1 41,550 literate women in rural areas, sensitized to topics concerning maternal and child health, family planning, environmental protection, the benefits of educating girls and AIDS control.</p>	<p>1.1 Activity withdrawn from project.</p> <p>1.2 Activity withdrawn from project.</p> <p>2.1 18,900 more students in secondary schools.</p> <p>2.2 In the project areas, the enrolment rate of young girls in secondary schools estimated at about 40%.</p> <p>3.1 Activity withdrawn from project.</p> <p>4.1</p> <p>5.1 Population education introduced in secondary schools.</p> <p>6.1 72,893 women able to read and write in rural areas and sensitized to the topics planned.</p>	<p>1.1.1 Report of the INRDP.</p> <p>1.2.1 MEN Statistics.</p> <p>2.1.1 MEN Statistics.</p> <p>2.2.1 MEN Statistics and Reports on the progress made in the schooling of girls.</p> <p>3.1.1 MEN Statistics.</p> <p>4.1.1 MEN Statistics</p> <p>5.1.1 MEN Statistics and Reports of the Directorate for Secondary Education.</p> <p>6.1.1 Statistics of the Ministry of Employment, Social Affairs and Crafts</p>	<p>1.1.1.1 INRDP is built and functional.</p> <p>1.2.1.1 Learning periodically assessed and remedial lessons given to weak pupils.</p> <p>2.1.1.1 26 Secondary schools built.</p> <p>2.2.2.1 Successful sensitization to the benefits of schooling of girls and conditions for primary school enrolment relaxed by Government.</p> <p>3.1.1.1 Vocational degree in line with the higher education reform.</p> <p>4.1.1.1 Trainers successfully trained.</p> <p>4.1.1.2 5.1.1.1 Trainers successfully trained.</p> <p>6.1.1.1 Successful training of trainers and effective participation of the women; textbooks also available.</p>
<p><u>RESULTS</u></p> <p>1. Construction of the INRDP</p> <p>2. Reorganization of continuing staff training and supervision.</p>	<p>1.1 Physical existence of the building covering an area 1200 m2.</p> <p>2.1 Creation of the Department of Training and Information within the INRDP.</p>	<p>Activity withdrawn from project.</p> <p>Activity withdrawn from project.</p>	<p>1.1.1 Final acceptance report.</p> <p>2.1.1 Decree establishing the INRDP.</p>	<p>1.1.1.1 Firm selected for implementation has the necessary necessary qualifications.</p> <p>2.1.1.1 Training takes into account innovations in the curricula and in teaching methods, use of teaching materials aid and knowledge assessed. Pupils provided with teaching aid.</p>

Hierarchy of Objectives	Estimates at Appraisal	Outputs Upon Project Completion	Means of Verification	Major Assumptions
3. Increase in the advancement rates from 39% in 1992/93 to 65% in 1998/99 in the 9 th year at primary level and 71% to 85% in the 3 rd year in secondary schools.	3.1 PIU implementation reports	Activity withdrawn from project.	3.1.1 MEN Statistics.	3.1.1.1 Idem
4. Decrease in the repeater rates from 43% in 1992/93 to 25% in 1998/99 in the 9 th year at primary level and from 14% to 5% in the 3 rd year in secondary schools.	4.1 PIU implementation reports.	Activity withdrawn from project.	4.1.1 MEN Statistics MEN.	4.1.1.1 Idem
5. Decrease in the drop-out rates from 18% in 1992/93 to 12% in 1998/99 in the 9 th year at primary level and from 15% to 10% in the 3 rd year in secondary schools.	5.1 PIU implementation reports.	Activity withdrawn from project.	5.1.1 MEN Statistics.	5.1.1.1 Idem
6. Procurement, exchange and dissemination of educational documents as well as organization of school libraries.	6.1 Creation of the Documentation Department within the INRDP.	Activity withdrawn from project.	6.1.1 Decree establishing the INRP	6.1.1.1 INRDP construction works completed and the Institute is operational.
7. Evaluation of experimental projects and conduct of prospective studies on the education system.	7.1 Creation of the Evaluation and Prospects Department within the INRDP.	Activity withdrawn from project.	7.1.1 Decree establishing the INRP.	7.1.1.1 Idem
8. Construction of 26 high schools .	8.1 Physical existence of 26 high schools in the targeted areas.	8.1 21 High schools build and equipped.	8.1.1 Final acceptance report.	8.1.1.1 The Firms selected have the financial and technical capacity to build the Secondary schools.
9. Enrolment of 23,000 more pupils in secondary schools.	9.1 Enrolment of 900 pupils in each high school built.	9.1 18.900 additional places created in secondary schools.	9.1.1 MEN Statistics.	9.1.1.1 The Government assigned the required staff.
10. Educating 21,500 teachers and about 4 million secondary school pupils in environmental issues.	10.1 Schedule of training for trainers and lessons on the environment.	10.1 Training given.	10.1.1 Reports concerning training of pupils. 11.1.1 BDs sent to the Bank.	10.1.1.1 Trainers are trained and manuals and teacher's guide edited.
11. Diagnostic study on the environmental situation in schools.	11.1 Recruitment of environmental and education consultants for the conduct of the study.	11.1 Study conducted, validated and used to prepare the guides and manuals.	11.1.1 Bank supervision missions and activity reports.	11.1.1.1 Technical assistants recruited according to schedule.
12. Preparation of a manual on the environment and a teacher's guide.	12.1 Delivery of manual and guide to beneficiaries (teachers and pupils).	12.1 Manuals and guides used by the beneficiaries	12.1.1 Bank supervision missions.	12.1.1.1 Participants in the workshop examining the results of diagnostic study agreed to the proposals for the textbook's
13. Population studies for 3,200 teachers and 400,000 secondary school pupils.	13.1 Organization of training of trainers and introduction of population issues in secondary schools.	Activity withdrawn from project.	13.1.1 Bank supervision missions. 14.1.1 Submission of BDs to the Bank.	13.1.1.1 Trainers are trained and pupils are provided with manuals.
14. Preparation of a manual and a teacher's guide on population issues.	14.1 Recruitment for the design of the manual and guide.	Activity withdrawn from project.	14.1.1 Submission of BDs to the Bank.	14.1.1.1 The MEN set up the team for the manual and teacher's guide.
15. Equipment of universities with teaching aids.	15.1 Delivery note.	Activity withdrawn from project.	15.1.1 Final acceptance report.	15.1.1.1 Bids are launched according to schedule.
16. Training of 800 students for vocational degrees.	16.1 Award of 800 vocational degrees.	Activity withdrawn from project.	16.1.1 MEN Statistics.	16.1.1.1 Teaching aids acquired and supplied to university Universities; private individuals who provided training are
		Activity withdrawn from project.	17.1.1 Reports from the Ministry of Employment, Social Affairs and Crafts.	

XIX

Hierarchy of Objectives	Estimates at Appraisal	Outputs Upon Project Completion	Means of Verification	Major Assumptions																										
17. Teaching 41,550 women in rural areas to read and write and sensitizing them to maternal and child health, family planning, environmental protection, the benefits of schooling girls and AIDS control.	17.1 Literacy education and sensitization of women in rural areas and in the El Mansour district.	72,893 women in rural areas are taught to read and write and sensitized to the planned topics.		are paid on a short-term basis. 17.1.1.1 Moderators trained and present In the literacy sessions and seminars.																										
<p>ACTIVITIES</p> <p>1. Re-engagement of the Financed Projects Division to implement the project and creation of the Coordination Committee.</p> <p>2. Recruitment of technical assistants.</p> <p>3. Launching of bids for construction and equipment.</p> <p>4. Preparation of the literacy, environmental and population study manuals.</p> <p>5. Start-up of training and literacy courses.</p>	<p>BUDGETARY RESOURCES</p> <p>1.1 Submission of the relevant documents to the Bank.</p> <p>2.1 Technical assistants assume duty.</p> <p>3.1 Publication of notices in newspapers.</p> <p>4.1 Submission of the relevant documents to the Bank.</p> <p>5.1 The reports on training and literacy activities are prepared.</p> <p>Resources (in UA million)</p> <table> <tr><td>Designs and supervision:</td><td>1.60</td></tr> <tr><td>Construction :</td><td>20.09</td></tr> <tr><td>Furniture :</td><td>1.30</td></tr> <tr><td>Equipment :</td><td>16.71</td></tr> <tr><td>Technical assistance :</td><td>0.18</td></tr> <tr><td>Training :</td><td>1.57</td></tr> <tr><td>Operation :</td><td>0.56</td></tr> <tr><td>Total :</td><td>48.49</td></tr> </table> <p>ADB : 30.00</p> <p>ADF : 10.13</p> <p>Govt. : 8.36</p>	Designs and supervision:	1.60	Construction :	20.09	Furniture :	1.30	Equipment :	16.71	Technical assistance :	0.18	Training :	1.57	Operation :	0.56	Total :	48.49	<p>Resources (in UA million)</p> <table> <tr><td>Goods :</td><td>1.56</td></tr> <tr><td>Works :</td><td>8.70</td></tr> <tr><td>Services :</td><td>0.40</td></tr> <tr><td>Operation :</td><td>FR*</td></tr> <tr><td>Total :</td><td>10.65</td></tr> </table> <p>ADB : 4.51</p> <p>ADF : 3.69</p> <p>Govt. : 2.45</p>	Goods :	1.56	Works :	8.70	Services :	0.40	Operation :	FR*	Total :	10.65	<p>1.1.1 Bank supervision.</p> <p>2.1.1 Submission of contracts to the Bank.</p> <p>3.1.1 Submission of documents to the Bank.</p> <p>4.1.1 Submission of the relevant documents to the Bank.</p> <p>5.1.1 The reports on training and literacy activities are sent to the Bank.</p>	<p>1.1.1.1 PIU provided with a sufficient quantity of fuel.</p> <p>2.1.1 Recruitment schedule complied with.</p> <p>3.1.1 Land for the construction of the INRDP and secondary schools are available.</p> <p>4.1.1 Diagnostic study of the environmental situation in schools conducted according to schedule. The schedule for the preparation of the manuals also complied with.</p> <p>5.1.1 The implementation units are functional.</p>
Designs and supervision:	1.60																													
Construction :	20.09																													
Furniture :	1.30																													
Equipment :	16.71																													
Technical assistance :	0.18																													
Training :	1.57																													
Operation :	0.56																													
Total :	48.49																													
Goods :	1.56																													
Works :	8.70																													
Services :	0.40																													
Operation :	FR*																													
Total :	10.65																													

*FR: For the record

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 This report gives an account of the completion of the Education Project V in Morocco. The report was approved by the Bank in 1993, its implementation was to span five years although in fact, implementation lasted until December 2005 because of numerous constraints regarding fulfilment of the loan effectiveness conditions, limited knowledge of procurement procedures, the executing agency's lack of management autonomy, cumbersome contract award procedures, major modifications to components and related costs, as well as inadequate project monitoring by the Bank.

1.2 The project was approved by the Bank on 24/11/1993. To finance it, the Bank awarded an ADB loan of UA 30.00 million and an ADF loan of UA 10.13 million. Both ADB and ADF loan agreements were signed on 13/03/1995 and became effective on 22/10/1996. The project was a follow-up to the four previous Bank-financed operations in Morocco's education sector. These were (i) the *Vocational Training Intensification Project* financed with an ADB loan of UA 25.5 million and an ADF loan of UA 9.21 million, approved on 11/12/1985 and completed on 31/12/1998; (ii) the *Education System Reform Project* financed with an ADB loan of UA 60.1 million approved on 12/12/1985 and completed on 30/06/1994; (iii) the *Lower Primary Education Support Project* financed with an ADB loan of 31.1 million, approved on 23/3/1989 and completed on 30/06/1997; (iv) the *Upper Primary School Support Project* financed with an ADB loan of UA 37.0 million, was approved on 29/10/1990 and completed on 31/12/1999.

1.3 Complementary to these four operations, the project was in keeping with the continuation of efforts to reform Morocco's education system and was intended to improve its quality, build secondary education intake capacity and reduce the illiteracy rate especially of women in the rural areas. However, of the seven components planned at appraisal, four were actually implemented and three were withdrawn for financing by the national budget or other financing sources. The ADB and ADF loans were subject to successive cancellations; their amounts on completion stood at UA 4,515,524.95, and UA 3,692,035.17, respectively. These modifications did not in any way jeopardize the initial sub-sector goals which were attained thanks to other financing sources. The component activities retained registered a near 90% implementation rate for the entire project.

2. PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND FORMULATION

2.1 Project Objectives

The project's objectives were to improve the quality of primary and secondary education, adapt higher education to the country's needs and make secondary education accessible to all. The project also aimed to reduce the illiteracy rate of rural women and sensitize them to maternal and child health, family planning, nutrition, the benefits of schooling girls, environmental protection, HIV/AIDS control, as well as to promote education on the environment and population in secondary schools.

2.2 Project Formulation

2.2.1 In 1985, the Moroccan Government embarked on a reform of its education system with a view to better adapting education and training to the country's economic and social requirements. Despite the progress made in attaining the objectives, with the help of operations

already financed by the Bank in the sector, other actions seemed necessary to increase the intake capacity in secondary schools especially in the rural areas, to improve the general efficiency of the education system and address illiteracy among rural women.

2.2.2 Accordingly, the Government sent a request to the Bank Group with a view to financing a fifth project aimed at consolidating the achievements of the previous four operations. The Government's request received a favorable response. Once approved, the project was to be the 5th ADB Group operation in Morocco's education sector. At the time, education and health sector loans accounted for 13% of total commitments, since the priorities then were the infrastructure and agriculture sectors, in keeping with the needs of Morocco's economy. The project was in keeping with both the Government's education sector policy and the Bank Group support strategy in Morocco for the 1994-1996 period which targeted among other priorities, human resource development.

2.2.3 To formulate the project, an identification mission was fielded to Morocco in November 1992 by UNESCO. The identification report was used by the Bank which sent in succession, a preparation mission in January-February 1993 and an appraisal mission in July-August 1993. At the time of project preparation, of the four operations already financed, only one, the *Education System Reform Project* was close to completion. The other three were at varying stages of implementation. The *Vocational Training Intensification Project* was being smoothly implemented and achieved its objective of building and equipping 20 establishments, thus making it possible to embark on a supplementary programme. The other two projects, however, the *Lower Primary School Support Project* and the *Upper Primary School Support Project* fell behind their implementation schedule owing to coordination difficulties arising from a transfer of competencies for school construction to the local authorities. Learning from that lesson, the new project was to be implemented at central level.

2.3 Project Description

At appraisal, the project, initially planned for implementation in five years, comprised seven components. The major outputs expected of each component were as follows:

Component I: Improving the quality of primary and secondary education

- (i) Construction of the National Institute of Research and Educational Documentation (INRDP);
- (ii) Re-organization of continuing teaching and supervisory staff training;
- (iii) Increase in the advancement rates from 39% in 1992/93 to 65% in 1998/99 in Year 9 of primary school and from 71% to 85% in Year 3 of secondary school;
- (iv) Decrease in the repeater rate from 43% in 1992/93 to 25% in 1998/99 in Year 9 of primary school and from 14% to 5% in Year 3 of secondary school;
- (v) Decrease in the drop-out rate from 18% in 1992/93 to 12% in 1998/99 in Year 9 of primary school and from 15% to 10% in Year 3 of secondary school;
- (vi) Purchase, exchange and dissemination of educational documents, as well as organization of school libraries services; and
- (vii) Evaluation of experimental projects and conduct of prospective studies on the education system.

Component II: Development of secondary education

- (i) Construction of 26 high schools;
- (ii) Equipment of the 26 high schools with teaching materials and furniture;
- (iii) Enrolment of 23,000 additional pupils in secondary schools.

Component III: Improvement of the efficiency of higher education

- (i) Equipment of Universities with teaching materials;
- (ii) Training of 800 students for graduation in vocational degrees.

Component IV: Promotion of environmental education

- (i) Diagnostic study of the environmental situation in schools;
- (ii) Preparation of a manual and a teacher's guide on the environment;
- (iii) Environmental training for 21,500 secondary school teachers and about 4 million pupils.

Component V: Strengthening the study of population issues

- (i) Preparation of a manual and a teacher's guide on population issues.
- (ii) Educating 3,200 secondary school teachers and 400,000 pupils in population issues.

Component VI: Literacy education for rural women

- (i) Provision of furniture;
- (ii) Provision of teaching materials and the equipment needed for training women;
- (iii) Teaching 41,550 women in rural areas to read and write and sensitizing them to issues of maternal and child health, family planning, environmental protection, the benefits of schooling girls, and AIDS control.

Component VII: Project Implementation Unit

- (i) Provision of computer equipment, vehicles and duplicating equipment;
- (ii) Operating expenses; and
- (iii) Computer, administrative and management training for professionals.

3. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

3.1 Effectiveness and Start-up

Conditions Precedent

3.1.1 The project was approved by the Bank on 24/11/1993. The ADB and ADF loan agreements were signed on 13/03/1995. The conditions precedent to loan effectiveness were fulfilled and the project became effective on 2/10/1996 that is 19 months after signature of the loan agreements and nearly three years after project approval. The conditions precedent were as follows:

- (i) Provide the Bank and the Fund with evidence that the Project Activity Coordination Committee has been established comprising representatives of the Ministries of Finance, National Education, Internal Affairs (Under-Secretary of State Office for the Environment) and Employment, Social Affairs, and chaired by the Ministry of Finance;
- (ii) Provide the Bank and Fund with evidence of the re-engagement of the Financed Projects Division within Men's Directorate of Planning, to implement the project;
- (iii) Provide the Bank and Fund with evidence of the appointment, within the Financed Projects Division, of four officers in charge respectively of: (i) monitoring the construction of the secondary schools and INRDP, and equipping them; (ii) the study of environmental and population issues; (iii) monitoring activities to enhance and improve the efficiency of higher education; and (iv) literacy education for women; the CVs of these officers were to receive the prior approval of the Bank and the Fund;
- (iv) Undertake to provide the project with land for the construction of INRDP and the secondary schools ; and
- (v) Undertake to relax the conditions for the enrolment of girls in primary schools by allowing them entrance beyond the age of seven.

3.1.2 At the time of appraisal, these conditions were relevant. However, during the negotiations, because the MEN was being restructured, the Government requested replacement of the second condition concerning the renewal of the Financed Projects Division's role as project executing agency, with proof of the establishment of an implementation unit. In actual fact, the Government was to take almost three years to fulfil the conditions precedent to loan effectiveness, illustrating thus the problems encountered in fulfilling them.

Other Conditions

3.1.3 According to the project loan agreements, the Borrower had other conditions to meet during implementation. These are summarized in the following table:

	CONDITIONS	STATUS
i	Submit to the Bank and the Fund not later than six months after signing of the loan agreements, a list showing the names of the 198 female literacy workers who will be in charge of teaching rural women to read and write by organizing literacy caravans.	Officially not fulfilled, nonetheless, under the component 2, 508 literacy workers and 100 female instructors were trained
ii	Submit to the Bank and the Fund, not later than six months after signing of the loan agreements, a list showing the names of the 31 instructors in charge of teaching women of the cooperatives to read and write.	Officially not fulfilled but became irrelevant after implementation of Component 2
iii	Submit to the Bank and the Fund, the reports on the education and population teacher training seminars.	Fulfilled in part, well behind schedule and after completion of the environmental education section of component 3.
iv	Submit annually to the Bank and the Fund, a progress report on the enrolment of girls in primary schools.	Fulfilled well behind schedule in November 2005 with the submission of school statistics to the Supervision Mission
v	Submit to the Bank and the Fund, not later than six months after the signing of the loan agreements, the decisions to assign land for the National Education Research and Documentation Institute and for the secondary schools.	Fulfilled for the 21 schools built or in progress.

3.2 Modifications

3.2.1 Major modifications were made to project components and loan amounts. Of the seven components planned at appraisal, only the following four were maintained and actually implemented: (i) *Secondary Education Development*, comprising the construction and equipment of 26 secondary schools in the rural areas; (ii) *Literacy Education for Women in Rural Areas*; (iii) *Promotion of Environmental Education*; and (iv) *Project Implementation Unit*. The Component *Improving the Quality of Primary and Secondary Education*, which concerned the National Educational Research and Documentation Institute (INRDP) and the Component *Improvement of the Efficiency of Higher Education* were withdrawn from the project for complete funding by the national budget. The activities planned under Component V *Strengthening the Study of Population Issues*, were implemented with funds from other development partners especially the UNFPA

3.2.2 These modifications were made over time; the first which concerned the decision to withdraw two components *Improving the Quality of Primary and Secondary Education* and *Improving the Efficiency of Higher Education* for financing by the national budget, was effective right from project start-up. The reason for the withdrawal was the delay in the actual project start-up because of urgent problems that needed to be solved. The final modification to the component *Strengthening the Study of Population Issues* occurred during the last year of implementation; it was made because projected activities had been carried out under operations by other development partners. The initial ADB loan amount of UA 30.00 million was reduced to UA 17.13 million in October 1999, then to UA 7.40 million in February 2002, and finally to UA 4.51 million by completion making a cumulative cancellation of UA 25.48 million. The initial ADF loan of UA 10.13 million for its part, was brought down to UA 7.24 million in October 1999 and to UA 3.69 million by project completion

3.3 Executing Agency

3.3.1 It was planned at appraisal that the project would be implemented by the Financed Projects Division within the MEN's Education Planning Directorate. During loan agreement negotiations on 2 and 3 November 1993, the Moroccan party informed the Bank of ongoing restructuring in the MEN, and the abolition of the Financed Projects Division. It was therefore agreed that the Government would create a Project Implementation Unit as one of the conditions precedent. Indeed, the Directorate of General Affairs, Budget and Assets (DAGBP) in the MEN played the role of executing agency. Within that Directorate, the team responsible for the project comprised: the project manager, the project leader, a planning specialist, two procurement specialists, an accountant, three technical professionals (an engineer, an architect and a technician) and a secretary.

3.3.2 During project implementation, the MEN saw several institutional changes both in terms of structure and staff. When the supervision mission was fielded in November 2003, the Ministry had been restructured and was then known as the Ministry of National Higher Education, Executive Training and Scientific Research (MENESFCRS). According to the new provisions that followed the restructuring, a project unit was to be set up to manage all projects financed by various donors. However, this unit was not yet operational at the time of project completion.

3.4 Implementation Schedule

3.4.1 The loan effectiveness conditions were fulfilled on 22/10/1996, or about three years after approval of the loans. This bad start was compounded by subsequent delays accumulated during project implementation as a result of various factors comprising *inter alia*, the shortcomings of certain firms, irregular works monitoring, as well as mobility of project managers stemming from institutional changes within the MEN. Consequently, the project implementation period was extended until December 2005.

3.4.2 On the initial closing date, two extension requests were made for a period of three (3) years, followed by two other periods of one year each. These extensions made it impossible to implement all the initially planned activities by the last revised closing date set at 31/12/2005.

Estimated and Actual Schedule of Activities

Activities	Estimated Dates	Actual Dates	Slippage
Board presentation	November 1993	24/11/1993	None
Conduct of studies and preparation of BDs	January - September 1994	1994 - 1996	24 months
Recruitment of technical assistants	March - September 1994	October 1996	24 months
Launching of BDs for construction	April 1994 - February 1995	January 1998 - June 2003	45 months
Start-up of construction works	October 1994 - September 1996	October 1998 – December 2003	48 months
Launching of BDs for equipment and furniture	March 1994 - July 1997	January 1999 - December 2001	57 months
Delivery and installation of equipment and furniture	September 1994 - April 1998	June 2000 -2002	57 months
Training and literacy education	November 1994 - December 1998	1997 - 2003	36 months
Completion	December 1998	December 2005	7 years

3.5 Reporting and Audits

3.5.1 Throughout project implementation, 18 quarterly activity reports were prepared and submitted to the Bank. They covered the 1997 to 30 September 2005 period. Status reports were not submitted regularly to the Bank and those sent were not always in the appropriate format. However, during the latter years of implementation and with the support of the Bank's Country Office in Morocco (MAFO), quality and regularity improved greatly.

3.5.2 Seven (7) audit missions visited the project and five audit reports covering the period from the 1996 financial year to 31 December 2005 were sent to the Bank. On the whole, these reports met Bank requirements though they were not always submitted within the required timeframe. The audit report for the 2000/2001 financial year did not comply with Bank requirements and the latter requested that it be re-written. Where the Bank's Audit Department found inconsistencies in the reports, they were pointed out to the Government which made the necessary corrections and/or amendments.

3.6 Procurement of Goods and Services

3.6.1 Throughout project implementation, 63 contracts were signed and implemented. These were: (i) construction of 21 out of 26 high schools, i.e. 21 contracts for a committed amount of MAD 158,160,156.36; (ii) procurement of furniture for 4 contracts for a committed amount of MAD 6,061,281.00; and (iii) procurement of equipment, i.e. 32 contracts signed for a committed amount of MAD 23,110,098.96; (iv) procurement of school textbooks under 3 contracts for a committed amount of MAD 217,939,80; (v) procurement of computer equipment under 3 contracts for a committed amount of MAD 672,390,00; and (vi) procurement of the services of a consultant to conduct an assessment of the school environment.

3.6.2 Goods, works and services were procured in compliance with the provisions set out in the loan agreement, and with Bank rules of procedure. As a rule, modifications to the initial procurement methods went first of all through the Bank's no objection procedure. This was the case with the rural women literacy education activities which, at the request of the Government were entrusted to specialized NGOs by virtue of partnership agreements.

3.7 Costs, Financing Sources and Disbursement

3.7.1 The project was financed jointly by Bank Group ADB and ADF loans, as well as by counterpart funds from the Moroccan Government. At appraisal, total project cost net of taxes and duties, was estimated at UA 48.49 million comprising UA 36.15 million in foreign exchange and UA 12.34 million in local currency.

ADB Loan

3.7.2 Upon project completion, disbursements on the initial ADB loan of UA 30.00 million had reached UA 4,515,524.95 corresponding to the total of the ADB loan without cancellations. In relative value terms, the disbursement rate on the ADB loan was 100% of the amount without cancellations.

ADF Loan

3.7.3 Upon completion, disbursements on the ADF loan initially of UA 10.13 million stood at UA 3,692,025.17 or the total loan amount without cancellations. In relative value terms, the disbursement rate of the ADF loan was 100%.

Government's Counterpart

3.7.4 According to the terms of the Loan Agreement, the Government was to pay annually, its contribution to the financing of the planned activities. The Government's contribution represented UA 8.36 million or 17.25% of the total project cost. This contribution was made exclusively in local currency and helped to pay the following expenditure categories: studies and supervision, construction, furniture, equipment, training and operation. Upon project completion, disbursements on these funds amounted to MAD 31,648,613,87, or about 28% of its initial contribution to the financing of project activities, and 23% of the actual total project cost of UA 10.65 million. This amount was used for the following expenditure categories: (i) works, MAD 23,661,627.01; (ii) furniture MAD 1,010,213,50; and (iii) equipment, MAD 6,976,773.36. The Government was also responsible for project operation.

4. PROJECT PERFORMANCE

4.1 Operational Performance

4.1.1 The overall implementation rate of the modified project upon completion was estimated at around 90%. This rate refers to the project minus three of the initial components. For those components implemented within the framework of the modified project, under Development of Secondary Education, 21 out of the 26 high schools planned by the project were built and are operational. The equipment and furniture for all 26 high schools were purchased and delivered. Literacy activities in rural areas were completed. The study on the status of the school environment which was validated by the Ministry of Education and the Secretariat responsible for the Environment has been completed. The component relative to population studies for its part has been implemented with funds from other development partners, FNUAP and GTZ in particular. Operational performance for each project component is as follows:

Component I: Development of Secondary Education

4.1.2 The architectural and technical designs for the 26 schools planned under the project were completed and served as a basis for preparing bidding documents for works. Works were supervised on 21 of the schools. Out of the 26 high schools planned, 21 were actually built and equipped; they are operational and full use is made of them. Out of the national budget, the Government will finance the construction of the remaining 5 high schools, as well as supervise works. The furniture intended for the 26 secondary schools has all been delivered to the establishments, thus offering the pupils better studying conditions. All teaching materials planned under the project to be used for subjects like Natural Science, Physics-Chemistry, History-Geography and Physical Education, have all been delivered thus improving the quality of the lessons.. The school textbooks have also all been delivered. The computer equipment comprising 19 computers and 19 printers including software kits for the administrations of 19 high schools have all been delivered. All equipment items bought are of good quality and in proper working order.

Component II: Literacy Education for Women in Rural Areas

4.1.3 The actions financed made it possible to prepare a literacy manual, a corresponding user's guide intended for trainers, to teach 72,893 women in rural areas to read and write; 27,172 of these benefited from literacy education under the Community Literacy Programme and 45,721 under a joint exercise with 32 NGOs, as well as to train 508 literacy education instructors attached to these NGOs. The initial objective of the component to teach 40,000 beneficiaries to read and write was exceeded by 82%. Three seminars on the training of trainers and 100 instructors of the social centres were organized in 1997 and 1998. A fourth training seminar was also organized on the techniques of group organization, communication and andragogy for extension officers from the Ministry of Agriculture. Pursuant to the project provisions, procurement for this component concerned: (i) audio-visual equipment; (ii) 5 tents for the mobile literacy education units; (iii) blackboards for classrooms; and v) a vehicle for project monitoring. These purchases made it possible to successfully implement the planned activities.

Component III: Promotion of Environmental Education

4.1.4 Computer and audio-visual equipment have been procured, supplied and delivered since March 2001. A diagnostic study on the environmental situation in schools was conducted by a specialized consulting firm. The study was carried out from May 1997 to October 1999 and validated on the occasion of the Arab Environment Day. It focused on environmental education in primary and secondary schools and culminated in three reports: Report I: Status of environmental education; Report II: Analysis of curricula in light of environmental education; and Report III: Identification of guidelines for mainstreaming environmental education in the Moroccan school system and proposals for teaching materials for the teacher and the pupil. The findings of the study served as a basis to implement other activities under the component.

4.1.5 Other outputs of the component were: the preparation of an environmental education manual for pupils and a user's guide for teachers with the educational prospect of a skills-based approach; the production of teaching materials on CD-ROM; and the organization of a pilot training of trainers workshop on environmental education. This workshop focused on the following modules: (i) sustainable management of water resources; (ii) sustainable management of the biodiversity; (iii) the coastal ecosystem; (iv) climatic changes; (v) waste management; (vi) sustainable management and poverty reduction; and (vii) environmental citizenship. These topics are illustrated by teaching materials devised for trainers and covering each of the seven topics selected. The component also financed the training of trainers on environmental education aimed at mastering educative approaches to environmental issues and at upgrading the various players in view of a good transfer of knowledge on environmental protection and the promotion of sustainable development.

Component IV: Project Implementation Unit

4.1.6 The following computer equipment was procured and delivered: twelve (12) computers and 8 printers. No training activity was organized under this component. Operating expenses (office supplies, mission expenses, communication expenses) were paid for with the national counterpart funds. Because operating expenses were defrayed by the national budget under each budget law for all financing sources, project management was *de facto* the responsibility of the team so assigned and run annually by lines of credit projected by these successive laws.

4.2 Institutional Performance

4.2.1 The institutional arrangements made for project implementation were not complied with. According to the project appraisal report, the project was to be implemented by the Financed Projects Division within the Directorate of Education Planning of the MEN which was responsible for implementing other Bank and IDA projects. In the wake of MEN's restructuring, which occurred prior to project start-up, the Financed Projects Division was abolished. The Directorate of General Affairs, Budget and Assets (DAGBP) within the MEN played the role of executing agency but the implementation duties were separated and taken care of by the three ministries involved in the three main project components: school infrastructure, literacy education and the environment.

4.2.2 Throughout its implementation, the project had no specific financial and accounting management system. External financing, as with national financing was budgeted under each annual budget law. Consequently, the project's funds were managed by several players.

These were: the Ministry of Finance and Privatization (Division for Multilateral Financing, General Treasury and Government Expenditure Commitment Control) and the beneficiary sector ministries of project activities, especially the MENESFCRS, the Ministry of Employment, Vocational Training, Social Development and Solidarity, and the Ministry of Regional Planning, Urban Development, Housing and Environment..

4.3 Performance of Consultants, Contractors and Suppliers

On the whole, the consultants (consulting firms and technical assistants), firms responsible for the school construction works, and suppliers of goods, performed satisfactorily. It should be noted however that during implementation some construction firms were inefficient and had to be replaced, thus causing implementation delays on two sites (the Imam Al Boukhari and Tamanar secondary schools).

5. **SOCIAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT**

5.1 Project's Social Impact

5.1.1 The 21 high schools built led to an increase in the intake capacity in rural areas. With an average of 900 pupils enrolled in each high school, these 21 schools offer 18,900 more places at secondary level. Thanks to the project 72,893 women in rural areas can read and write; 27,172 of them benefited from the Community Literacy Programme and 45,721 from a joint exercise with 32 NGOs; moreover, 508 literacy workers from these NGOs were trained. The initial component objective of 40,000 beneficiaries was exceeded by 82%. Three seminars to train trainers and social centre workers were also organized. A fourth training seminar on group leadership, communications and andragogy was also organized for the benefit of extension workers from the Ministry of Agriculture.

5.1.2 The project also helped to reduce geographical and gender disparities with regard to access to education. The Bank's financing helped the country in its efforts to ensure access to primary education for all, especially in the rural areas. Furthermore, the Bank's assistance also produced effects which were not easily quantifiable such as economic and cultural impacts of the new schools and women's literacy education.

5.2 Environmental Impact

5.2.1 The project had a positive impact on the environment. This is evident from the diagnostic study on the environmental situation in schools now available in the Ministry of National Education, and from the programme to train teachers of secondary schools and colleges nationwide with a view to promoting environmental education. Because of its social nature (category II), the project itself does not raise any real environmental problems except those concerning water and electricity supply or connection to the public sewer/drainage system which are being addressed. In addition, arrangements have been made for the extraction of any possible toxic gases from school laboratories. The buildings were designed in compliance with the hygiene and sanitation standards in force in the country and in line with the physical characteristics of the sites and regions concerned.

5.2.2 The activities carried out under the environment education component led to a study of the environmental situation in schools, the preparation of a manual for pupils and a user's guide for teachers, the production of teaching aids, the organization of a pilot environmental education training workshop for trainers, and to the teaching of environmental issues in the schools, all of which have had a positive impact on the environment.

6. SUSTAINABILITY

6.1 Infrastructure and Equipment

6.1.1 The main project output was the construction and equipment of 21 secondary schools. In order to consolidate the project's achievements, the Government will finance out of its investment budget the construction of the remaining five of the initial 26 high schools planned under the project. The quality of the schools is satisfactory. However, routine maintenance and security, currently the responsibility of the Government are inadequate because the schools are not provided with the necessary financial resources. It is therefore vital for the Government to strengthen infrastructure and equipment maintenance activities. To that end, other donors, in particular the World Bank are supporting the Government in the definition and implementation of an appropriate maintenance policy.

6.1.2 The procurement of a large quantity of equipment was financed under the project comprising furniture for the 26 high schools; teaching materials for subjects like natural science, physics and chemistry, history and-geography, physical education; textbooks; computers and printers, and software packages for the administrations of the high schools; tents for the mobile literacy units; vehicles; as well as computer and audio-visual equipment for the literacy and environmental education activities. The measures taken by the Government to ensure infrastructure sustainability through a budget allocation also apply to equipment.

6.2 Financial Sustainability

The recurrent expenses incurred by the project comprise in particular salaries for teachers and maintenance of infrastructure and equipment had to be met. At the time of appraisal, these had been estimated at UA 5.07 million, representing 0.08% of the government's budget and 0.47% of MEN's budget. This estimate turned out to be satisfactory and recurrent expenses were taken into account in the national education budget. In fact, this method enabled the Government to plan resources for building the remaining 5 high schools that could not be built under the project.

6.3 Institutional Capacity Building

The project helped to increase the intake capacity of secondary schools. It also enhanced national functional literacy capacity for rural women. It strengthened the capacity for environmental education aimed at an understanding of education approaches to environmental issues and upgrading the different actors to ensure the smooth transfer of the know-how for environmental protection and the promotion of sustainable development. In those three components, capacity building focused on research and training activities as well as the provision of equipment. Capacity building would have been even more effective if all the initially planned components had been implemented.

7. PERFORMANCE OF THE BANK AND THE BORROWER

7.1 Performance of the Bank

7.1.1 The Bank's performance in the design of the project was mixed. The operation was relevant but the project was over-ambitious, covering all levels of the education system and all cross-cutting issues. This was compounded by institutional problems which to some extent contributed to the overestimation of costs and long implementation periods, and thus to frequent postponements of the closing dates and cancellations of loan balances. Three important components were withdrawn from the project.

7.1.2 During implementation, the Government felt that red tape and the mobility of project officers raised project implementation problems. The services provided for disbursement, the processing of procurement documents and for monitoring were considered less than satisfactory by the Moroccan authorities. There was no mid-term project review. During the 12 years of project implementation, the Bank organized 12 supervision missions, or an average of one mission a year. This rate is lower than the standard of 1.5 supervisions per annum in respect of the twelve-year implementation period. It is, however, satisfactory in relation to the actual implementation period. On the whole, the Bank's performance was unsatisfactory.

7.2 Performance of the Borrower

7.2.1 The Government's participation in the project's identification, preparation and appraisal was satisfactory. Indeed, the Government was behind the initiative taken to formulate the project. It had clearly laid down its priorities and requested the Bank's support. However, its performance during implementation was negatively affected by, among other factors, numerous institutional changes and the fact that certain management tools such as appropriate financial and accounting management system were lacking.

7.2.2 Among the many factors that impacted negatively on the project's performance which were attributable to the Borrower were: (i) delays in the acquisition of land for the buildings; (ii) the sluggish pace of procedures for obtaining building permits; (iii) payment delays at Treasury level; (iv) the many restructuring exercises within the Ministry of Education; (v) the civil service voluntary separation scheme resulting in the departure of many competent and experienced professionals of the MEN; and (vi) the absence of an adequate structure to effectively manage the education reform. For those reasons, the Borrower's performance was unsatisfactory.

8. OVERALL PERFORMANCE AND RATING

Overall, project implementation performance was affected by a series of adverse factors attributable not only to the Borrower but also to the Bank including: (i) the large number of project intervention areas ; (ii) difficulties regarding the fulfilment of the conditions precedent to effectiveness; (iii) poor implementation capacity due to limited knowledge of goods and services procurement; (iv) the executing agency's lack of management autonomy; (v) inadequate budget allocation which precluded pre-financing of large-scale activities; (vi) the rigidity of the contract award procedures; and (vii) major modifications made to the project.

9. CONCLUSIONS, LESSONS LEARNT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

9.1 Conclusions

9.1.1 Upon completion, the project's physical implementation rate was estimated at around 90%. Given the major implementation delay and the withdrawal of three components, the initial project activities were not all carried out despite extensions of the deadline for final disbursement. Notwithstanding, the objectives of the components implemented were attained and had an impact on the development of the various sub-sectors concerned, in particular secondary education, the environment, and literacy education for rural women and their integration into development, as well as the education of girls.

9.1.2 The project enabled the construction of 21 secondary schools offering about 18,900 additional places in secondary schools; in addition 72,893 women in rural areas were taught to read and write as well as trained to practice income-generating activities; the project also contributed to promoting the schooling of girls and to reducing regional and gender differences of access to education, to the implementation of activities relative to environmental protection.

9.2 Lessons Learnt

9.2.1 Several lessons can be learnt from the project's implementation. These concern primarily its formulation and implementation, fulfilment of the loan conditions, performance of the stakeholders, the outcomes and the sustainability of project achievements.

Project Formulation

9.2.2 Delays in implementation reflect in part the difficulties encountered in project preparation. By agreeing to finance the project, the Bank was responding to a request from the Government. But during the implementation phase, the Government's decision to withdraw three of the project's major components implied that its request should have been subject to more critical analysis at the formulation stage. All the possible risks could not have been foreseen. However, the conduct of preliminary sector studies by the Bank would have more clearly identified the challenges and constraints.

9.2.3 Although the project was centrally managed, the issues of decentralization and deconcentration of MEN's services impacted on implementation. In fact, in tasks concerning the award of contracts, approval or payment stamps, and works monitoring in view of the country's size, and the number of building technicians available, the project implementation team was often obliged to call on engineers working in the provincial delegations to monitor certain projects especially when difficulties arose during works implementation. This assistance differed from one region to another, and was often uncertain since it was neither institutionalized, nor structured nor planned in advance. These engineers from the Delegations did not feel concerned by these operations and the Delegations themselves considering their limited logistic resources found it difficult to meet such additional demand from the project. The Delegations raised other difficulties such as the fact that the consulting firms and some works contractors made no effort to obey their instructions since they were not contractually bound. Furthermore, the delegations did not always have the necessary updated information on the operation for which they were approached.

Project Implementation

9.2.4 Project implementation was affected by the abolition of the Financed Projects Division, leading to the assignment of management tasks among structures within several Ministries including the MEN which later became the Ministry of National Higher Education, Executive Training and Scientific Research (MENESFCRS), the State Secretariat for Literacy and Informal Education, and the State Secretariat for the Environment.

9.2.5 Project implementation was also affected by poor coordination and management. The provisions set out at appraisal by virtue of which, the Ministry of Finance was to coordinate the project turned out to be inefficient. The fact that there was no management structure to coordinate the project meant a fragmentation of the steering committee into as many management units as there were components.

9.2.6 According to the Government, the very many and complex administrative procedures at country and Bank level, hindered project implementation and caused delays. Firms experienced difficulty in mastering all the supporting documents to be provided when bidding and payment requests at General Treasury-level were slow in being made.

9.2.7 The project did not have its own financial and accounting management system. External as well as national funds, were budgeted under each annual budget law. The project's financial management was the responsibility of 4 different departments: the Accounting Department of the MENJ, the Division for Multilateral Financing, the General Treasury and Government Expenditure Commitment Control of the Ministry of Finance and Privatization. As a result, project financial statements (disbursements for each financing source, payments and commitments made by component and expenditure category, among other things), were slow and of poor quality. The mission did not receive financial statements in the Bank-required format and is recommending that the project's executing agency take the necessary measures to ensure the regular preparation of statements on physical and financial implementation duly updated.

Fulfilment of Conditions

9.2.8 The ADB and ADF loan agreements were signed on 13/03/1995 and the Government took 19 months to fulfil the conditions for effectiveness on 22/10/1996. The other conditions were fulfilled with considerable delay owing to frequent institutional changes, uncertainty over the implementation of all the initial project components and the high number of conditions (5 conditions precedent and 5 other conditions).

Performance and Results

9.2.9 Five (5) of the estimated 26 high schools were not built. Moreover, three components were withdrawn from the project. In light of the unfulfilled demands for access to secondary education, the schools had to be built with national budget funds. The Government undertook to do this. The ADB loan in an initial amount of UA 30,000,000 was the subject of successive cancellations amounting in all to UA 25,484,475.05. The ADF loan in an initial amount of UA 10,130,000.00 was also the subject of cancellations amounting to UA 6,437,964.83.

9.2.10 The project's financial management was shared by several players which made it difficult and inefficient. Those concerned were: the Ministry of Finance and Privatization (Division for Multilateral Financing, the General Treasury and Government Expenditure Commitment Control) and the sector ministries/beneficiaries of project activities especially the MENJ, the Ministry of Employment, Vocational Training, Social Development and Solidarity, and the Ministry of Regional Planning, Urban Development, Housing and the Environment.

9.2.11 Numerous institutional changes had a negative impact on the Government's performance; indeed, they affected not only the structures but also the individuals responsible for implementation. Bank missions were not regular and the response time for documents submitted by the project was long.

Sustainability

9.2.12 The construction work was satisfactory on the whole. Some of the high school buildings have already deteriorated as a result of acts of vandalism by people living in the areas where the schools were built or by the pupils themselves. This is a serious situation which, if not urgently addressed could endanger school property.

9.3 Recommendations

Project Formulation

- (i) When designing future projects, the Bank shall pay more attention to potential risks; it must conduct preliminary sector studies for a fuller vision of challenges and constraints.

Project Implementation

- (i) The Government shall ensure the stability of the project implementation arrangements
- (ii) The Bank and Government shall ensure that a structure for steering and coordinating the structure has been put in place.
- (iii) As far as possible, the Bank shall use national procurement procedures.
- (iv) The Bank shall require that a specific financial management and accounting system be established and that the project finance officers are trained to use it

Fulfilment of Conditions

- (i) The Government shall endeavour to ensure the timely fulfilment of the project loan agreement conditions.
- (ii) The Bank shall make sure at project start-up, that members of the project team are trained in project rules and procedures.

Performance and Results

- (i) Responsibilities for project implementation as described in the appraisal report must be complied with, or in the event of justified change, they must be the subject of consensual decisions between the Borrower and the Bank.
- (ii) The Government shall safeguard the project implementation arrangements from frequent institutional changes.

Sustainability

- (i) When designing the project, the Bank shall systematically identify factors that can contribute to, and strengthen the sustainability of achievements.
- (ii) Both parties shall invite the local authorities, parent/teacher associations, NGOs, and the private sector to take part in the various phases of project preparation and implementation, so as to promote ownership of the outputs and thus enhance sustainability.

KINGDOM OF MOROCCO

EDUCATION PROJECT V

Estimated Expenditure by Category and Financing Source
(in UA million)

EXPENDITURE CATEGORY	ADB	ADF	Gvt.	TOTAL
Goods	0.00	4.67	0.31	4.98
Works	21.73	4.12	6.39	32.24
Services	8.27	0.00	0.93	9.21
Operation	0.00	0.76	0.00	0.76
TOTAL	30.00	10.13	8.36	48.49
Percentage	61.86%	20.89%	17.25	100%

Actual Expenditure by Category and Financing Source
(in UA million)

EXPENDITURE CATEGORY	ADB	ADF	Gvt.	TOTAL
Goods	0.68	0.26	0.62	1.56
Works	3.86	3.01	1.83	8.70
Services	0.00	0.40	0.00	0.40
Operation	0.00	0.00	PM*	0.00
TOTAL	4.51	3.69	2.45	10.65
Percentage	42.35%	34.65%	23%	100%

KINGDOM OF MOROCCO

EDUCATION PROJECT V

Estimated and Actual Schedule of Annual Loan Disbursements

Year	Disbursement, estimated at appraisal		Actual disbursement	
	ADB	ADF	ADB	ADF
1994	7.46	3.00	0.00	0.00
1995	12.08	4.81	0.00	0.00
1996	7.86	1.84	0.00	0.00
1997	1.49	0.25	0.00	0.00
1998	1.11	0.23	0.70	0.19
1999	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
2000	0.00	0.00	1.50	0.31
2001	0.00	0.00	1.19	0.37
2002	0.00	0.00	0.34	0.85
2003	0.00	0.00	0.27	0.55
2004	0.00	0.00	0.08	0.06
2005	0.00	0.00	0.42	1.01
Total	30.00	10.13	4.51	3.69

Comparison of Actual ADB/ADF/Government Expenditure
(in UA million)

Financing Source	Estimated	Actual Expenses	% Share
ADB	30.00	4.51	42.35%
ADF	10.13	3.69	34.65%
Government	8.36	2.45	23%
TOTAL	48.49	10.65	100%

KINGDOM OF MOROCCO

EDUCATION PROJECT V

Project Implementation Performance

Evaluation Criteria	Rating	Comments
1. Adherence to implementation schedule	1	Project implementation fell behind schedule by nearly 7 years
2. Adherence to financing plan	3	Expenses remained well below estimates
3. Compliance with loan conditions/covenant	2	Conditions were met with difficulty and behind schedule
4. Adequacy of monitoring and reporting	2	Performance regarding monitoring and reporting was mixed on the whole
5. Implementation quality	1	Implementation was beset with numerous difficulties and constraints
Total	9	
Overall assessment of implementation performance	2	Performance unsatisfactory. Overall project encountered a serious of unfavourable factors attributable to the Borrower and the Bank

Bank Performance During Project Cycle

Evaluation Criteria	Rating	Comments
1. At identification	2	The project was identified by UNESCO in November 1993. It was in keeping with the Government's education sector policy and with the Bank Group's support strategy in Morocco for the 1994-1996 period which focused among other things on human resource development.
2. At preparation	2	The project was prepared by a Bank mission in January – February 1993.
3. At appraisal	2	The project was appraised by a Bank mission in July-August 1993. The operation was relevant but over-ambitious, covering all levels of the education system and all cross-cutting issues. This led to an overestimation of costs and long implementation periods and thus to frequent extensions of the closing date as well as to cancellations of loan balances. Three major components were not implemented.
4. At supervision	2	The Bank organized 12 supervision missions over the 12-year implementation period, in other words, an average of one mission a year. There was no mid-term project review.
Overall assessment of the Bank's performance	2	Performance unsatisfactory. The Bank was not able to take drastic measures to ensure that implementation schedules were adhered to.

KINGDOM OF MOROCCO
EDUCATION PROJECT V
Project Impact on Development

Evaluation Criteria	Rating	Remarks
1. Relevance and attainment of objectives (i) Macro-economic policy (ii) Sector policy (iii) Physical (including production) (iv) Financial policy (v) Poverty reduction/social/gender (vi) Environment (vii) Private sector development (viii) Other Sub-total	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 3 NA 15	The project was in keeping with the sector policy of the country and the Bank. The project contributed to the implementation of the education sector reform. The project objectives were relevant but they were only reached in part since three components were cancelled. Even though the project was down-sized, it nonetheless impacted socially: on poverty reduction, gender and the environment.
2. <u>Institutional Development</u> (i) Institutional framework including restructuring (ii) Financial information and management system (including the audit system) (iii) Technology transfer (iv) Human resources (including the mobility rate, training and counterpart staff) Sub-total	1 1 NA 2 4	Institutionally, the project financed an increase in the intake capacity of secondary schools and the institutional capacity to protect the environment of the schools.
3. <u>Sustainability</u> (i) Continued borrower commitment (ii) Environmental policy (iii) Institutional framework (iv) Technical viability and staff supervision (v) Financial viability including cost recovery systems (vi) Economic viability (vii) Environmental viability (viii) Operation and maintenance (availability of recurrent expenses) Sub-total	3 3 1 2 NA 2 3 1 15	The Borrower undertook to build the remaining 5 high schools. It also defrayed to recurrent expenses brought about by the project. Project outcomes have a sustainable impact on the development of the education system, the reduction of regional and gender imbalances regarding access to education, and on the environment.
4. Internal rate of return	NA	
Overall assessment of impact on development	2	The project had a positive impact on human resource development.

KINGDOM OF MOROCCO
EDUCATION PROJECT V
Matrix of Recommendations and Follow-up Actions

LESSONS	ACTION/RECOMMENDATIONS	RESPONSIBILITY
PROJECT FORMULATION		
The Bank's preliminary sector studies made possible a better vision of the challenges and constraints and consequently a better definition of the project operations.	In the formulation of future projects, the Bank must pay greater attention to the potential risks, conduct preliminary sector studies in order to have a comprehensive vision of the challenges and constraints.	ADB
PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION		
Project implementation was adversely affected by the abolition of the structure in charge of financed projects, leading to a fragmentation of management tasks by several departments under various ministries	Ensure the stability of the project implementation mechanism.	Government
Project implementation was also affected by poor coordination and steering.	Ensure the effective establishment of a project steering and coordination structure.	ADB / Government
The very many and complex administrative procedures at country and Bank level hindered project implementation and caused delays.	To the extent possible, use national procurement procedures. The Bank must adapt its demands to the realities of the countries and make better use of the services of its Office in Morocco for project implementation.	ADB
The project did not have a financial and accounting management system.	Require the establishment of a financial and accounting management system, and the training of project financial offices to use this system.	ADB
FULFILMENT OF CONDITIONS		
The conditions were fulfilled behind schedule because of frequent institutional changes, uncertainty over the implementation of all the initial project components and the high number of conditions.	The Government must endeavour to meet the project loan agreement conditions according to schedule.	Government
Works status reports were not sent regularly to the Bank	Ensure at project start-up training of members of the project team in project rules and procedures.	ADB
PERFORMANCE AND OUTCOMES		
Five (5) of the initially planned 26 high schools were not built, three project components were cancelled and large amounts of both loans were cancelled.	The Government must finance out of its budget, the construction of the remaining 5 high schools.	ADB / Government
The project's financial management was shared by several players which made it difficult and inefficient.	Responsibilities for project implementation as set out in the appraisal report must be complied with or in the event of justified changes, they must be the subject of consensual decisions between the Borrower and the Bank.	ADB / Government
The Government's performance was adversely affected by numerous institutional changes.	The Government must ensure that the project implementation mechanism is protected from frequent institutional changes.	Government
Bank missions were not regular and the response time for documents submitted by the project was long.	The Bank must comply strictly with its own requirements and standards in the area of project monitoring and make better use of its Office in Morocco to back implementation of projects.	ADB

SUSTAINABILITY		
<p>At the time of project appraisal in 1993, the Bank did not require the sustainability of outputs to be specifically included in the appraisal report. Some works were the subject of relevant criticisms but most of them were rescinded following corrections by the successful contractors.</p>	<p>In the formulation of future projects, identify systematically factors that can contribute to the sustainability of outcomes and strengthen them through project actions.</p>	<p>ADB</p>
<p>Some of the high school buildings have deteriorated because they have been subject to acts of vandalism by people living in the areas where they were built or by the pupils themselves.</p>	<p>Invite local authorities, parent-teacher associations, NGOs, the private sector to take part in the various phases of project preparation and implementation, so as to promote ownership of outcomes, and to contribute to sustainability.</p>	<p>ADB / Government</p>

**KINGDOM OF MOROCCO
EDUCATION PROJECT V****SOURCES OF INFORMATION**

- ADB. Appraisal Report of the EDUCATION PROJECT V, November 1993
- ADB. Memorandum of the President concerning the EDUCATION PROJECT V, 6 November 1993
- ADB. Aides mémoires of the Supervision missions and Supervision Reports of the EDUCATION PROJECT V (from 1996 to 2006)
- ADB. Evaluation of Bank Assistance to the Education Sector in Morocco. OPEV, January 2006.
- ADB. 2006-2010 Country Strategy Paper for Morocco. ONCB, September 2005
- ADB. Various project implementation documents (memos, fax, letters, minutes of meetings, back-to-office reports) from 1993 to 2006 and focusing on various aspects: goods and services procurements; disbursements; missions, etc.
- Government of Morocco. General Inspectorate of Finances. EDUCATION PROJECT V Audit Reports
- Government of Morocco. EDUCATION PROJECT V Completion Report, November 2006
- Government of Morocco. Strategy of Statistics and Planning Directorate School Statistics, 2000 – 2006.
- Government of Morocco. Education System Reform Support Project in Morocco – PARSEM, September 2004
- Government of Morocco. National Charter for Education and Training
- Government of Morocco Strategy, Statistics and Planning Directorate, Strategic Framework for Education System Development, April 2004.